



Declassified¹
AS/Soc (2016) PV 04add2
28 September 2016
Asocpv04add2_2016

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Minutes

of the hearing on “A European social commitment guaranteeing the rights of the elderly and their comprehensive care” held in Paris on Thursday, 2 June 2016, in the afternoon

For the minutes relating to other items on the Committee agenda, please refer to PV04 and PV04add.

6. A European social commitment guaranteeing the rights of the elderly and their comprehensive care

*Rapporteur: Lord George Foulkes, United Kingdom, SOC
[AS/Soc (2016) 23]*

The hearing was opened by **Ms Silvia Bonet**, Vice-Chairperson of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development, who welcomed the experts and invited **Lord Foulkes** to present his introductory memorandum.

Lord Foulkes first introduced the work already carried out by the Council of Europe and other international institutions on the subject. He highlighted the intention of the report to focus on healthcare, due to the problems in Europe and other countries regarding maltreatment, accessibility and age discrimination in social and health services. He called for patient-centred healthcare systems. He asked for the Committee's authorisation to undertake two fact-finding visits, and wondered whether Romania and the Netherlands might be the most appropriate choice of places to visit.

Ms Katherine Hill, Policy Manager, Equality and Human Rights (Age UK)

Ms Katherine Hill explained the work carried out by Age UK and Age International, the latter of which had a network of more than 160 charities, supporting 1.8 million older people in 40 developing countries and she remarked that they provided nearly 5.7 million people with advice and information to improve later life, influencing legislation, policy and practice, as well as behaviour and attitudes towards ageing.

Ms Hill related the ageing global transformation with the increase of multiple health conditions. She pointed out that 30% of the world's older people lacked quality long-term care. She added that the prevalence of elder abuse with high care needs had reached 25%, while giving an estimate of up to 80% of elder abuse not having been reported.

Ms Hill recalled the consequences of austerity measures in meeting older people's basic needs. She showed data in relation to older people not receiving any help to get out of bed or to go to the toilet, approximately two out of three. **Ms Hill** showed evidence of age discrimination in the UK regarding treatment for depression and colorectal cancer in the National Health System. She described the plethora of key legal and policy frameworks that needed to be better implemented in order to strengthen the rights

¹ Minutes approved and declassified by the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development at its meeting on 21 September 2016 in Paris.

of older people. She asked for a specific United Nations Convention on older people to avoid maltreatment and discrimination in European hospitals. She concluded that society needed to be more conscious of this problem.

Mr Leocadio Rodriguez, Coordinator of the European Joint Action on the prevention of frailty in the elderly and Head of Department of Geriatric Medicine of Madrid's Getafe University Hospital

Mr Leocadio Rodriguez introduced the concept of the relation between functional capacity, quality of life and the increase in life expectancy. He explained the increase in multimorbidity and chronic diseases in relation to age and its impact on mortality risk. He pointed out the important role of health and social systems in improving functionality through integrated and coordinated systems. He informed the members of the increased cost of care when older people lose their functions, rather than in relation to age. He highlighted the great opportunity to detect the pre-disability stages to reverse the situation, intervening timely and efficiently, in comparison with doing nothing. **Mr Rodriguez** explained the challenge in relation to the absence of frailty as a medical diagnosis, which makes it difficult to work on. He believed that an evolution was needed in clinical scenarios regarding older people, which would change the goal from living longer to living better.

Mr Rodriguez explained that frailty was a dynamic functional state that had to be prevented or delayed in order to avoid dependency. He mentioned several initiatives in Europe which allow for more active and healthy ageing, to prevent falls and frailty conditions, which could reshape care for older people, changing the design of health systems in order to fit those of their main users.

The Chairperson gave the floor to members.

Ms De Sutter raised the problem of age discrimination and access to health and social care. She mentioned the importance of avoiding the isolation of older people.

Mr Ghilechi explained the challenge posed by demographic changes, with increased life expectancy and also with the drop in birth rates. He asked for possible solutions from the experts while suggesting possible ways to raise awareness and to stimulate solidarity in society.

Mr Kiral suggested that the rapporteur include post-Soviet countries in his fact-finding visits. He asked the experts how to define "older people". He pointed out the differences in standards of quality of life and quality of services between different countries. He worried about the adverse effect of populism in relation to pensions and services for older people. He called for better standards and regulations concerning nursing and care homes, with specialised trained professionals in order to avoid scandals that also happened in his country.

Ms Cimbro commented on demographic changes, and asked for possible good practices to deal with the problem of older people increasingly being confined to their homes.

Mr Grin pointed to the change from family care to institutional care. He asked for an adequate number of specialised staff in home and nursing care. He encouraged social services to increase the quality of care and to focus on home care whenever possible.

Ms Mergen explained the "dependence" insurance system in Luxembourg which reinvested in home care. She indicated the necessity of extending working life to more than the age of 65. She reported the necessary continuity of care with the proper coordination and communication between levels and stakeholders. **Ms Mergen** affirmed that some older persons were victims of abuse from private insurances and concluded on the importance of NGOs to supervise the policies.

Mr Jónasson indicated the main motto on doing to others what you would have them do to you. He expressed the imperative of respecting the autonomy and free decisions of the older person, taking into consideration collective solutions for individual choice. He related the importance of the shared responsibility of the family, but also health and social care.

Mr Mathieu, Vice-Chairperson of the INGO Committee on Democracy, Social Cohesion and Global Challenges, mentioned the economic problems in France related to long-term care. He invited all the

parliamentarians to participate in the INGO meeting in Strasbourg during the June part-session devoted to the topic, in which Lord Foulkes was also taking part.

Mr EBI asked that people should study other possible options before going directly to nursing homes, especially when older people could stay at home.

Mr Schennach pointed out the necessary cooperation between local, regional and state government. He offered some good examples on community living, with a wide range of social and health activities. Volunteers played an important role in helping in many activities.

Ms Hill answered the questions posed, commenting on the common theme of age discrimination, including a wide range of stereotypes and negative attitudes in our societies in relation to older people. She highlighted the importance of covering the necessary basic needs and explained that employment was good for active ageing and positive health. She defined older people as those over 65 years of age as a general consensus. She reported isolation as a great challenge, though there were models of good practice which could be shared internationally. Finally, she indicated that each person should be dealt with on a case-by-case basis and recalled the importance of supporting the carers.

Mr Rodriguez replied that many older people had no access to the care they needed. He explained that demographic changes were a balance between mortality and birth rates. It was necessary to make society aware of older people's needs. He stressed the importance of the definition in relation to the function and health conditions rather than age itself. The common stereotype of older people abusing the health and social care system was not correct. **Mr Rodriguez** concluded with an emphasis on the importance of working with frailty, in order to prevent and assist the first stages of dependency.

Lord Foulkes thanked the experts and reminded everyone of the importance of social networks for older people. He would keep the Committee informed about his future fact-finding visits and the development of the report.

List of decisions

The Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development, meeting in Paris on 2 June 2016, with first Ms Sílvia Eloïsa Bonet (Andorra, SOC), First Vice-Chairperson, and then Mr Serhii Kiral (Ukraine, EC), Chairperson of the Sub-Committee on Environment and Energy, in the Chair, as regards:

- ***A European social commitment guaranteeing the rights of the elderly and their comprehensive care*** (*Rapporteur: Lord George Foulkes, United Kingdom, SOC*): held an exchange of views with:
 - Ms Katherine Hill, Policy Manager, Equality and Human Rights (Age UK), and
 - Mr Leocadio Rodriguez, Coordinator of the European Joint Action on the prevention of frailty in the elderly and Head of Department of Geriatric Medicine of Madrid's Getafe University Hospital, and authorised the Rapporteur to undertake fact-finding visits to two European countries of his choice.

Tanja Kleinsorge, Maren Lambrecht-Feigl, Raul Mallaina, Alina Beliaeva

cc: Secretary General of the Assembly
Director General, Director and all staff of the Secretariat of the Assembly
Secretaries of National Delegations and of Political Groups of the Assembly
Secretaries of observer and partner for democracy delegations
Secretary General of the Congress
Secretary to the Committee of Ministers
Directors General
Director of the Private Office of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe
Director of the Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights
Director of Communication
Permanent Representations to the Council of Europe

**Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development
Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable**

List of presence / Liste de présence

Chairperson / Présidente :

Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES		Cyprus / Chypre
----------------------	--	-----------------

Vice-Chairpersons / Vice-Présidents :

Ms Sílvia Eloïsa BONET		Andorra / Andorre
Ms Vasiliki KATRIVANOU		Greece / Grèce
Mr Ionuț-Marian STROE		Romania / Roumanie

Members / Membres

1. Mr Petrit VASILI Albania / Albanie
2. Ms Sílvia Eloïsa **BONET**
1st Vice Chairperson / 1^{er} vice-présidente Andorra / Andorre
3. M. Vahan BABAYAN Armenia / Arménie
4. Mr Franz Leonhard **Eßl** Austria / Autriche
5. Mr Stefan **SCHENNACH** Austria / Autriche
6. Mrs Sevijn FATALIYEVA Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan
7. Mr Ganira PASHAYEVA Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan
8. Ms Cindy FRANSSEN Belgium / Belgique
9. Mr Stefaan **VERCAMER** Belgium / Belgique
10. Ms Milica **MARKOVIĆ** Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnie-Herzégovine
11. Mr Borislav BORISOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie
12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie
13. Ms Nada TURINA-ĐURIĆ Croatia / Croatie
14. Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES Cyprus / Chypre
15. Mme Daniela FILIPIOVÁ Czech Republic / République tchèque
16. Ms Gabriela **PECKOVÁ** Czech Republic / République tchèque
17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN Denmark / Danemark
18. Mr Jaak MADISON Estonia / Estonie
19. Ms Anne KALMARI Finland / Finlande
20. M. Damien ABAD France
21. Ms Maryvonne **BLONDIN** France
22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ France
23. M. Denis JACQUAT France
24. Ms Guguli **MAGRADZE** Georgia / Géorgie
25. Ms Doris BARNETT Germany / Allemagne
26. Ms Sybille BENNING Germany / Allemagne

Alternates / Remplaçant(e)s

- Ms Silva CAKA
- Mr Carles JORDANA
- Ms Naira **KARAPETYAN**
- Ms Angelika WINZIG
- Mr Andreas SCHIEDER
- Mr Vusal HUSEYNOV
- M. Muslum MAMMADOV
- M. Damien THIÉRY
- Ms Petra **De SUTTER**
- ZZ...
- Mr Antoni TRENCHÉV
- Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA
- Mr Josip BILAVÉR
- Ms Athina KYRIAKIDOU
- Mr Pavel HOLÍK
- Mr Rom **KOSTŘICA**
- Ms Christina EGELUND
- Ms Marianne MIKKO
- Ms Anne **LOUHELAINEN**
- Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ
- M. Gérard BAPT
- Ms Danielle AUROI
- M. Jean-Claude FRÉCON
- Mr Zviad KVATCHANTIRADZE
- Ms Elvira DROBINSKI-WEIß
- Mr Tobias ZECH

27. Ms Herlind GUNDELACH	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Mr Axel E. FISCHER
28. Mr Andrej HUNKO	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Annalena BAERBOCK
29. Ms Nina KASIMATI	Greece / <i>Grèce</i>	Ms Vasiliki KATRIVANOU 2 nd Vice Chairperson / 2^{ème} vice-présidente
30. Mr Evangelos MEIMARAKIS	Greece / <i>Grèce</i>	Ms Eleni RAPTI
31. Mr Márton GYÖNGYÖSI	Hungary / <i>Hongrie</i>	Ms Mónika BARTOS
32. Ms Erzsébet SCHMUCK	Hungary / <i>Hongrie</i>	Mr Gábor HARANGOZÓ
33. Mr Ögmundur JÓNASSON	Iceland / <i>Islande</i>	Ms Oddný HARÐARDÓTTIR
34. Mr Joseph O'REILLY	Ireland / <i>Irlande</i>	Mr Michael McNAMARA
35. Ms Maria Teresa BERTUZZI	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Ms Eleonora CIMBRO
36. Ms Nunzia CATALFO	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Ms Cristina DE PIETRO
37. Mr Giuseppe GALATI	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Mr Francesco Maria AMORUSO
38. Ms Laura PUPPATO	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Ms Adele GAMBARO
39. M. Andris BĒRZINŠ	Latvia / <i>Lettonie</i>	Ms Inese LAIZĀNE
40. Mr Rainer GOPP	Liechtenstein	Mr Hubert LAMPERT
41. Mr Arturas SKARDŽIUS	Lithuania / <i>Lituanie</i>	Ms Dangutė MIKUTIENĖ
42. Ms Martine MERGEN	Luxembourg	Mme Françoise HETTO-GAASCH
43. Mr Deo DEBATTISTA	Malta / <i>Malte</i>	Mr Charlò BONNICI
44. Ms Liliana PALIHOVICI	Republic of Moldova / <i>République de Moldova</i>	Mr Valeriu GHILETCHI
45. M. Jean-Charles ALLAVENA	Monaco	M. Christian BARILARO
46. Mr Goran TUPONJA	Montenegro / <i>Monténégro</i>	ZZ...
47. Mr Tuur ELZINGA	Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Ms Tineke STRIK
48. Mr Paul SCHNABEL	Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Mr Ahmed MARCOUCH
49. Ms Ingebjørg GODSKESEN	Norway / <i>Norvège</i>	Mr Tore HAGEBAKKEN
50. Ms Margareta BUDNER	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Mr Krzysztof BREJZA
51. Mr Krzysztof SITARSKI	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Andżelika MOŹDŻANOWSKA
52. Mr Andrzej WOJTYŁA	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Agnieszka POMASKA
53. M. Luís LEITE RAMOS	Portugal	ZZ...
54. Ms Helena ROSETA	Portugal	ZZ...
55. Mr Marian NEACȘU	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Mr Ben-Oni ARDELEAN
56. Mr Cezar Florin PREDA	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Mr Attila Béla-Ladislau KELEMEN
57. Mr Ionuț-Marian STROE 3rd Vice Chairperson / 3^{ème} vice-président	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Mr Viorel Riceard BADEA
58. Mme Giovanna CECCHETTI	San Marino / <i>Saint-Marin</i>	Mr Gerardo GIOVAGNOLI
59. Ms Elvira KOVÁCS	Serbia / <i>Serbie</i>	Mr Ninoslav STOJADINOVIĆ
60. Mr Aleksandar SENIĆ	Serbia / <i>Serbie</i>	Mr Dejan KOVAČEVIĆ
61. Ms Darina GABÁNIOVÁ	Slovak Republic / <i>République Slovaque</i>	Mr Ľuboš BLAHA
62. Mr Jan ŠKOBERNE	Slovenia / <i>Slovénie</i>	Mr Andrej ŠIRCELJ
63. Mr José Manuel BARREIRO	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Ms Maria Mercedes ROLDÓS
64. Ms Melisa RODRÍGUEZ HERNÁNDEZ	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Ms Ángela BALLESTER
65. M. Ovidio SÁNCHEZ	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	ZZ...
66. Mr Markus WIECHEL	Sweden / <i>Suède</i>	Ms Boriana ÅBERG
67. Ms Carina OHLSSON	Sweden / <i>Suède</i>	Ms Eva-Lena JANSSON
68. M. Jean-Pierre GRIN	Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	Mr Hannes GERMANN
69. Ms Liliane MAURY PASQUIER	Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	M. Filippo LOMBARDI
70. Mr Vladimir GJORCHEV	"The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" / "L'ex-République yougoslave de Macédoine"	Mr Imer ALIU
71. Mr Mehmet BABAOĞLU	Turkey / <i>Turquie</i>	Mr İbrahim Mustafa TURHAN
72. Ms Emine Nur GÜNAY	Turkey / <i>Turquie</i>	Mr Suat ÖNAL
73. Mr İlhan KESİCİ	Turkey / <i>Turquie</i>	Mr Haluk KOÇ

74. Mr Ertuğrul KÜRKCÜ	Turkey / <i>Turquie</i>	Ms Filiz KERESTECİOĞLU DEMİR
75. Mr Oleksandr BILOVOL	Ukraine	Mr Vladyslav GOLUB
76. Mr Serhii KIRAL	Ukraine	Mr Boryslav BEREZA
77. Mr Viktor VOVK	Ukraine	Mr Oleksii GONCHARENKO
78. Mr Mike WOOD	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Kelly TOLHURST
79. Mr Geraint DAVIES	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Mr John PRESCOTT
80. Mr Jeffrey DONALDSON	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Baroness Margaret EATON
81. Lord George FOULKES	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Baroness Doreen MASSEY

SPECIAL GUESTS / INVITES SPECIAUX

Ms / *Mme* Katherine HILL Policy Manager, Equality and Human Rights (Age UK)
 *Directrice politique, Égalité des sexes et Droits humains, Age UK*
 Mr / *M.* Leocadio RODRIGUEZ Coordinator of the European Joint Action on the prevention of frailty in the elderly
 and Head of Department of Geriatric Medicine of Madrid's Getafe University Hospital
 *Coordonnateur de l'Action commune européenne sur la prévention*
 *de la perte d'autonomie des personnes âgées,*
 *Directeur du Département de Médecine gériatrique, Hôpital Universitaire de Getafe Madrid*

PARTNERS FOR DEMOCRACY / PARTENAIRES POUR LA DEMOCRATIE

Mr / *M.* Arif HASSAN Morocco / *Maroc*
 Mr / *M.* Qais KHADER Palestine/ *Palestine*

SECRETARIAT OF DELEGATION OR OF POLITICAL GROUP / SECRETARIAT DE DELEGATION OU DE GROUPE POLITIQUE

Ms / *Mme* Francesca ARBOGAST Secretary of the Socialist Group / *Secrétaire du Groupe Socialiste*
 Ms / *Mme* Sonja LANGENHAECK Belgium / *Belgique*
 Mr / *M.* Razvan TANASE Romania / *Roumanie*
 Ms / *Mme* Sevda VALJEVIC Bosnia and Herzegovina / *Bosnie Herzégovine*

ALSO PRESENT / EGALEMENT PRESENTS

Mr / *M.* Thierry MATHIEU Vice-Chairperson of the Committee on Democracy,
 Social Cohesion and Global Challenges /
 *Vice-Président de la Commission Démocratie Cohésion sociale et Enjeux Mondiaux*
 Mr / *M.* Nicola SPERANZA Federation of Catholic Family Associations in Europe (FAFCE) /
 *Fédération des Associations Familiales Catholiques en Europe (FAFCE)*

COUNCIL OF EUROPE STAFF / SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY / ASSEMBLÉE PARLEMENTAIRE

NAME / NOM

Mr / *M.* Mario MARTINS Director General / *Directeur Général*
 Ms / *Mme* Micaela CATALANO Head of the Communication Division /
 *Chef de la division de communication*

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development / *Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable*

NAME / NOM

Ms / *Mme* Tanja KLEINSORGE Head of the Secretariat / *Chef du Secrétariat*
Ms / *Mme* Maren LAMBRECHT-FEIGL..... Secretary to the Committee / *Secrétaire de la commission*
Mr / *M.* Raul MALLAINA GARCIACo-Secretary to the Committee / *Co-Secrétaire de la commission*
Ms / *Mme* Alina BELIAEVACo-Secretary to the Committee / *Co-Secrétaire de la commission*
Ms / *Mme* Fatima NOUICERAssistant / *Assistante*