



AS/Per (2014) PV 03

18 December 2014

Standing Committee

Minutes¹

**of the meeting held in Brussels (Belgium)
on 18 November 2014**

¹ Approved by the Assembly on 26 January 2015.

1. OPENING OF THE MEETING

The meeting opened at 9.30 am with **Ms Brasseur**, President of the Assembly, in the chair.

2. WELCOME ADDRESS BY Ms CHRISTINE DEFRAIGNE, SPEAKER OF THE BELGIAN SENATE

The Speaker of the Senate welcomed the participants in the Senate Chamber. This chamber, which from 1915 had been the seat of the German military tribunal, had, as evidenced by the commemorative plaques on display, witnessed several convictions for acts of courage. Belgium, one of the ten founding members of the Council of Europe, took seriously its responsibility in connection with its Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe. The Belgian parliamentary delegation, of which the Speaker had been a member between 2004 and 2007, had always shown a deep commitment to the work of the Council of Europe and its Assembly.

3. EXCHANGE OF VIEWS WITH Mr DIDIER REYNDERS, BELGIAN MINISTER FOR FOREIGN AND EUROPEAN AFFAIRS, CHAIRPERSON OF THE COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS

CM/Inf (2014) 25

CM/Inf (2014) 26

The President welcomed Mr Reynders who was chairing the Committee of Ministers at a difficult time for Europe when diplomacy, wisdom and a commitment to common values were essential for success. The Parliamentary Assembly supported and shared the priorities of the Belgian Chairmanship and welcomed the excellent co-operation between the Secretary General of the Council, the Belgian Chairmanship and the Parliamentary Assembly. Our common values were under threat and consequently the Council of Europe was more essential than ever to find a solution.

In addition, the Belgian Chairmanship had a major role to play in enhancing the synergy between the Council of Europe and other international institutions, in particular the European Union. Some of the other priorities of the Belgian Chairmanship – execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights and the protection of vulnerable people – lay at the heart of the Assembly's activities.

It was symbolic that the Belgian Chairmanship coincided with the centenary of the First World War: the country which one hundred years previously had found itself at the heart of the Great War was now chairing the organisation whose very *raison d'être* was to seek tangible peace and respectful dialogue based on common European values. In its endeavours to achieve its objectives, the Belgian Chairmanship would draw on the "No hate speech" campaign, as part of which a "No hate parliamentary alliance" would be launched in January 2015.

Lastly, she welcomed Mr Reynders' initiative to travel to Kyiv and Moscow in order to help find a solution to the conflict in Ukraine.

Mr Reynders stressed the importance of parliamentary democracy which underpinned the standards of the Council of Europe. These standards were not achieved once and for all and there were many challenges facing us in defending them, as evidenced by recent events in Europe. In view of a number of worrying developments, both within member states and in relations between them, it was essential to step up international co-operation, in which the Council of Europe and its Parliamentary Assembly had a key role to play. It was for this reason that the Belgian Chairmanship would give priority to implementing the Secretary General's recommendations set out in the report on the "Situation of Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law", and would focus particular attention on further reform of the Organisation.

Strengthening co-operation between organisations working in the same areas – the European Union, the OSCE and the OSCE/ODIHR – would be another of the Chairmanship's priorities. At the heart of its concerns was the crisis in Ukraine, a country in which serious failures to comply with fundamental and democratic principles had led the population to reject categorically the established order. The annexation of Crimea, the ongoing violence and the recent increase in the military presence in the east of Ukraine – despite the agreement reached between the parties – jeopardised the stability and security not only of Ukraine but also of the whole of Europe. He would be making a visit to Ukraine and Russia when the focus would be placed on the Council of Europe's efforts to foster the essential domestic reforms and to co-ordinate international initiatives in situ.

In addition, the Chairmanship would be lending its support to ensure the effectiveness of the European Convention on Human Rights system, the cornerstone of which was the right of individual petition. A high-level conference on implementation of the European Convention on Human Rights would be held in Brussels in March 2015. A conference on the best interests of the child and a seminar on the inclusion of young Roma in politics would help protect disadvantaged and vulnerable people.

As social rights were an integral part of human rights, Belgium would be hosting the 2nd European Youth Work Convention. The Belgian Chairmanship would also give its wholehearted support to the Council of Europe's "No Hate Speech" campaign and would join in the Parliamentary Assembly's initiative to commemorate the liberation of the Auschwitz-Birkenau concentration camp.

A conference on "Ensuring neutrality, impartiality and transparency in elections – the role of electoral management bodies" would be held in Brussels.

Ten years after the Warsaw Summit and the report by Jean-Claude Juncker, the Council of Europe member states needed to clearly spell out their vision of the future of the Council. A ministerial conference to be held in May 2015 would afford the opportunity to give practical shape to the idea of a new Council of Europe summit.

In response to the request made by **Mr Kox** to take further initiatives in connection with the problem of the deterioration of the human rights situation in Azerbaijan and the regrettable lack of action of the international institutions in the armed conflict in Ukraine, Mr Reynders stressed the need to continue to exert pressure on the national authorities in order to ensure compliance with the standards and decisions taken at Council of Europe level. It was a matter of extreme regret that the Azerbaijani civil activists had ended up in prison following their contacts with the Council of Europe. With regard to the situation in the east of Ukraine, the Council of Europe and its experts needed to support the implementation of the Minsk Protocol, particularly in relation to strengthening the institutional protection of minorities.

Mr Chope wondered about Russia's response to the Committee of Ministers' condemnation of the illegal annexation of Crimea and the deployment of Russian military troops on the territory of a sovereign state, and whether the Committee of Ministers might consider effective sanctions for Russia's blatant violation of the Organisation's Statute. Mr Reynders deplored the lack of progress on the situation in Crimea and the eastern regions of Ukraine. The Committee of Ministers reaffirmed its condemnation and was considering ways to increase the pressure. However, the European Union remained, at present, the most appropriate forum to decide on sanctions. The Parliamentary Assembly would be debating the matter at the opening of the 2015 session. The Council of Europe must continue the dialogue with the Ukrainian authorities on the new institutional framework which included Crimea.

The President thanked Mr Reynders and hoped that there would be more positive points to report on in the next exchange of views, scheduled to take place in January.

4. EXAMINATION OF NEW CREDENTIALS

Doc. 13643

The Standing Committee **ratified** the credentials of the new representatives and substitutes, as they appear in Doc.13643.

5. MODIFICATION IN THE COMPOSITION OF COMMITTEES

Commissions (2014) 08
Addendum 01

The Standing Committee **approved** the changes in the composition of the Assembly committees, as set out in document Commissions (2014) 08 and Addendum 01.

6. REQUEST FOR A CURRENT AFFAIRS DEBATE

The President informed the Bureau that no request for a current affairs debate had been tabled.

7. AGENDA

AS/Per (2014) OJ 03 rev.4

The revised draft agenda was **adopted**.

The President said that speaking time during the debates on the reports would be limited to three minutes.

8. FIRST PART-SESSION OF THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY (26-30 January 2015)

AS/Bur (2014) 61 rev.

In accordance with Rule 27.4 of the Assembly's Rules of Procedure, the Standing Committee **took note** of the draft agenda of the first part-session of 2015.

9. REFERENCES, TRANSMISSIONS AND MODIFICATIONS OF REFERENCES TO COMMITTEES

AS/Per (2014) 09

The Standing Committee **approved** the references and transmissions to committees, as they appear in Appendix II.

10. CURRENT AFFAIRS DEBATE (UNDER RULE 52 OF THE RULES OF PROCEDURE)

No request for a current affairs debate.

11. OBSERVATION OF ELECTIONS**a. Observation of the early parliamentary elections in Bulgaria (5 October 2014)**

Doc. 13642

*Rapporteur of the Ad hoc Committee of the Bureau:
Ms Doris Fiala (Switzerland, ALDE)*

The rapporteur noted with regret that the new elections had not solved the current political crisis. Despite the citizens' protests which had led to the early elections in 2013, the former governing party, GERB, led by Mr Boyko Borisov, had been declared the winner. However, he had been unable to form a government. A minority government led by the Socialist Party had been formed but had been dissolved shortly afterwards, following fresh protests and corruption scandals.

Consequently, the elections of 5 October and the election campaign that had preceded them had been characterised by voter fatigue and apathy. The lack of any concrete proposals to lead the country out of the crisis, mutual accusations of fraud and the climate of impunity had resulted in the lowest voter turnout since the collapse of the totalitarian regime. The performance of the Central Election Committee was to be commended even though it had been unable to prevent the problems relating to the use of the new preferential vote which had led to the invalidation of several thousand ballot papers. There had been reports of vote-buying and controlled voting. In general, the elections had not complied with European standards.

Following the elections, the number of political parties had doubled although no fresh momentum had emerged. Mr Boyko Borisov of the GERB party had eventually formed a minority government, but the new elections in July 2015 were already a subject of public debate. Despite the irresponsible conducts of the political forces, the Bulgarian people should be aware that failure to participate in the elections is equivalent to reduced control over political power.

Following a question from **Mr Chope** regarding the European Parliament observers, the rapporteur stressed the need to avoid double standards and by also maintaining a critical eye on the democratic process in the countries of the European Union.

The President agreed with this latter comment and reminded participants that members of the European Parliament had not taken part in this observation mission.

The rapporteur paid tribute to the long-term mission of the OSCE/ODIHR.

The President thanked the rapporteur and said that the report had been approved the previous day by the Bureau.

b. Observation of the general elections in Bosnia and Herzegovina (12 October 2014) Doc. 13640

Rapporteur of the Ad hoc Committee of the Bureau:
Mr Tiny Kox (Netherlands, UEL)

By way of introduction, **the rapporteur** expressed regret at the failure to execute the judgment of the European Court of Human Rights in the *Sejdić and Finci* case, a matter which could, moreover, compromise the country's accession to the European Union. The excellent co-operation between the international observers had resulted in a balanced evaluation of the electoral campaign and polling day. The report analysed the election process and made a number of recommendations. The electoral system was complex. In addition to elections for the Presidency, several seats in various assemblies had to be filled, which had complicated matters for voters and for the count. Overall, the electorate had trust in the Central Election Commission, despite the fact that it had not been perceived as being impervious to political pressure. The media landscape had been segmented and had not enabled voters to have a general overview of the political parties and their programmes. The failure to comply with Council of Europe standards in the field of election legislation and party financing was a matter of regret. There was widespread mistrust of democratic institutions, endangering stability and compromising the future of the country. The continuing failure to fulfil election promises could encourage people to express themselves through means other than via the ballot box, as had already been the case in other European countries. The presence of international observers had legitimised the very close results.

The President pointed out that the recommendations contained in the report focused on ways to improve the process so as to build trust, an essential precondition for the functioning of a democracy.

Mr Schennach said that one of the particular features of the electoral legislation was its complex administrative organisation. There was a disconnect between politicians and the rest of the population. Reform was essential in order to remedy the situation. The Council of Europe could help here.

The rapporteur was in favour of assistance from the Council of Europe. The citizens of the country and their constitution were the hostages of the consequences of the bloody war that the Council of Europe had been unable to prevent, hence its share of responsibility. It was the politicians' role to make progress on tough issues. It was extremely regrettable that politicians had, without realising it, become an elitist caste, thereby devaluing the democratic system.

The President said that assistance was all the more necessary given that Bosnia and Herzegovina would be chairing the Committee of Ministers with effect from May 2015. She thanked the rapporteur and said that the report had been approved the previous day by the Bureau.

c. Observation of the early parliamentary elections in Ukraine (26 October 2014) Doc. 13641

Rapporteur of the Ad hoc Committee of the Bureau:
Mr Christopher Chope (United Kingdom, EC)

Mr Chope picked up on the question of the people's trust in politics, a topical issue in Ukraine. Returning to the elections, it was surprising to see that the Secretary General of the Council of Europe had issued a statement on the results of the elections without referring to the Assembly observation mission and even before the conclusions of the Ad hoc Committee had been published. Of the 225 seats, 27 remained vacant: 15 for the Donetsk region, 10 for Crimea and two for the city of Sevastopol. The election and media campaigns had taken place in a competitive environment. New parties and new faces had entered parliament. In view of the large number of independent members and given the pre-electoral agreement between the parties, the internal arrangements of the new parliament were yet to be determined. There was the danger that certain members elected under the Opposition Bloc would be prevented from taking the oath. Certain details had attracted the Committee's attention: the outgoing parliament had met during the election campaign to vote on draft laws and the OSCE/ODIHR had reported irregularities in the transmission of results of the count. The Assembly observers had insisted on mentioning in their statement, despite opposition from the head of the European Parliament mission, that the President and the Prime Minister had taken unfair advantage of their positions to make televised appeals the day before polling day.

The President thanked the rapporteur and said that the report had been approved the previous day by the Bureau.

Mr Rouquet took the chair.

12. LEGAL AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Measures to prevent abusive use of the Convention on the Transfer of Sentenced Persons (ETS No. 112)

Doc. 13540

*Rapporteur of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights:
Mr Christopher Chope (United Kingdom, EC)*

The rapporteur said that the document looked at the legal points raised by the *Safarov* case, which had been referred to the Committee in 2012. In Budapest in 2004, a lieutenant in the Azerbaijani army attending a course sponsored by the North Atlantic Treaty Organisation (NATO) had killed with an axe an Armenian officer also attending the course, Gurgun Margayan, while the latter had been asleep. Mr Safarov had been sentenced to life imprisonment, with no possibility of release for 30 years. In 2012, he had been transferred to Azerbaijan under the provisions of the Convention on the Transfer of Sentenced Persons. Upon his arrival, he had been pardoned, released from custody and given an apartment and eight years' back pay. International reaction had condemned the glorification of such criminal conduct, since the aim of the Convention, ratified by 60 states, was to enable prisoners to serve their sentence in their home country and facilitate their reintegration into society. Since it had entered into force, hundreds of transfers had taken place. Although Article 12 of the Convention provided for the possibility of a pardon, the Azerbaijani authorities had not acted in good faith. Accordingly, in order to avoid the improper use of Article 12, the Assembly and the Committee of Ministers were being asked to reconfirm that the Convention was not intended to be used as a basis for the release of prisoners upon return to their home country. In addition, the states concerned were called upon to conclude ad hoc arrangements ensuring strict compliance with the principles of the Convention.

Mr Seyidov found it regrettable that the report did not explain the context of the *Safarov* case, namely the ongoing war between Azerbaijan and Armenia. Recently, 16 Azerbaijani citizens had been killed following shooting at the border. An Armenian military helicopter had violated Azerbaijan's territorial sovereignty and had been shot down. To date, Azerbaijan had more than one million displaced persons and part of its territory, from which Mr Safarov came, was occupied. Without challenging the description of the act committed by Mr Safarov, other examples could nonetheless be cited in this report, such as that of Mr Varoujan Garabedian, sentenced to life imprisonment in France for an act of terrorism, who had received a hero's welcome from the Armenian authorities following his release.

In the view of **Ms Naghdalyan** the aim of the report was not to reassess the facts ascribed to Mr Safarov but to prevent any future improper use of a convention, as had happened in the present case. The Azerbaijani military had shot down a helicopter which had been carrying out a training flight and which had therefore posed no threat. Such actions ran counter to the truce concluded in 1994 at the request of Azerbaijan.

Mr Clappison, speaking on behalf of the Committee, congratulated Mr Chope on his report and hoped that the Committee of Ministers would take action on the recommendation concerning the ad hoc arrangements.

Mr Walter did not wish to comment on the *Safarov* case in order to maintain the neutrality that was required in his capacity as rapporteur on the "Escalation of violence in Nagorno-Karabakh and other occupied territories in Azerbaijan". The draft recommendation put forward a constructive proposal which would enable the parties to this important convention to lay down certain conditions for transfers, thereby avoiding any future misuse.

The rapporteur thanked Ms Naghdalyan and Mr Seyidov, both members of the Group of European Conservatives and welcomed the possibility of continuing a constructive dialogue within the political group.

The draft resolution and draft recommendation **were adopted** [Resolution 2022 (2014) and Recommendation 2057 (2014)].

13. SOCIAL AFFAIRS, HEALTH AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT**a. Measuring and fostering the well-being of European citizens**

Doc. 13539

*Rapporteur of the Committee on Social Affairs and Sustainable Development:
The Earl of Dundee (United Kingdom, EC)*

The rapporteur referred to a past when the state and its development took precedence over the aspirations of citizens, but when well-being, though encouraged, was not a priority. Fortunately, in today's Europe, the promotion of well-being was not incompatible with other state considerations. Well-being was not an alternative but a complement to GDP and was not intended to replace it. GDP remained a useful economic measure which nonetheless failed to reflect individual and collective well-being. In particular, it did not sufficiently reflect social or environmental concerns, still less any results which might have been attained. It did not reflect informal work such as childcare or domestic and irregular employment, nor how the resources spent had improved living conditions. Many aspects of well-being were therefore overlooked and not recorded. But the fact was that personal and subjective considerations such as relations within and outside the family were important for human beings. These subjective aspects could nonetheless be reflected by objective indicators. The future was encouraging and the promotion of well-being should be on the agenda of states and international organisations.

Mr Mendes Bota underlined the lack of consideration given to citizens' aspirations to well-being and to indicators such as health and access to employment. And yet, if we wished to reduce the gap between politicians and the population and come up with viable policies, it was essential to make much more use of those indicators. As a complement to GDP, which was of limited use for measuring well-being, a Better Life index had been put in place by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). Its use should be encouraged also in OECD non-member states in addition to the Council of Europe's action. National initiatives to measure the various social and environmental rights and long-term solutions should also be developed with the support of national parliaments.

The rapporteur acknowledged that there were many gaps to be bridged between the various expectations of the population. National audits were welcome provided that good methodologies were devised. Further action was needed at three levels: at the level of international organisations, states and in towns and cities so as to ensure educational, economic and cultural synergy, always keeping citizen well-being as the ultimate objective.

The draft resolution **was adopted** unanimously [Resolution 2023 (2014)].

b. Social exclusion – a danger for Europe's democracies

Doc. 13636

*Rapporteur of the Committee on Social Affairs and Sustainable Development:
Mr Mike Hancock (United Kingdom, ALDE)*

In the absence of the rapporteur, the report was presented by Mr Mendes Bota, the Committee's second vice-chair.

Mr Mendes Bota said that social exclusion, a growing and serious danger for Europe's democracies, was the exclusion of certain people from participating fully in democratic and civil life, due to poverty, lack of basic competencies and learning opportunities, or as a result of discrimination. Social exclusion had been exacerbated by the impact of the financial crisis and austerity measures, leading to rising unemployment, decreasing social benefits and difficulties in accessing housing, education and health services. There was a danger that the strong correlation between social exclusion and low levels of democratic participation could call into question the legitimacy of democratic institutions, for example through low electoral turn-out or the rise of extremist parties. Political participation was already decreasing among young people, women and minorities, and the gap between the poor and the rich was widening. The State should help to break "cycles of disadvantage" by helping the very poorest, improving access to education and training, and guaranteeing a minimum family income. There should be targeted measures for groups in need of special protection. In order to promote social and civil rights, the Council of Europe had an instrument such as the revised Social Charter, to which a larger number of states were invited to accede.

The draft resolution and draft recommendation **were adopted** unanimously [Resolution 2024 (2014) and Recommendation 2058 (2014)].

14. MIGRATION, REFUGEES AND DISPLACED PERSONS
a. Resettlement of refugees: promoting greater solidarity

Doc. 13460
 Amendments

Rapporteur of the Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons:
 Mr Eric Voruz (Switzerland, SOC)

The rapporteur said that several visits and studies had served as a basis for the present report which sought to highlight the positive aspects. However, this had proved difficult in the current context of tension and a rise of populist parties, in which asylum and immigration-related situations required a great deal of courage. Fortunately, the Council of Europe and its Assembly continue to militate for human rights, even though certain quarters in Switzerland were calling for the country to leave the organisation and no longer be subject to the authority of the European Court of Human Rights. The report called for greater solidarity among European states to share the responsibility with Malta, Italy and also Sweden, all of which were under considerable strain.

Mr Nicoletti welcomed the text which went in the right direction. Greater solidarity needed to be shown to address what was a dramatic situation. The current mechanism within the European Union was too rigid and should be reviewed, in consultation with the Council of Europe and its Assembly, in order to move towards the principle of mutual recognition, as advocated moreover by the Stockholm programme.

The President thanked the rapporteur and called on participants to bring the conclusions of the report to the attention of national parliaments.

Mr Rouquet, speaking on behalf of the Committee, expressed regret that such an important debate had not been held in plenary session.

The Committee presented the amendments, which had been unanimously adopted, to which there were no objections.

The draft resolution and the draft recommendation, as amended, **were adopted** unanimously [Resolution 2025 (2014) and Recommendation 2059 (2014)].

b. Alternatives to Europe's substandard IDP and refugee collective centres

Doc. 13507
 Amendment

Rapporteur of the Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons:
 Mr René Rouquet (France, SOC)

The rapporteur found it regrettable that the question of internally displaced persons was still a topical issue, particularly in the light of recent events in Ukraine. The living and housing conditions of IDPs and refugees were often incompatible with appropriate public health and safety standards. Several collective centres, set up in the 1990s following the conflict in the Balkans and the Caucasus, continued to house many families despite their deplorable accommodation conditions. The report described alternative solutions, including housing assistance, the construction of new housing, the allocation of abandoned or social housing, and the renovation and privatisation of collective centres. With regard to the current situation in Ukraine, there were IDPs from Crimea and the eastern regions. The vast majority were housed by families or friends and around 20,000 lived in collective centres. The priority was to ensure that accommodation conditions did not worsen as winter approached.

The draft resolution **was adopted** unanimously [Resolution 2026 (2014)].

15. EQUALITY AND NON-DISCRIMINATION
Focusing on the perpetrators to prevent violence against women

Doc. 13634

Rapporteur of the Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination:
 Ms Athina Kyriakidou (Cyprus, SOC)

The rapporteur commended the efforts of the Committee to promote ratification of the Istanbul Convention. However, changes in legislation would not be totally effective unless there was an accompanying change of attitude among the perpetrators of domestic violence and of sexual assaults, which was the aim of the

programmes advocated in Article 16 of the Istanbul Convention. These programmes included group therapy and individual therapy, the latter enabling the perpetrators of violence to rethink their attitude. To be effective, programmes should be part of a broader approach comprising support measures, and the intended recipients should develop awareness of their responsibility. While the short-term success of these programmes was undeniable, it had not yet been possible to carry out a long-term assessment. The report mentioned certain successful practices such as the possibility of combining treatment with subsequent supervision. States were urged to maintain the funding of these programmes despite the current budgetary context, as it had been shown that these led to long-term cost savings.

Mr Mendes Bota found it regrettable that states displayed little commitment to promoting treatment and awareness-raising programmes. Almost all victims who had died as a result of domestic violence had been the subject of victim reports in hospitals or the police.

Mr Gunnarsson, speaking on behalf of the Committee, welcomed the report which addressed a pan-European problem, whose solution also required greater involvement of men in the discussion.

Mr Gardarsson said that the following week a draft law on domestic violence would be tabled in the Icelandic parliament.

The rapporteur stressed the importance of not only treatment and assistance programmes, but also preventive measures. She hoped she would soon be able to announce the ratification by Cyprus of the Istanbul Convention.

The draft resolution **was adopted** unanimously [Resolution 2027 (2014)].

16. OTHER BUSINESS

None.

17. NEXT MEETING

The Standing Committee **decided** to hold its next meeting in Paris on 6 March 2015.

The meeting **rose** at 1 pm.

APPENDIX I

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

President of the Parliamentary Assembly / Présidente de l'Assemblée parlementaire

Mme Anne BRASSEUR Luxembourg

Chairpersons of Political Groups / Président(e)s des groupes politiques

Mr Andreas GROSS Socialist Group / Groupe socialiste

M. Pedro AGRAMUNT Group of the European People's Party /
Groupe du Parti populaire européen

Mr Christopher CHOPE European Conservatives Group /
Groupe des conservateurs européens

Mr Jordi XUCLÀ Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe /
Alliance des démocrates et des libéraux pour l'Europe

Mr Tiny KOX Group of the Unified European Left /
Groupe pour la gauche unitaire européenne

Vice-Presidents of the Assembly / Vice-président(e)s de l'Assemblée

M. Philippe MAHOUX Belgique

Mr Gvozden Srećko FLEGO Croatia

M. René ROUQUET France

Mr Robert WALTER United Kingdom

Mme Doris FIALA Suisse

Mr Reha DENEMEÇ Turkey

Mr Samad SEYIDOV Azerbaijan

Mr Axel E. FISCHER Germany

Mr Michele NICOLETTI Italy

Chairpersons of National Delegations / Président(e)s de délégations nationales

Ms Hermine NAGHDALYAN Armenia

Mr Samad SEYIDOV Azerbaijan

Mr Henrik DAEMS Belgium

Mr Saša MAGAZINOVIĆ Bosnia & Herzegovina

Mr Gvozden Srećko FLEGO Croatia

Ms Athina KYRIAKIDOU Cyprus

Mr Jacob LUND Denmark

Mr Margus HANSON Estonia

Ms Maria GUZENINA Finland

M. René ROUQUET France

Mr Tedo JAPARIDZE Georgia

Mr Axel E. FISCHER Germany

Mr Konstantinos TRIANTAFYLLOS Greece

Mr Karl GARÐARSSON Iceland

Mr Michele NICOLETTI Italy

Ms Birutė VĖSAITĖ Lithuania

M. Marc SPAUTZ Luxembourg

Mr Joseph DEBONO GRECH Malta

Ms Ingjerd SCHOU Norway

Ms Aleksandra DJUROVIĆ Serbia

Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON Sweden

Mme Doris FIALA Suisse

Mr Reha DENEMEÇ Turkey

Mr Robert WALTER United Kingdom

**Chairperson of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights /
Président(e) de la Commission des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme**
Mr James CLAPPISON United Kingdom

**Chairperson of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development /
Président(e) de la Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable**
Mr José MENDES BOTA (in the absence of Portugal
the Chairperson / *en l'absence de la*
Présidente)

**Chairperson of the Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons /
Président(e) de la Commission des migrations, des réfugiés et des personnes déplacées**
M. René ROUQUET (in the absence of France
Chairperson / *en l'absence du Président*)

**Chairperson of the Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination /
Président(e) de la Commission sur l'égalité et la non-discrimination**
Mr Jonas GUNNARSSON (in the absence of Sweden
the Chairperson / *en l'absence de la*
Présidente)

**Chairperson of Committee on the Honouring of Obligations and Commitments by Member States of the
Council of Europe (Monitoring Committee) / Président(e) de la Commission pour le respect des
obligations et engagements des Etats membres du Conseil de l'Europe (Commission de suivi)**
Mr Stefan SCHENNACH Austria

**Chairperson of the Committee on Rules of Procedure, Immunities and Institutional Affairs / Président(e)
de la Commission du Règlement, des immunités et des affaires institutionnelles**
Ms Nataša VUČKOVIĆ Serbia

Rapporteurs (not members of the Standing Committee / non-membres de la Commission permanente)
M. Eric VORUZ Suisse
The Earl of DUNDEE United Kingdom

Members of the Parliamentary Assembly / Membres de l'Assemblée parlementaire
M. Alain DESTEXHE Belgique
M. Stefaan VERCAMER Belgique
Ms Petra De SUTTER Belgium

Invited personalities / Personalités invitées
Mme Christine DEFRAIGNE Speaker of the Senate / Présidente du Sénat
M. Didier REYNDERS Minister for Foreign Affairs of Belgium, Chairperson of the
Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe / Ministre des
Affaires étrangères de la Belgique, Président du Comité des
Ministres du Conseil de l'Europe

Delegation Secretaries / Secrétaires des délégations
Ms Sonja LANGENHAECK Belgium
Ms Martina PETEK-STUPAR Croatia
Ms Gabriella MARANGOU-D'AVERNAS Cyprus
Ms Tanja ESPE Estonia
Ms Gunilla CARLANDER Finland
M. Xavier PINON France
Mr Michael HILGER Germany
Ms Aikaterini KARTSAKLI Greece
Ms Judit GOTTSCHALL Hungary
Ms Vilborg Ása GUÐJÓNSDÓTTIR Iceland

Mr Federico CASELLI	Italy
Mr Martins OLEKŠS	Latvia
Mr Bas NIEUWENWUIZEN	Netherlands
Mr Eric CHRISTENSEN	Norway
Mr Vladimir FILIPOVIĆ	Serbia
Ms Ann-Sofi LINDENBAUM	Sweden
Mr Nicholas WRIGHT	United Kingdom

Secretaries of Political Groups / Secrétaires des Groupes politiques

Mms Francesca ARBOGAST	SOC
Ms Denise O'HARA	EPP/CD / PPE/DC
Ms Maria BIGDAY	ALDE / ADLE
Mr Tom VAN DIJCK	EC / CE
Ms Natalia KUZNETSOVA	EC / CE
Ms Anna KOLOTOVA	UEL / GUE

Secretariat of the Parliamentary Assembly / Secrétariat de l'Assemblée Parlementaire

Mr Wojciech SAWICKI	Secretary General / Secrétaire Général
Mr Mário MARTINS	Director General / Directeur Général
Mme Kateryna GAYEVSKA	Secretary of the Standing Committee / Secrétaire de la Commission permanente
Mr Mark NEVILLE	Head of the Private Office / Chef du Cabinet
M. Alfred SIXTO	Head of the Table Office / Chef du Service de la Séance
Ms Sonia SIRTORI	Head of the Secretariat of the Bureau / Chef du Secrétariat du Bureau
Ms Micaela CATALANO	Head of the Communication Division / Chef de la Division de la Communication
Ms Sally-Ann HONEYMAN	Administrative Assistant, Table Office / Assistante administrative du Service de la séance
Mme Naouelle TEFIFEHA	Assistant of the Bureau / Assistante du Bureau
Mr Martin McMILLAN	Assistant of the Standing Committee / Assistant de la Commission permanente

Council of Europe / Conseil de l'Europe

Mme Mireille PAULUS	Secretary of the Committee of Ministers / Secrétaire du Comité des Ministres
---------------------	---

Other participants / Autres participants

M. Hugo HONDEQUIN	Secretary General of the Senate / Secrétaire Général du Sénat
M. Roland ROBLAIN	Director General of the Senate / Directeur Général du Sénat
Mme Hatice VICIL	Attachée, Protocol Service of the Senate / Attachée au Service du Protocole du Sénat
M. Nicola SPORANZA	Policy Officer, Federation of Catholic Family Associations in Europe / Chargé politique, Fédération des Associations Familiales Catholiques en Europe

APPENDIX II

Decisions on documents tabled for references to committees

1. **Promoting Regional or Minority Languages in Central and Eastern Europe**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Fabritius and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 13613](#)

Reference to the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media *for report*.

2. **Strengthening the rule of law in South-East European countries through targeted reform of the legal system**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Fabritius and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 13614](#)

Reference to the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights *for report*.

3. **Obesity in Europe and expressing sugar in teaspoonfuls on packaging**
Motion for a recommendation tabled by Mr G. Davies and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 13616](#)

Transmission to the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development *for information*.

4. **Radicalism in Europe**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Ms Hovhannisyan and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 13617](#)

Transmission to the Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy *for information*.

5. **The protection of independent experts co-operating with the Council of Europe**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Omtzigt and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 13619](#)

Reference to the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights *to be taken into account in the preparation of the report on "Strengthening the protection and role of human rights defenders in Council of Europe member States" (Ref. 3885)*

6. **Effective representation and participation in the Parliamentary Assembly of opposition parliamentarians in the member States**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Kox and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 13620](#)

Reference to the Committee on Rules of Procedure, Immunities and Institutional Affairs *for report*.

7. **Parliamentary immunity: challenges to the scope of the privileges and immunities enjoyed by members of the Parliamentary Assembly**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Ms Palihovici and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 13621](#)

Reference to the Committee on Rules of Procedure, Immunities and Institutional Affairs *for report*.