



Parliamentary Assembly
Assemblée parlementaire

<http://assembly.coe.int>

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

AS/Per (2020) PV 03
13 May 2020

Standing Committee

Minutes

**of the meeting held by videoconference
on 7 May 2020**

1. OPENING OF THE MEETING

Mr Rik Daems, President of the Assembly, opened the meeting at 12 noon.

2. AGENDA

AS/Per (2020) OJ 04 rev

The revised draft agenda was **adopted**.

3. CHANGES IN THE MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES

Commissions (2020) 05

The Standing Committee **ratified** the change in the membership of the Committee on the Honouring of Obligations and Commitments by Member States of the Council of Europe (Monitoring Committee), as set out in document Commissions (2020) 05.

4. REFERENCES TO COMMITTEES

AS/Per (2020) 04 parts 1 and 2

The President referred to document AS/Per (2020) 04 part 1, which contained all the decisions taken by the Bureau at its morning meeting on the action to be taken on the motions for resolutions that had been tabled.

The Secretary General of the Parliamentary Assembly said that, in accordance with the guidelines for consideration of motions for resolutions and recommendations, if a decision taken by the Bureau was successfully challenged in the Assembly or in the Standing Committee, the motion concerned would be referred back to the Bureau for reconsideration. If not, it would be ratified.

Mr Nemeth expressed surprise at the decision to take no further action on the motion for a resolution on “Re-establishing sustainable living conditions for autochthonous communities in balance with their natural environments in member states” (Doc. 15072 – item 7) as it highlighted the dangers faced by autochthonous communities relating to damage to the natural environment. The Bureau should reconsider its decision.

Mr Maniero asked the Bureau to reconsider its decision on the motion for a resolution on “Artificial intelligence and climate change” (Doc. 15068 – item 3). The motion should be referred to the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development for report and not simply forwarded for information, as it was a highly topical and fundamental issue that deserved to be dealt with in depth.

The President said that there were seven reports on artificial intelligence currently being drafted in committees and that the Bureau had taken the view that the existing referrals already covered the full range of the problem.

Ms Stienen emphasised the need to interpret as broadly as possible the scope of the future report on “Women’s rights must withstand the COVID-19 crisis” (item 18), with due regard for the terms of reference of the Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination.

Mr Tolstoi asked for the decision on the motion for a resolution on the “Impact of armed conflicts on transboundary environmental damage” (Doc. 15074 – item 9) to be postponed as this was not an urgent issue. **Ms Yashko** formally objected to this and said that on the contrary, this motion raised a fundamental problem which should be dealt with without delay.

Ms Trisse commented that the list of references was rather extensive and wondered whether the committees would have time to deal with them and produce reports within the deadlines laid down. Priority should be given above all to the most urgent issues.

The President proposed ratifying en bloc the decisions to refer for report, to transmit for information or to take no further action, with the exception of the decisions on items 3, 7 and 9, which would be put to the vote. Members were asked to vote using the “messaging” button and to vote “yes” if they wished to refer the decision back to the Bureau, “no” if they ratified the Bureau’s decision, or to state that they were abstaining.

This was **agreed**.

Following a vote, the Standing Committee **decided** not to ratify the decision on the motion for a resolution on “Artificial intelligence and climate change” and to refer it back to the Bureau of the Assembly (item 3) (by 13 votes in favour of referral back to the Bureau, 13 votes against and 5 abstentions, with the President giving his casting vote in favour).

Following a vote, the Standing Committee **decided** to ratify the decision on the motion for a resolution on “Re-establishing sustainable living conditions for autochthonous communities in balance with their natural environments in member states” (item 7) (by 13 votes against the referral back to the Bureau, 11 votes in favour and 6 abstentions).

Following statements by **Ms Yashko**, **Mr Seyidov**, who supported the Bureau’s decision to refer the proposal to the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development for report in view of the importance of the issue, stressing that this was not a political issue, and **Mr Vardanyan** who said that this issue had legal implications and required consensus, and therefore proposed that the decision be referred back to the Bureau, the Standing Committee **decided** to ratify the decision on the motion for a resolution on the “Impact of armed conflicts on transboundary environmental damage” (item 9) (by 21 votes against the referral back to the Bureau, with 3 votes in favour and 5 abstentions).

Following a statement by **Mr Vardanyan**, who asked that the latter report be referred to the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights for opinion, **the President** said that once Bureau decisions had been ratified by the Standing Committee, they could no longer be changed and were final. In addition, the decision taken by the Bureau at its meeting on 30 April 2020 to extend by six months the validity of all current references to committees would also apply to the references ratified at the present meeting.

5. OTHER BUSINESS

Ms Yashko expressed her keen interest in the President’s initiative, #PACEVoices, and encouraged members to share their ideas, experiences and reactions.

Ms Stienen referred to the online discussion held on 5 May by the Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination on violence against women during lockdown and urging governments to apply the Istanbul Convention, which had been a success. This example of a carefully prepared remote hearing, with informative content, made for very insightful exchanges and could be an example to follow by other committees.

Sir Roger Gale wished to thank the secretariat for the perfect organisation of the day’s meetings; **Mr Pocij** also congratulated the President on his chairing of the meetings.

6. NEXT MEETING

The Standing Committee **decided** to hold its next meeting by videoconference on 26 June 2020.

The meeting **rose** at 12.50 pm.

APPENDIX I

Decisions on documents tabled for references to committees

1. **Widespread recurring violence against security, fire and medical services on New Year's Eve: how to restore trust and the rule of law**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Sir Roger Gale and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15066](#)

No further action

2. **Enhancing participation of women from vulnerable groups in political and public decision-making**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Ms Maryna Bardina and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15067](#)

Reference to the Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination *for report*

3. **Gender mainstreaming of migration policies**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Ms Rósa Björk Brynjólfsdóttir and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15069](#)

Reference to the Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons *for report*

4. **Employment of disabled people in Europe**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Antonio Gutiérrez and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15070](#)

No further action

5. **Prevention of abuse of mutual legal co-operation with respect to refugees and asylum seekers**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Emanuelis Zingeris and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15071](#)

Transmission to the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights *for information*

6. **Re-establishing sustainable living conditions for autochthonous communities in balance with their natural environments in member States**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Barna Pál Zsigmond and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15072](#)

No further action

7. **The Parliamentary Assembly's role in developing a systematic approach to cope with global epidemic outbreaks**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Ms Emine Nur Günay and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15073](#)

No further action

8. **Impact of armed conflicts on transboundary environmental damage**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Ms Lesia Vasylenko and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15074](#)

Reference to the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development *for report*

- 9. For an assessment of the means and provisions to combat children's exposure to pornographic content**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Dimitri Houbbron and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15077](#)

Reference to the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development *for report* and to the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media *for opinion*

- 10. Food ethics in Europe: a citizen's issue that concerns all of us**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Sylvain Waserman and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15078](#)

No further action

- 11. Introducing sustainable management practices in forests of the continental biogeographical region**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Ms Yuliia Ovchynnykova and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15079](#)

Transmission to the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development *for information*

- 12. How to move forward to make businesses more responsible for human rights abuses?**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Boriss Cilevičs and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15080](#)

Transmission to the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights *for information*

- 13. The crackdown on human rights defenders and NGOs in the field of refugee rescue, support and integration**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Mr Michel Brandt and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15081](#)

No further action

- 14. Voluntary relocation for migrants in need of humanitarian protection**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Lord Alexander Dundee and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15082](#)

Reference to the Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons *for report*

- 15. COVID-19 – an effective and human rights-compliant response**
Motion for a resolution tabled by Ms Jennifer De Temmerman and other members of the Assembly
[Doc. 15094](#)

Reference to the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development *for report* with the title: "Lessons for future public health emergencies from an effective and rights-based response to the COVID-19 pandemic".

- 16. Democracies facing the COVID-19 pandemic**
Bureau decision

Reference to the Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy *for report*

- 17. Women's rights must withstand the COVID-19 crisis**
Bureau decision

Reference to the Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination *for report*

18. The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on human rights and the rule of law
Bureau decision

Reference to the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights *for report* and to the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media *for opinion*

19. Humanitarian consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic for migrants and refugees
Bureau decision

Reference to the Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons *for report*

APPENDIX II

List of participants / Liste des participants

President of the Parliamentary Assembly / Président de l'Assemblée parlementaire

Mr Rik DAEMS Belgium / Belgique

Chairpersons of Political Groups / Présidents des groupes politiques

Mr Frank SCHWABE Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group (SOC) /
Groupe des socialistes, démocrates et verts (SOC)

Mr Aleksander POCIEJ Group of the European People's Party (EPP/CD) /
Groupe du Parti populaire européen (PPE/DC)

M. Jacques MAIRE Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe (ALDE) /
Alliance des démocrates et des libéraux pour l'Europe (ADLE)

Mr Tiny KOX Group of the Unified European Left (UEL) /
Groupe pour la gauche unitaire européenne (GUE)

Vice-Presidents of the Assembly / Vice-président-e-s de l'Assemblée

Sir Roger GALE United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni

Mr Kimmo KILJUNEN Finland / Finlande

Mr Egidijus VAREIKIS Lithuania / Lituanie

Mr Antonio GUTIÉRREZ Spain / Espagne

Mme Nicole TRISSE France

Mr Andreas NICK Germany / Allemagne

M. Petr TOLSTOI Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie

Mr Oleksandr MEREZHKO Ukraine

Mr Akif Çağatay KILIÇ Turkey / Turquie

Ms Inese LIBINA-EGNERE Latvia / Lettonie

Mr Irakli KOBAKHIDZE Georgia / Géorgie

Mr Alvis MANIERO Italy / Italie

Chairpersons of National Delegations / Président-e-s de délégations nationales

Mr Vladimir VARDANYAN Armenia / Arménie
(in the absence of the Chairperson /
en l'absence du Président)

Mr Reinhold LOPATKA Austria / Autriche

Mr Samad SEYIDOV Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan

Mr Rik DAEMS Belgium / Belgique

Mr Ivo Davor STIER Croatia / Croatie
(in the absence of the Chairperson /
en l'absence du Président)

Mr Kimmo KILJUNEN Finland / Finlande

Mme Nicole TRISSE France

Mr Irakli KOBAKHIDZE Georgia / Géorgie

Mr Andreas NICK Germany / Allemagne

Ms Theodora BAKOYANNIS Greece / Grèce

Mr Zsolt NEMETH Hungary / Hongrie

Ms Rósa Björk BRYNJÓLFSDÓTTIR Iceland / Islande

Mr Joseph O'REILLY Ireland / Irlande

Mr Alvis MANIERO Italy / Italie

Ms Inese LIBINA-EGNERE Latvia / Lettonie

Ms Petra STIENEN Netherlands / Pays-Bas

Mr Zbigniew RAU Poland / Pologne

Mr Titus CORLATEAN Romania / Roumanie
(in the absence of the Chairperson /
en l'absence du Président)

M. Petr TOLSTOI Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie

Mr Antonio GUTIÉRREZ	Spain / Espagne
Ms Yelyzaveta YASKO	Ukraine
Sir Roger GALE	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni

**Chairperson of the Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy /
Présidente de la Commission des questions politiques et de la démocratie**
Dame Cheryl GILLAN United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni

**Chairperson of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights /
Présidente de la Commission des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme**
Mr Boriss CILEVIČS Latvia / Lettonie

**Chairperson of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development /
Président de la Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable**
M. Luis LEITE RAMOS Portugal

**Chairperson of the Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons /
Président de la commission des migrations, des réfugiés et des personnes déplacées**
M. Pierre-Alain FRIDEZ Switzerland / Suisse

**Chairperson of the Committee on Equality and Non Discrimination /
Président de la Commission sur l'égalité et la non-discrimination**
Ms Petra BAYR Austria / Autriche

**Committee on Rules of Procedure, Immunities and Institutional Affairs /
Commission du Règlement, des immunités et des affaires institutionnelles**
Ms Ingrid SCHOU Norway / Norvège

Secretaries of National Delegations / Secrétaires de délégations nationales

Ms Nadine DRAGAN	Austria / Autriche
Mr Georg MAGERL	Austria / Autriche
Ms Lala BABAYEV	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan
Mr Emin MAMMADOV	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan
Ms Sonja LANGENHAECK	Belgium / Belgique
Mr Tom de PELSMAEKER	Belgium / Belgique
Ms Adisa FIŠIĆ-BARUKČIJA	Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnie-Herzégovine
Ms Maria YANEVA	Bulgaria / Bulgarie
Ms Martina PETEK-STUPAR	Croatia / Croatie
Ms Gabriella MARANGOU D'AVERNAS	Cyprus / Chypre
Ms Gunilla CARLANDER	Finland / Finlande
Ms Maria FAGERHOLM	Finland / Finlande
Mme Claire MOISSET	France
M. Laurent SAUNIER	France
Mr Michael HILGER	Germany / Allemagne
Ms Voula SYRIGOS	Greece / Grèce
Ms Judit GOTSCHALL	Hungary / Hongrie
Ms Bylgja ÁRNADÓTTIR	Iceland / Islande
Ms Eileen LAWLOR	Ireland / Irlande
Ms Fabrizi BIENTINESI	Italy / Italie
Mr Martins OLEKSS	Latvia / Lettonie
Ms Sandra GERBER-LEUENBERGER	Liechtenstein
Ms Selija LEVIN	Lithuania / Lituanie
M. Yves CARL	Luxembourg
Ms Femmy BAKKER-DE JONG	Netherlands / Pays-Bas
Mr Arjen WESTERHOFF	Netherlands / Pays-Bas
Mr Artur ZANIEWSKI	Poland / Pologne

Ms Carmen IONESCU	Romania / Roumanie
Mr Razvan TANASE	Romania / Roumanie
Ms Maria Teresa GOMEZ-BERNARDO	Spain / Espagne
Mr Luis Manuel MIRANDA	Spain / Espagne
Mr Daniel ZEHNDER	Switzerland / Suisse
Mr Kenan ARPACIOĞLU	Turkey / Turquie
Mr Borys KOLISNYCHENKO	Ukraine
Mr Iaroslav ZHYDENKO	Ukraine
Mr Yaron GAMBURG	Israel / Israël

Secretaries of Political Groups / Secrétaires des Groupes politiques

Ms Francesca ARBOGAST	SOC
Ms Maria BIGDAY	ALDE / ADLE
Mr Tom VAN DIJCK	EC/DA / CE/AD

Secretariat of the Parliamentary Assembly / Secrétariat de l'Assemblée Parlementaire

Mr Wojciech SAWICKI	Secretary General / Secrétaire Général
Ms Marja RUOTANEN	Director of Committees Directorate / Directrice de la Direction des commissions
Mr Horst SCHADE	Director of General Services / Directeur des Services Généraux
Mr Mark NEVILLE	Head of the Private Office / Chef de Cabinet
Mr Alfred SIXTO	Head of the Table Office / Chef du Service de la Séance
Mme Valérie CLAMER	Deputy Head of the Table Office / Chef adjointe du Service de la Séance
Mr Francesc FERRER	Deputy to the Head of the Communication Division / Adjoint au Chef de la Division de la communication
Mme Isild HEURTIN	Head of the Secretariat of the Bureau / Chef du Secrétariat du Bureau
Mme Martine MEYER	Administrative assistant of the Standing Committee / Assistante administrative de la Commission permanente
Ms Susan FELLAH	Assistant of the Standing Committee / Assistante de la Commission permanente
Mme Annick SCHNEIDER	Assistant to the Secretary General / Assistant to the Bureau / Assistante du Secrétaire Général / Assistante du Bureau

Council of Europe / Conseil de l'Europe

Mr Bjorn BERGE	Secretary to the Committee of Ministers / Secrétaire du Comité des Ministres
Mr Alexander GUESSEL	Director, Directorate of Political Affairs / Directeur, Direction des affaires politiques
Ms Leyla KAYACIK	Deputy Secretary to the Committee of Ministers / Secrétaire adjointe du Comité des Ministres