



Declassified (*)

AS/Soc (2011) PV 03 add
16 May 2011
Asocpv03add_2011

Social, Health and Family Affairs Committee

Minutes

of the second meeting of the Network of Contact Parliamentarians to stop sexual violence against children held in Strasbourg on Wednesday 13 April 2011 from 2 to 3 pm

on the subject of “Fighting child pornography on the Internet”

The Chairperson of the Social, Health and Family Affairs Committee, **Ms Maury Pasquier**, pointed out that this 2nd meeting marked the beginning of a series of thematic meetings of the Network to stop sexual violence against children. She welcomed the first Contact parliamentarian appointed by a partner international organisation, Ms Henriette Martinez, representing the Parliamentary Assembly of “la Francophonie”.

With 37 Contact parliamentarians to date, she stressed the increasing involvement of national parliaments in the campaign, which had begun most auspiciously.

She highlighted the good practices which had recently been pinpointed under the campaign.

In particular, she noted the involvement of Ms Sosa Govea, the Mexican Contact parliamentarian, who had been working to promote the Council of Europe Convention on the Protection of Children against Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse (Lanzarote Convention). First of all, Ms Sosa Govea had supported the translation into Spanish of the Handbook for parliamentarians on the Lanzarote Convention. The Spanish version of the Handbook would shortly be downloadable from the website. Also, on 6 April last, Ms Sosa Govea had presented the Handbook at an official event in the Mexican Senate, in the presence of the Senate President. The Mexican Senate had created a website¹ on the campaign incorporating the campaign logo “One in Five” and making the Handbook available online.

The NGO HFC “Hope For Children” UNHCR Policy Centre, has launched the One in Five campaign in Cyprus under the auspices of Ms Athina Kyriakidou. The campaign encourages Cypriots to sign a petition inviting their authorities to ratify the Lanzarote Convention (which was signed by Cyprus on 25 October 2007).

According to Ms Elvira Kovács, the Serbian Parliament had launched a national campaign to fight sexual violence against children and to implement the Lanzarote Convention.

The Chairperson invited her colleagues to follow these good examples and to forward information on any new ones to the Secretariat, which would subsequently compile all the national activities and good practices.

* Declassified by the Committee on 19 May 2011.

¹ http://www.senado.gob.mx/hoy/violencia_sexual_ninos/index.htm.

Mr Conde Bajén, Committee Rapporteur on this theme and Contact parliamentarian for Spain, summarised the hearing in Paris on 22 March 2011 on Combating “child pornography” as part of the campaign to stop sexual violence against children, and set out his initial views on the matter.

According to Mr Conde Bajén, behind every pornographic image of a child there was a child victim and at least one person who had abused him or her.

The Committee’s aim was not to condemn the Internet out of hand, but rather to make practical proposals to help governments combat this scourge effectively. It hoped to propose a balanced report taking account of the possibility of choosing between “blocking” and eliminating websites offering “child pornography”.

The Chairperson welcomed Mr John Carr, whom some participants already knew because he had attended the launch Conference for the Council of Europe “One in Five” Campaign in Rome. She asked him to share his experience of combating “child pornography” on the Internet. This subject was particularly important in contemporary societies, with the risks posed, for instance, by social networks on the Internet. She urged her colleagues to continue to combat “child pornography”.

Mr Carr, an expert involved in the International Telegraph Union’s Child Online Protection initiative and member of the NGO European Alliance for Child Safety Online, described the scale of and growth in “child pornography” on the Internet, which had enabled increasing numbers of images to be circulated. He quoted the example of a Canadian who had been arrested in Mexico in possession of 4 million pornographic photographs of children. Internet guaranteed the permanence of the images. This in fact corresponded to billions of photos which were being uploaded and then downloaded. Each time an image was viewed, the child was victimised once again.

Everyone agreed that these images were harmful and that they should not be left on the web, and repression at source was by far the optimum solution. However, since not all countries prioritised action against this phenomenon, a possible solution was to “block” the images. Blocking access pending repression could help combat “child pornography”.

In the United Kingdom, for example, British Telecom had been the first to block such images, with 45 000 attempts at access blocked in 2009, which would correspond to blocking 58 million attempts per year at world level. **Mr Carr** deduced that image blocking could operate on a large scale at low costs.

Some people wrongly equated image blocking with infringement of freedom of expression. Although sites had sometimes been blocked by mistake, blocking was usually appropriate and consonant with democratic principles and the Council of Europe’s fundamental values. Independent monitoring would provide safeguards for anyone concerned about freedom of expression.

The images mainly came from countries in North America (42%), Europe – including Russia - (41%) and Asia (17%). South America and Australia were virtually exempted. Countries in the three aforementioned continents should therefore be prevailed upon to devote more money to deleting these images. The main countries involved were the United States and Russia.

In the United Kingdom, contentious images could be deleted within 60 minutes. In many case, however, even though the police had been informed, the images remained available on the web for a month or more.

Mr Carr noted that the European Union was discussing a draft Directive on combating the sexual abuse, sexual exploitation of children and child pornography including an article concerning “blocking” as a mandatory measure. He hoped that the EU would require a new clause in any commercial agreement with a third country geared to deleting all pornographic images of children.

The Chairperson regretted that many images remained for too long on the Internet, but welcomed the possibility of swift, effective action against them.

Ms Martinez, Contact parliamentarian for the Parliamentary Assembly of “*la Francophonie*”, went back to the origins of the problem: the abominable traffic in children, images sold by families or paedophile networks and the sale of children. The problem was what these children experienced and what had been done to them, in breach of their fundamental rights. She came down in favour of blocking these images, but also of combating this crime by tracking down and punishing the criminals.

As a frequent user of computer facilities, **Mr Marquet** denounced the pornographic images which popped up during an Internet search for a simple word like “Mickey”. This showed the need to educate Internet users and alert access providers to their responsibilities. Care also had to be taken with such new phenomena as the use of images of children being violent with each other on the Internet.

Mr Hancock noted that Google, for instance, was not required to clean up its web servers despite having the requisite financial and technical resources to do so. Access providers authorised this phenomenon because it generated profits. **Mr Hancock** seconded the Rapporteur’s hope that the report would have a high profile and a real impact.

Ms Roseira said that the parliamentarians were well aware of this problem, but were wondering what was hampering action given that it was technically possible and compatible with freedom of expression to block access. Children’s rights were primordial, as were parent’s duties towards their children. She stressed the importance of image blocking and the need to ascertain the origins of the crime. It was necessary to define the role of such operators as Google in prosecuting the criminals.

Mr Boswell mentioned the link with organised crime and trafficking in human beings.

Ms Andersen said that the most suitable expression here was “child abuse images”. Access providers had to take responsibility for the contents of their sites. She considered image blocking vital. She wondered about the possibility of a new Interpol-type international police unit. **Mr Carr** replied that he would be in favour of such a body, given that the international crime networks were involved solely for the profits. This measure could offset the laxity of some States.

Mr Conde Bajén thanked the expert and the participants. He suggested inviting Ms Najat M’jid Maalla, UN Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children, as high-level speaker at the debate on his report scheduled for the part-session in October 2011.

The Chairperson closed the discussion.

A photograph was taken of the Network at the end of the meeting.

List of presence/*Liste de présence*

The names of the members and alternates present at the meeting appear in bold
Les noms des membres et de leurs suppléants présents à la réunion sont indiqués en gras

Chairperson/ Présidente :		
Mme Liliane MAURY PASQUIER	Switzerland / Suisse	M. Arthur LOEPFE
Vice-Chairpersons/ Vice-Président(e)s		
Ms Pernille FRAHM	Denmark / Danemark	Ms Pia CHRISTMAS-MØLLER
M. Bernard MARQUET	Monaco	Mme Sophie LAVAGNA
Mr Pieter OMTZIGT	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	Mrs Wassila HACHCHI
Members / Membres		Alternates / Remplaçants
Mme Lajla PERNASKA	Albania / Albanie	ZZ ...
Mme Maria Pilar RIBA FONT	Andorra / Andorre	M. Joan CARTES IVERN
Mr Armen MELIKYAN	Armenia / Arménie	Mr Gagik BAGHDASARYAN
Mr Karl DONABAUER	Austria / Autriche	Mr Franz Eduard KÜHNEL
Ms Christine MUTTONEN	Austria / Autriche	Ms Sonja ABLINGER
Mrs Sevinj FATALIYEVA	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan	Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA
Mr Fazil MUSTAFA	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan	Mr Aydin ABBASOV
Mme Cindy FRANSSSEN	Belgium / Belgique	M. Philippe MAHOUX
M. Stefaan VERCAMER	Belgium / Belgique	M. Dirk Van der MAELEN
ZZ...	Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnie-Herzégovine	ZZ...
Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV	Bulgaria / Bulgarie	ZZ...
Ms Dzhema GROZDANOVA	Bulgaria / Bulgarie	Mr Yanaki STOILOV
Ms Karmela CAPARIN	Croatia / Croatie	Mr Mirando MRSIĆ
M. Fidas SARIKAS	Cyprus / Chypre	Ms Athina KYRIAKIDOU
Mme Daniela FILIPIOVÁ	Czech Republic / République tchèque	Mr Rom KOSTŘICA
Ms Kateřina KONEČNÁ	Czech Republic / République tchèque	Mr Pavel LEBEDA
Mr Indrek SAAR	Estonia / Estonie	Mr Silver MEIKAR
Ms Sirpa ASKO-SELJAVAARA	Finland / Finlande	Ms Tuulikki UKKOLA
M. Roland BLUM	France	M. Laurent BÉTEILLE
Mme Claude GREFF	France	Mme Muriel MARLAND-MILITELLO
M. Denis JACQUAT	France	Mme Françoise HOSTALIER
Mme Marietta KARAMANLI	France	M. Jean-Paul LECOQ
Ms Magdalena ANIKASHVILI	Georgia / Géorgie	Mr Rati SAMKURASHVILI
Ms Viola von CRAMON-TAUBADEL	Germany / Allemagne	Mr Manuel SARRAZIN
Mr Andrej HUNKO	Germany / Allemagne	Mr Thomas NORD
Ms Marlene RUPPRECHT	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Doris BARNETT
Mr Bernd SIEBERT	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Gitta CONNEMANN
Mr Konstantinos AIVALIOTIS	Greece / Grèce	Ms Charoula KEFALIDOU
Mr Michail KATRINIS	Greece / Grèce	Ms Sophia GIANNAKA
Mr Péter HOPPÁL	Hungary / Hongrie	Mrs Melinda SZÉKYNÉ SZTRÉMI
Ms Virág KAUFER	Hungary / Hongrie	Mr Gábor HARANGOZÓ
Mr Birkir Jón JÓNSSON	Iceland / Islande	Ms Eygló HARÐARDÓTTIR
Mr Peter KELLY	Ireland / Irlande	Ms Maureen O'SULLIVAN
Mr Mario BARBI	Italy / Italie	Mr Paolo GIARETTA
Mr Roberto Mario Sergio COMMERCIO	Italy / Italie	M. Giacomo STUCCHI
Mr Oreste TOFANI	Italy / Italie	Mr Giuseppe CIARRAPICO

Mr Luca VOLONTÈ	Italy / Italie	Mr Vannino CHITI
Ms Ingrida CIRCENE	Latvia / Lettonie	M. Andris BĒRZINŠ
Ms Doris FROMMELT	Liechtenstein	Mr Leander SCHÄDLER
Ms Arūnė STIRBLYTĖ	Lithuania / Lituanie	Ms Birutė VĖSAITĖ
M. Marc SPAUTZ	Luxembourg	M. Jean HUSS
Mr Francis AGIUS	Malta / Malte	Ms Marie-Louise COLEIRO PRECA
Mr Valeriu GHILETCHI	Moldova	ZZ...
Mr Obrad GOJKOVIĆ	Montenegro/ Monténégro	Ms Snežana JONICA
Mrs Khadija ARIB	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	Mrs Tineke STRIK
Ms Karin ANDERSEN	Norway / Norvège	Ms Ingjerd SCHOU
Ms Bożenna BUKIEWICZ	Poland / Pologne	M. Zbigniew GIRZYŃSKI
Mr Mariusz KAMIŃSKI	Poland / Pologne	Mr Maciej ORZECHOWSKI
Ms Anna SOBECKA	Poland / Pologne	Mr Ryszard BENDER
Mme Cecília HONÓRIO	Portugal	ZZ ...
ZZ...	Portugal	ZZ...
Mr Cristian DAVID	Romania / Roumanie	Ms Ana Adriana SĂFTOIU
M. Cezar Florin PREDA	Romania / Roumanie	M. Iosif Veniamin BLAGA
Mr Mihai TUDOSE	Romania / Roumanie	Mr Florin IORDACHE
Mr Igor CHERNYSHENKO	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Mr Valery PARFENOV
Mr Oleg LEBEDEV	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Mr Nikolay FEDOROV
Mr Valery SELEZNEV	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Ms Svetlana GORYACHEVA
Mr Vladimir ZHIDKIKH	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Ms Tatiana VOLOZHINSKAYA
M. Marco GATTI	San Marino / Saint-Marin	M. Pier Marino MULARONI
Mr Miloš ALIGRUDIĆ	Serbia / Serbie	Ms Nataša VUČKOVIĆ
Ms Vjerica RADETA	Serbia / Serbie	Mr Mladen GRUJIĆ
Mr Stanislav FORT	Slovak Republic	Mr Štefan ZELNÍK
Mr Ljubo GERMIČ	Slovenia / Slovénie	ZZ...
Ms Meritxell BATET LAMAÑA	Spain / Espagne	Mr Jordi XUCLÀ I COSTA
Mme Rosa Delia BLANCO TERÁN	Spain / Espagne	Ms Concepción GUTIÉRREZ DEL CASTILLO
Mr Agustín CONDE BAJÉN	Spain / Espagne	Mme Blanca FERNÁNDEZ-CAPEL BAÑOS
Ms Carina OHLSSON	Sweden / Suède	Mr Morgan JOHANSSON
Mr Mikael OSCARSSON	Sweden / Suède	Ms Marietta de POURBAIX-LUNDIN
M. Felix MÜRI	Switzerland	Ms Doris STUMP
Mr Zoran PETRESKI	« The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia »	Ms Flora KADRIU
Mr Lokman AYVA	Turkey / Turquie	Mr Yüksel ÖZDEN
Mr Haluk KOÇ	Turkey / Turquie	Ms Birgen KELEŞ
Mr Mustafa ÜNAL	Turkey / Turquie	Mr Ali Riza ALBOYUN
Ms Olena BONDARENKO	Ukraine	Mr Yevgeniy SUSLOV
Ms Olha HERASYM'YUK	Ukraine	Ms Oksana BILOZIR
Mr Victor YANUKOVYCH	Ukraine	M. Ivan POPESCU
Ms Ann COFFEY	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Lord Tim BOSWELL
Mr Jeffrey DONALDSON	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Mr Michael CONNARTY
Mr Paul FLYNN	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Mr Michael HANCOCK
Mr Sam GYIMAH	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Ms Yasmin QURESHI

Contact Parliamentarians / *Parlementaires de référence*

Name	Country
Arenca Trashani	Albania / <i>Albanie</i>
Maria Pilar Riba Font	Andorra / <i>Andorre</i>
Gisela Wurm	Austria / <i>Autriche</i>
Sevinj Fataliyeva	Azerbaijan / <i>Azerbaïdjan</i>
Cindy Franssen	Belgium / <i>Belgique</i>
Dirk Van der Maelen	Belgium / <i>Belgique</i>
Desislav Chukolov	Bulgaria / <i>Bulgarie</i>
Karmela Caparin	Croatia / <i>Croatie</i>
Athina Kyriakidou	Cyprus / <i>Chypre</i>
Daniela Filipiová	Czech Republic
Mogens Jensen	Denmark
Tuulikki Ukkola	Finland
Chiora Taktakishvili	Georgia
Marlene Rupprecht	Germany
Michail Katrinis	Greece
Mörður Árnason	Iceland
Fiamma Nirenstein	Italy
Arūnė Stirblytė	Lithuania
Marc Spautz	Luxembourg
Francis Agius	Malta
Martha Leticia Sosa Govea	Mexico
Bernard Marquet	Monaco
Pieter Omtzigt	Netherlands
Karin S. Woldseth	Norway
Dariusz Lipiński	Poland
Maria de Belém Roseira	Portugal
Cezar Florin Preda	Romania
Sorin-Constantin Lazăr	Romania
Elvira Kovács	Serbia
Tatiana Rosová	Slovak Republic
Zmago Jelinčič Plemeniti	Slovenia
Agustín Conde Bajén	Spain
Carina Ohlsson	Sweden
Doris Fiala	Switzerland
Viktor Shemchuk	Ukraine
Michael Connarty	United Kingdom

Name**Henriette Martinez****International Organisation**Parliamentary Assembly of
Francophonie (APF)

Also present / *Egalement présent*

Ms / *Mme* OSBORNE, United Kingdom / *Royaume-uni*

Special Guests / *Invités spéciaux*

Mr / *M.* John CARR, Senior expert adviser to the International Telecommunication Union, Child Online Protection Initiative (United Kingdom) / *Conseiller-expert principal à l'Initiative de Protection de l'Enfance en ligne de l'Union Internationale des Télécommunications (Royaume Uni)*

Mr / *M.* Jean-Marie HEYDT, President of the Conference of INGOs of the Council of Europe / *Président de la Conférence des OING du Conseil de l'Europe*

Delegation Secretaries / *Secrétaires de Délégation*

Ms / *Mme* KUCHARSKA-LESZCZYNSKA, Poland / *Pologne*

Ms / *Mme* LANGENHAECK, Belgium / *Belgique*

Ms / *Mme* MILHEIRIÇO, Portugal

Ms / *Mme* NURAHMADOVA, Azerbaijan / *Azerbaïdjan*

Ms / *Mme* ORTI, France

Ms / *Mme* ÖSTLUND, Sweden / *Suède*

Ms / *Mme* ŠUMSKIENĖ, Lithuania / *Lituanie*

Ms / *Mme* ŠKIBIN, Slovenia / *Slovénie*

Mr / *M.* TANASE, Romania / *Roumanie*

Permanent Representatives / *Représentants permanents*

Ms / *Mme* DJAMIĆ, Croatia / *Croatie*

Ms / *Mme* MARIN, Romania / *Roumanie*

Mr / *M.* MINTAS, Croatia / *Croatie*

Ms / *Mme* PAZUMKOVA, Ukraine

Ms / *Mme* RUDYK, Ukraine

Observer / *Observateur*

Ms / *Mme* LÓPEZ, Mexico / *Mexique*

Non Governmental Organisations (NGO) / *Organisations non-gouvernementales (ONG)*

Ms / *Mme* DONADIO, International Planned Parenthood Federation / *Fédération internationale pour le planning familial*

Mr / *M.* FIELDSEND, CARE for Europe / *CARE pour l'Europe*

Council of Europe / *Conseil de l'Europe*

Mr / *M.* HIBBARD, Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs / *Direction générale des droits de l'Homme et des affaires juridiques*

Ms / *Mme* HUNTING, Congress of Local and Regional Authorities / *Congrès des Pouvoirs Locaux et Régionaux*

Ms / *Mme* JENSDOTTIR, Head of Children's Rights Division / *Chef de la division des politiques des droits de l'enfant*

Ms / *Mme* LEVAMO, Children's Rights Division / *Dvision des politiques des droits de l'enfant*

Ms / *Mme* MANUZZI, Children's Rights Division / *Dvision des politiques des droits de l'enfant*

Ms / *Mme* SAMOKHINA, Children's Rights Division / *Dvision des politiques des droits de l'enfant*

Secretariat of the Assembly / *Secrétariat de l'Assemblée*

Ms / *Mme* BARGELLINI, Communication Division / *Division de la Communication*

Mr / *M.* LODDO, Committee on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men / *Commission sur l'égalité des chances pour les femmes et les hommes*

Social, Health and Family Affairs Committee / Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et de la famille

Ms / Mme KLEINSORGE, Head of the Secretariat / *Chef du Secrétariat*

Ms / Mme LAMBRECHT-FEIGL, Secretary to the Committee / *Secrétaire de la commission*

Ms / Mme GARABAGIU, Secretary to the Committee / *Secrétaire de la commission*

Ms / Mme DEVAUX, Project Manager "Parliaments united in combating sexual violence against children" / *Chargée de Projet « Les parlements unis pour combattre la violence sexuelle à l'égard des enfants »*

Ms / Mme BARTHEL, Principal Assistant / *Assistante principale*

Ms / Mme STEMP, Assistant / *Assistante*