

Declassified AS/Soc (2017) PV 03 add 2rev 19 September 2017 Asocpv03add2rev 2017

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Revised minutes

of the hearing on the "Detention of Palestinian minors in Israeli prisons" held in Strasbourg on Tuesday, 25 April 2017, from 9 to 10 am

As regards the report currently in preparation on the **Detention of Palestinian minors in Israeli prisons** (Rapporteur: Ms Liliane Maury Pasquier, Switzerland, SOC), the Committee heard a video statement by Ms June Kunugi, Special Representative, UNICEF, and held an exchange of views with:

- Mr Khaled Quzmar, General Director, "Defense for Children International Palestine (DCIP)", and
- Ms Sarit Michaeli, International Advocacy Officer, "B'Tselem The Israeli Information Center for Human Rights in the Occupied Territories".

The Chairperson opened the hearing and welcomed the experts. She reminded members of the Committee's decision, taken on 24 March 2017 in Paris, to hold a hearing on the present subject matter, in lieu of the suggested fact-finding visit by the rapporteur to Israel which the Israeli observer delegation had not been willing to support.

Ms Maury Pasquier, rapporteur, briefly recalled the main objectives of her report which meant to exclusively focus on children's rights that needed to be respected in any circumstances. She regretted the lack of co-operation by the Israeli observer delegation, and was grateful to the experts present for helping her to shed light on this specific issue.

Ms Kunugi, in her video statement made on behalf of UNICEF, elaborated on UNICEF's written statement (see Appendix).

NB: A link to the video has been posted on the Committee's webpage.

Mr Quzmar, Defense for Children International Palestine (DCIP), based on more than 20 years of field experience, affirmed that people under occupation suffered from various threats. Many Palestinian children had been killed by Israeli forces in recent years, and the international community, by not effectively acting, gave a message considered by Israel as a green light to continue along the same lines. No progress had been made since 1991 in terms of justice and accountability, as could be seen through various, shocking reports and data:

- between 500 and 700 children (12-17), including girls, were detained in Israeli prisons and prosecuted by military courts each year; about 60% of them were transferred from the occupied territory to prisons inside Israel which violated the fourth Geneva convention;
- 590 affidavits collected between 2012 and 2016 had shown that:
 - 72% of children had endured some form of physical violence following arrest;
 - 66% had faced verbal abuse, humiliation and/or intimidation;
 - in 45% of cases, children had been arrested from their homes in the middle of the night;
 - in 87% of cases, children had been arrested without notifying the parents of the reasons;

- in 38% of cases, military court judges based their convictions on confessions drafted in Hebrew, a language that most Palestinian children did not understand, and only rarely excluded confessions obtained by coercion or torture.

- DCIP evidence suggested that:

- solitary confinement/isolation was regularly used to obtain confessions or information about other individuals;
- 91 children had been held in isolation between 2012 and 2016 for an average period of 14 days:
- in 2016 alone, 25 children were held in solitary confinement, one of which for a time period of 29 days;
- 235 out of 297 cases closed by DCIP attorneys (2012 and 2015) involved at least one count of stone throwing;
- only 13.5% of children were released on bail.

Mr Quzmar also reported that the minimum age of criminal responsibility under Israeli military law was 12 years; however, children aged 16-17 already saw the same provisions applied to them as adults. Administrative detention permitted military officials to incarcerate individuals without charge or trial based on secret evidence; this had been used against 22 children since October 2015 (3 still remaining in detention, 17 released after up to 10 months in prison and 2 imprisoned after conviction). Very often, the Israel Prison Service seemed to adopt a rehabilitative framework towards Israeli juvenile offenders while Palestinians were imprisoned in a more austere, punitive model, with limited access to educative, therapeutic or rehabilitative activities and, subsequently, experienced great difficulties to reintegrate into their communities once released. Mr Quzmar concluded that violations of rights of and crimes against Palestinian children would continue because of lack of accountability, leading Palestinian children to seek justice under international law.

NB: The full Power Point presentation of this expert, as well as a background paper about DCIP can be found on the Extranet related to this hearing.

Ms Michaeli from the Israeli NGO B'Tselem reported on her organisation's extensive work on the treatment of minors in the Israeli military court system in the West Bank in particular. She introduced her presentation with a short video about the experiences of Palestinian youth suspected of stone throwing, the most common offence Palestinian minors are charged with in military courts. Her organisation's research indicated that the Israeli military justice system routinely denies adequate protection from minors and violates their rights. Comprehensive data on the numbers of Palestinian detainees who are minors was not easily accessible but human rights agencies like hers had to rely on monthly figures provided by the Israeli Prison Service (IPS) which represented mere "snapshots" of the actual situation. According to these, at the end of August 2016, 319 Palestinian minors had been held in Israeli prisons as "security detainees" and prisoners, including 10 administrative detainees and Palestinian minors held in Israeli prisons for being in Israel illegally; all these categories of detainees were considered as criminal offenders by the IPS.

According to data provided by the Association for Civil Rights in Israel, in 2015, 871 Palestinian minors had been arrested in the West Bank, 62% of whom had had indictments filed against them, out of which 95% led to convictions by military courts. In this context, there was great pressure on minors to accept plea bargains, which usually included prison sentences. The plea bargains were often based on confessions extracted through interrogations violating the rights of suspects and a high willingness of military courts to rely on such dubious evidence. Moreover, in this way, many minors hoped to spend shorter time periods in prisons than if they opted for an evidentiary trial and were thus remanded in custody pending trial. In response to criticism in the past, Israel had announced several changes to military legislation, qualifying them as improvements, such as the establishment of youth courts or the length of remand periods after indictment. However, many Palestinian minors would not be able to benefit from these changes given that security offences were not concerned by them and detention periods could still be extended based on the discretion of police officers. **Ms Michaeli** finally blamed the existence of two legal systems predicated on different values, one inside the Green Line and the other in the West Bank, and the partiality of the Israeli military court system which she expected to last until the current occupation came to an end.

NB: The full written version of Ms Michaeli's presentation, including links to relevant publications and data, can be found on the Extranet related to this hearing.

Starting off the discussion, **Mr Masiulis** found the evidence presented somewhat one-sided as Israeli children could also be found in prisons, and as, in some cases, Palestinian children had been instrumentalised as fighters for the Palestinian cause.

Baroness Massey stated that children's rights were regularly violated in conflict situations which suspended the application of law. She wondered, in particular, why the number of girls involved in this conflict had gone up over the past years, and whether data was also available about any sexual abuse affecting them.

Mr Gyöngyösi agreed that the situation of children could generally not be dissociated from international conflicts and that this conflict in particular did not involve two equal sides, because it was the conflict of a State versus an occupied territory, regularly finding expression in the issue of "illegal settlements" and involving very unbalanced weapons: high-tech military equipment on one side and stone-throwing on the other. He wondered how children's rights standards as promoted by UNICEF and others could be implemented more effectively.

The Chairperson called the parliamentarians to order, and asked them to focus on the rights of the children affected, not on the underlying political conflict.

Ms Puppato felt very concerned by the reports about administrative detention and about the isolation of children in Israeli prisons. She also wondered whether boys were affected by sexual abuse while being imprisoned.

Ms Michaeli affirmed that Palestinian minors were protected under international law just like those from Israel - in theory but not in practice. She was not aware of any data available on sexual abuse. As far as the reasons for the detention of girls were concerned, she knew of the case of a 14-year-old girl who had been sent to prison for 4 months after having been found with a knife.

Mr Quzmar knew that some children were threatened with sexual abuse to put psychological pressure on them, but had no evidence that any actual sexual violence took place. In his view, the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) remained the main reference in this context. The EU in particular had a major role to play as a player within the international community to ensure that human rights were better respected in Israel (including through financial support to human rights protection mechanisms).

Ms Maury Pasquier, the rapporteur, thanked the experts for their informative presentations and reaffirmed that the protection of children and their rights needed to remain the main line followed in her report: human rights had to be guaranteed to any person, whatever his or her origin or crimes. The aim of the Assembly related to this report would therefore be to defend the rights of all children, not to judge the overall political context.

In reaction to this last remark, **Lord Prescott** still believed that something had to be done about the political conflict as such; at Council of Europe level, the Committee of Ministers should address this issue with Israel. **The Chairperson** remarked that it would be up to the Rapporteur to decide whether she wished to reflect this idea in her report.

List of Decisions

The Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development, meeting in Strasbourg:

[...]

 Tuesday, 25 April 2017, at 8.30 am with first Ms Sílvia Eloïsa Bonet (Andorra, SOC), first Vice-Chairperson, and then Ms Stella Kyriakides (Cyprus, EPP/CD), Chairperson, in the Chair, as regards:

[...]

- Detention of Palestinian minors in Israeli prisons (Rapporteur: Ms Liliane Maury Pasquier, Switzerland, SOC): heard a video statement by Ms June Kunugi, Special Representative, UNICEF, and held an exchange of views with:
 - Mr Khaled Quzmar, General Director, "Defense for Children International Palestine (DCIP)";
 - Ms Sarit Michaeli, International Advocacy Officer, "B'Tselem The Israeli Information Center for Human Rights in the Occupied Territories";

[...]

Tanja Kleinsorge, Aiste Ramanauskaite, Maren Lambrecht-Feigl, Alina Beliaeva, Prisca Barthel

cc: Secretary General of the Assembly

Director General, Director and all staff of the Secretariat of the Assembly

Secretaries of National Delegations and of Political Groups of the Assembly

Secretaries of observer and partner for democracy delegations

Secretary General of the Congress

Secretary to the Committee of Ministers

Directors General

Director of the Private Office of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe

Director of the Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights

Director of Communication

Permanent Representations to the Council of Europe

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

List of signatures

EXCHANGE OF VIEWS AND HEARING – 25 April 2017 ECHANGE DE VUES ET AUDITION – 25 avril 2017

Chairperson / Présidente :

Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES	Cyprus / Chypre

Vice-Chairpersons / Vice-Présidents :

Ms Silvia BONET	Andorra / Andorre
Mr Ertuğrul KÜRKÇÜ	Turkey / Turquie
Mr Ionuţ-Marian STROE	Romania / Roumanie

Members / Membres

Alternates / Remplaçant(e)s

2. Ms Silvia Eloïsa BONET 1st Vice Chairperson / 1st Vice Chairperso	1.	Ms Silva CAKA	Albania / <i>Albanie</i>	ZZ
Vice Chairperson / Per vice-président Andorra / Andorre Ms Judith PALLARÉS 3. M. Mikayel MELKUMYAN Armenia / Arménie Ms Naira KARAPETYAN 4. Mr Franz Leonhard ESSL Austria / Autriche Ms Angelika WINZIG 5. Mr Stefan SCHENNACH Austria / Autriche Mr Andreas SCHIEDER 6. Mrs Sevinj FATALIYEVA Azerbaijan / Azerbaidjan Mr Vusal HUSEYNOV 7. Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA Azerbaijan / Azerbaidjan M. Muslum MAMMADOV 8. Ms Cindy FRANSSEN Belgium / Belgique M. Damien THIÉRY 9. Mr Stefaan VERCAMER Belgium / Belgique Ms Petra De SUTTER 10. Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnie-Herzégovine ZZ 11. Mr Borislav BORISOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 13. Ms Marijana BALIĆ Croatia / Croatie Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 14. Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES Cygrus / Chypre Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ République tchèque Mr Pavel HOLÍK 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ République tchèque Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 17. Ms A			/ IIDama / / IIDamo	
3. M. Mikayel MELKUMYAN Armenia / Arménie Ms Naira KARAPETYAN 4. Mr Franz Leonhard ESSL Austria / Autriche Ms Angelika WINZIG 5. Mr Stefan SCHENNACH Austria / Autriche Mr Andreas SCHIEDER 6. Mrs Sevinj FATALIYEVA Azerbaijan / Azerbaidjan Mr Vusal HUSEYNOV 7. Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA Azerbaijan / Azerbaidjan M. Muslum MAMMADOV 8. Ms Cindy FRANSSEN Belgium / Belgique M. Damien THIÊRY 9. Mr Stefaan VERCAMER Belgium / Belgique Ms Petra De SUTTER 10. Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnie-Herzégovine ZZ 11. Mr Borislav BORISOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 13. Ms Marijana BALIĆ Croatia / Croatie Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 14. Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES Cyprus / Chypre Ms Christina EROTOKRITOU 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ Czech Republic / République tchèque Mr Pavel HOLÍK 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ Czech Republic / République tchèque Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN Denmark / Danemark Ms Christina EGELUND 18. Mr Jaak MADISON Estonia / Estonie <		Vice Chairperson / 1 ^{er} vice-	Andorra / Andorre	Ms Judith PALLARÉS
5. Mr Stefan SCHENNACH 6. Mrs Sevinj FATALIYEVA 7. Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA 8. Ms Cindy FRANSSEN 9. Mr Stefaan VERCAMER 10. Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ 11. Mr Borislav BORISOV 12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV 13. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ 14. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN 18. Mr Jaak MADISON 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 19. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 19. Mr Antoni Trenche 19. Mr	3.	-	Armenia / Arménie	Ms Naira KARAPETYAN
6. Mrs Sevinj FATALIYEVA 7. Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA 8. Ms Cindy FRANSSEN 9. Mr Stefaan VERCAMER 10. Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ 11. Mr Borislav BORISOV 12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV 13. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN 18. Mr Jaak MADISON 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 19. Mr Barislav BADIO 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 20. Mr Damien ABAD 21. Mr Barislav BADIO 21. Mr Barislav BADIO 22. Mr Damien ABAD 23. Ms Marijana BALIC 24. Ms Saja Chemnitz LARSEN 25. Mr Barislav BADIO 26. Ms Anne KALMARI 27. Ms Anne KALMARI 28. Mr Barislav BADIO 29. Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 29. Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 20. Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 20. Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 20. Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 21. Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 22. Mr Rom KALMARI 23. Mr Rom KALMARI 24. Mr Rom KALMARI 25. Mr Damien ABAD 26. Mr Rom KALMARI 26. Mr Rom KALMARI 27. Mr Rom KALMARI 28. Mr Jaak Marijanne BLONDIN 29. Mr Rom KALMARI 20. Mr Damien ABAD 30. France 31. Mme Mariyonone BLONDIN 32. Mme Marie-Christine 34. Dariela Alroli	4.	Mr Franz Leonhard ESSL	Austria / Autriche	Ms Angelika WINZIG
7. Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA 8. Ms Cindy FRANSSEN 9. Mr Stefaan VERCAMER 10. Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ 11. Mr Borislav BORISOV 12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV 13. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN 18. Mr Jaak MADISON 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 19. Ms Agia Chemnitz LARSEN 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 20. M. Damien ABAD 21. Mme Mariyonne BLONDIN 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ 25. Ms Petra De SUTTER 27. Ms Agia Chem THIÉRY 28. Ms Petra De SUTTER 27. Ms Apigaque 29. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 29. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 29. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 20. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 21. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 22. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 23. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 24. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 25. Ms Catini TRENCHEV 26. Ms Croatia / Croatia / Bulgarie 27. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 28. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 29. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 30. Mr A	5.	Mr Stefan SCHENNACH	Austria / Autriche	Mr Andreas SCHIEDER
8. Ms Cindy FRANSSEN 9. Mr Stefaan VERCAMER Belgium / Belgique Ms Petra De SUTTER 10. Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnie-Herzégovine 11. Mr Borislav BORISOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie Mr Antoni TRENCHEV Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 13. Ms Marijana BALIĆ Croatia / Croatie Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES Cyprus / Chypre Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ République tchèque Czech Republic / République tchèque Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ Rosepublic / République tchèque Rosepublic / Rosepublic / Republic / République tchèque Rosepublic / Rosepublic / Republique tchèque Rosepublic / Rosepublic / Republique tchèque Rosepublic / Rosepublic / Rosepublic / Republique tchèque Rosepublic / Rosepublic / Rosepublic / Rosepublic / Republique tchèque Rosepublic / Ros	6.	Mrs Sevinj FATALIYEVA	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan	Mr Vusal HUSEYNOV
9. Mr Stefaan VERCAMER 10. Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ 11. Mr Borislav BORISOV 12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV 13. Ms Marijana BALIĆ 14. Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN 18. Mr Jaak MADISON 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 20. M. Damien ABAD 21. Mr Stefaan VERCAMER 22. Mme Marije-Christine DALLOZ 22. Mr Posislav CHUKOLOV 22. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 22. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 22. Ms Christiana EROTOKHITOU 22. Mme Marije-Christine DALLOZ 32. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 42. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 44. Ms Crasimira KOVACHKA 45. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 46. Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 46. Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 46. Mr Pavel HOLÍK 47. Mr Pavel HOLÍK 48. Mr Pavel HOLÍK 48	7.	Ms Ganira PASHAYEVA	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan	M. Muslum MAMMADOV
10. Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnia-Herzégovine 22 11. Mr Borislav BORISOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 13. Ms Marijana BALIĆ Croatie Croatie Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ République tchèque Czech Republic / République tchèque Mr Pavel HOLÍK 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ Czech Republic / République tchèque Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN Denmark / Danemark Ms Christina EGELUND 18. Mr Jaak MADISON Estonia / Estonie Ms Marianne MIKKO 19. Ms Anne KALMARI Finland / Finlande Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN 20. M. Damien ABAD France Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Ms Marianne MIKKO Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ Mr Rom KOSTŘICA	8.	Ms Cindy FRANSSEN	Belgium / Belgique	M. Damien THIÉRY
11. Mr Borislav BORISOV 12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV 13. Ms Marijana BALIĆ 14. Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN 18. Mr Jaak MADISON 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 20. M. Damien ABAD 21. Mr Borislav BORISOV 21. Mur Pavel HOLÍK 22. Mme Mariyvonne BLONDIN 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ 23. Mus Ratigarie Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 24. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 25. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 25. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 25. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 27. Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 27. Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 28. Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 28. Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 29. Mr Pavel HOLÍK 20. Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 21. Mr Rom KOSTŘICA 22. Mme Marie-Christine 21. Mme Maryvonne BLONDIN 22. Mme Marie-Christine 23. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 24. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 25. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 27. Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 27. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 28. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 29. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 20. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 21. Mr Antoni Trenche 22. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 22. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 23. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 24. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 25. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 27. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 28. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 29. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 21. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 22. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 23. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 24. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 25. Mr Antoni TRENCHEV 26. Mr Antoni TR	9.	Mr Stefaan VERCAMER	Belgium / Belgique	Ms Petra De SUTTER
12. Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV Bulgaria / Bulgarie Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA 13. Ms Marijana BALIĆ Croatia / Croatie Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 14. Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES Cyprus / Chypre Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ République tchèque 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ République tchèque 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN Denmark / Danemark 18. Mr Jaak MADISON Estonia / Estonie Ms Anne KALMARI Pinland / Finlande Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ Mme Mariyonne BLONDIN Prance Mme Danielle AUROI	10.	Mme Milica MARKOVIĆ	<u> </u>	ZZ
13. Ms Marijana BALIĆ Croatie Croatie Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ 14. Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES Cyprus / Chypre Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ Czech Republic / République tchèque 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ Czech Republic / République tchèque 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN Denmark / Danemark Ms Christina EGELUND 18. Mr Jaak MADISON Estonia / Estonie Ms Marianne MIKKO 19. Ms Anne KALMARI Finlande Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN 20. M. Damien ABAD France Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ 21. Mme Maryvonne BLONDIN France M. Gérard BAPT 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ	11.	Mr Borislav BORISOV	Bulgaria / Bulgarie	Mr Antoni TRENCHEV
14. Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES Cyprus / Chypre Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU 15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ République tchèque 16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ République tchèque 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN Denmark / Danemark Nr Jaak MADISON Estonia / Estonie 18. Mr Jaak MADISON Finland / Finlande 20. M. Damien ABAD Prance Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU Mr Pavel HOLÍK Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Ms Christina EGELUND Ms Marianne MIKKO Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ M. Gérard BAPT Mme Danielle AUROI	12.	Mr Desislav CHUKOLOV	Bulgaria / Bulgarie	Ms Krasimira KOVACHKA
15. Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ Czech Republic / République tchèque Mr Pavel HOLÍK Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN Denmark / Danemark Ms Christina EGELUND Ms Marianne MIKKO Ms Marianne MIKKO Ms Anne KALMARI Finland / Finlande Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ M. Gérard BAPT Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Mr Rom KOSTŘICA Ms Christina EGELUND Ms Marianne MIKKO Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ M. Gérard BAPT Mme Danielle AUROI	13.	Ms Marijana BALIĆ	Croatia / Croatie	Mr Mihael ZMAJLOVIĆ
16. Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ 17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN 18. Mr Jaak MADISON 19. Ms Anne KALMARI 20. M. Damien ABAD 21. Mme Maryvonne BLONDIN 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ Pagublique tchèque Czech Republic / République tchèque Denmark / Danemark Denmark / Danemark Ms Christina EGELUND Ms Marianne MIKKO Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ M. Gérard BAPT Mme Danielle AUROI	14.	Ms Stella KYRIAKIDES	Cyprus / Chypre	Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU
17. Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN Denmark / Danemark Ms Christina EGELUND 18. Mr Jaak MADISON Estonia / Estonie Ms Marianne MIKKO 19. Ms Anne KALMARI Finlande Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN 20. M. Damien ABAD France Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ 21. Mme Maryvonne BLONDIN 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ France Mme Danielle AUROI	15.	Ms Zdeňka HAMOUSOVÁ		Mr Pavel HOLÍK
18. Mr Jaak MADISON Estonie Ms Marianne MIKKO 19. Ms Anne KALMARI Finlande Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN 20. M. Damien ABAD France Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ 21. Mme Maryvonne BLONDIN 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ France Mme Danielle AUROI	16.	Ms Gabriela PECKOVÁ		Mr Rom KOSTŘICA
19. Ms Anne KALMARI Finlande Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN 20. M. Damien ABAD France Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ 21. Mme Maryvonne BLONDIN France M. Gérard BAPT 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ France Mme Danielle AUROI	17.	Ms Aaja Chemnitz LARSEN	Denmark / Danemark	Ms Christina EGELUND
20. M. Damien ABAD France Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ 21. Mme Maryvonne BLONDIN France M. Gérard BAPT 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ France Mme Danielle AUROI	18.	Mr Jaak MADISON	Estonia / Estonie	Ms Marianne MIKKO
 21. Mme Maryvonne BLONDIN 22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ France France Mme Danielle AUROI 	19.	Ms Anne KALMARI	Finland / Finlande	Ms Anne LOUHELAINEN
22. Mme Marie-Christine DALLOZ France Mme Danielle AUROI			France	Mme Catherine QUÉRÉ
DALLOZ France Mme Danielle AUROI		-	France	M. Gérard BAPT
23. M. Denis JACQUAT France Mme Marie-Francoise PEROL-DUMONT	22.		France	Mme Danielle AUROI
	23.	M. Denis JACQUAT	France	Mme Marie-Francoise PEROL-DUMONT

24. Ms. Irina PRUIDZE	Georgia / Géorgie	Mr. Dimitri TSKITISHVILI
25. Ms Doris BARNETT	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Elvira DROBINSKI-WEISS
26. Ms Sybille BENNING	Germany / Allemagne	Mr Tobias ZECH
27. Ms Herlind GUNDELACH	Germany / Allemagne	Mr Axel FISCHER
28. Mr Andrej HUNKO	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Annalena BAERBOCK
29. Ms Nina KASIMATI	Greece / Grèce	Mr Dimitrios KAMMENOS
30. Mr Evangelos MEIMARAKIS	Greece / Grèce	M. Konstantinos TZAVARAS
31. Mr Márton GYÖNGYÖSI	Hungary / Hongrie	Ms Mónika BARTOS
32. Mr Ákos HADHÁZY	Hungary / Hongrie	Mr Gábor HARANGOZÓ
33. Mr Vilhjálmur ÁRNASON	Iceland / <i>Islande</i>	Mr Birgir ÁRMANNSSON
34. Mr Joseph O'REILLY	Ireland / Irlande	Mr Rónán MULLEN
35. Ms Maria Teresa BERTUZZI	Italy / Italie	Ms Eleonora CIMBRO
36. Ms Nunzia CATALFO	Italy / Italie	Ms Cristina DE PIETRO
37. Mr Giuseppe GALATI	Italy / Italie	Mr Francesco Maria AMORUSO
38. Ms Laura PUPPATO	Italy / Italie	Ms Adele GAMBARO
39. M. Andris BĒRZINŠ	Latvia / Lettonie	Ms Inese LAIZĀNE
40. ZZ	Liechtenstein	ZZ
41. Mr Virgilijus PODERYS	Lithuania / Lituanie	Mr Kęstutis MASIULIS
42. Mme Martine MERGEN	Luxembourg	Mme Françoise HETTO-GAASCH
43. Mr Deo DEBATTISTA	Malta / Malte	Mr Charlò BONNICI
44. Ms Liliana PALIHOVICI	Republic of Moldova / République de Moldova	Mr Valeriu GHILETCHI
45. M. Jean-Charles ALLAVENA	Monaco	M. Eric ELENA
46. ZZ	Montenegro / Monténégro	ZZ
47. Mr Paul SCHNABEL	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	ZZ
48. Mr Henk OVERBEEK	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	ZZ
49. Ms Reina de BRUIJN- WEZEMAN	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	ZZ
50. Ms Ingebjørg GODSKESEN	Norway / Norvège	Mr Tore HAGEBAKKEN
51. Ms Margareta BUDNER	Poland / Pologne	Ms Magdalena KOCHAN
52. Ms Barbara CHROBAK	Poland / Pologne	Ms Andżelika MOŻDŹANOWSKA
53. Mr Andrzej WOJTYŁA	Poland / Pologne	Ms Agnieszka POMASKA
54. M. Luís LEITE RAMOS	Portugal	ZZ
55. Mme Helena ROSETA	Portugal	Mme Edite ESTRELA
56. Mr Liviu Ioan Adrian PLEŞOIANA	Romania / Roumanie	Mr Corneliu ŞTEFAN
57. Mr Cezar Florin PREDA58. Mr Ionuţ-Marian STROE 3rd	Romania / Roumanie	Mr Viorel Riceard BADEA
Vice Chairperson / 3 ^{ème}	Romania / Roumanie	Ms Oana-Mioara BÎZGAN-GAYRAL
vice-président	Can Marina / Caint Marin	Ma Varana DIAMPROCIO
59. Mr Roger ZAVOLI	San Marino / Saint-Marin	Ms Vanessa D'AMBROSIO
60. Mr Milovan BOJIĆ	Serbia / Serbie	Mr Miljan DAMJANOVIĆ
61. Ms Elvira KOVÁCS	Serbia / Serbie	Ms Dubravka FILIPOVSKI
62. Mr Ján MAROSZ	Slovak Republic / République Slovaque	Ms Renáta KAŠČÁKOVÁ
63. Mr Jan ŠKOBERNE	Slovenia / Slovénie	Mr Andrej ŠIRCELJ
64. Mr José Manuel BARREIRO	Spain / Espagne	M. Ovidio SÁNCHEZ
65. Ms Maria Concepción de SANTA ANA	Spain / Espagne	Ms Pilar LUCIO
66. Ms Melisa RODRÍGUEZ HERNÁNDEZ	Spain / Espagne	Ms Ángela BALLESTER
67. Ms Carina OHLSSON	Sweden / Suède	Ms Eva-Lena JANSSON
68. Mr Markus WIECHEL	Sweden / Suède	Ms Annicka ENGBLOM
69. M. Jean-Pierre GRIN	Switzerland / Suisse	Mr Hannes GERMANN
70. Mme Liliane MAURY PASQUIER	Switzerland / Suisse	M. Filippo LOMBARDI
71. Mr Vladimir GJORCHEV	"The former Yugoslav Republic	ZZ

Ms Filiz KERESTECİOĞLU DEMİR

of Macedonia" / "L'ex-
République yougoslave de

Macédoine"

Turkey / Turquie

72. Mr Mehmet BABAOĞLU Remplacé par M. Salih Firat	Turkey / Turquie	Mr Cemalettin Kani TORUN
73. Ms Emine Nur GÜNAY	Turkey / <i>Turquie</i>	Mr Suat ÖNAL
74. Mr İlhan KESİCİ	Turkey / <i>Turquie</i>	Mr Haluk KOÇ
75. Mr Ertuğrul KÜRKCÜ 2 nd		_

Vice Chairperson / 2^{ème} vice-président

Ukraine Mr Vladyslav GOLUB

76. Mr Oleksandr BILOVOL 77. Mr Serhii KIRAL Ukraine Mr Boryslav BEREZA 78. Mr Viktor VOVK Ukraine Mr Oleksii GONCHARENKO United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni 79. Mr Geraint DAVIES Lord George FOULKES 80. Sir Jeffrey DONALDSON United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni Baroness Margaret EATON 81. Mr John PRESCOTT United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni Baroness Doreen MASSEY 82. Mr Mike WOOD United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni Ms Kelly TOLHURST

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

MEXICO / MEXIQUE

Senator Diva HADAMIRA GASTELUM BAJO / Mme la Sénatrice Diva HADAMIRA GASTELUM BAJO

PARTNERS FOR DEMOCRACY / PARTENAIRES POUR LA DEMOCRATIE

PALESTINIAN AUTHORITY / L'AUTORITE PALESTINENNE

Mr / M. Mohammedfaisal ABUSHAHLA Mr / M. Azzam AL-AHMAD Ms / Mme Sahar ALQAWASMI Mr / M. Qais KHADER Mr / M. Bernard SABELLA

EMBASSIES / PERMANENT REPRESENTATIONS AND DELEGATIONS AMBASSADES / REPRESENTATIONS ET DELEGATIONS PERMANENTES

Mr / M. Asmund ERIKSEN	Norway / Norvège
Mr / M. Augustin MICHAUD	
Mr / M. Yngve OLSEN HVOSLEF	
Ms / Mme Inginur RUSTEM	
Ms / Mme Livia RUSU	

SECRETARIAT OF DELEGATION OR OF POLITICAL GROUP / SECRETARIAT DE DELEGATION OU DE GROUPE POLITIQUE

Ms / Mme Gunilla CARLANDER	Finland / Finlande
Ms / Mme Gabriella MARANGOU-d'AVERNAS	Cyprus / Chypre
Mr / M. Joseph MOUSTAKI	
Mr / M. Razvan TANASE	
Ms / Mme Sybille ZAKTREGER	Israel / Israël

ALSO PRESENT / EGALEMENT PRESENTS

EXPERTS

Ms / Mme Juliane HIRSCH, Consultant on Private International Law and International Family Law / Consultante en Droit International et Droit International de la Famille

Mr / M. Khaled QUZMAR, General Director, "Defense for Children International - Palestine (DCIP)" / Directeur Général, « Défense des Enfants International - Palestine (DEIP) »

Ms / Mme Sarit MICHAELI, International Advocacy Officer, "B'Tselem, The Israeli Information Center for Human Rights in the Occupied Territories" / Agent international de liaison / Centre d'information israélien pour les droits de l'homme dans les territoires occupés »

NGO's / ONG

Mr / M. Andreas BERGLÖF, European Advocacy and Mobilization Lead, IPPF European Network / Défense européenne et direction de mobilisation, IPPF European Network

Ms / Mme Senellart DE VRIERE, Federation of Catholic Family Associations in Europe (FAFCE) / Fédération des Associations Familiales Catholiques en Europe (FAFCE)

Mr / M. Thierry MATHIEU, Vice-Chairperson of the Committee on Democracy, Social Cohesion and Global Challenges / Vice-Président de la Commission Démocratie, Cohésion sociale et Enjeux Mondiaux

Ms / Mme Lilit POGHOSYAN, European Advocacy and Mobilization Lead, IPPF European Network / Défense européenne et direction de mobilisation, IPPF European Network

Mr / M. Nicola SPERANZA, Policy Officer, Federation of Catholic Family, Associations in Europe (FAFCE) / Responsable des politiques, Fédération des Associations Familiales Catholiques en Europe (FAFCE)

Mr / M. Philippe TOUSSAINT, Policy Officer, Federation of Catholic Family, Associations in Europe (FAFCE) / Responsable des politiques, Fédération des Associations Familiales Catholiques en Europe (FAFCE)

Mr / M. Leo van DOESBURG, The European Christian Political Movement (EPCM) / Mouvement politique chrétien européen (MPCE)

Ms Anje WIERSINGA, IAW Representative at the Council of Europe / Représentante de l'Alliance Internationale des Femmes

OTHERS / AUTRES

Mr / M. Kewin KLOTZEK, Ms MOŻDŹANOWSKA's assistant / Assistant de Mme Andżelika MOŻDŹANOWSKA's

COUNCIL OF EUROPE STAFF / SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

NAME / NOM DEPARTMENT / SERVICE

Ms / Mme Katrin UERPMANN, DGI Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / DGI Direction Générale des Droits de l'Homme et de l'Etat de Droit

Ms / Mme Kristiina FELT, DGI Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / DGI Direction Générale des Droits de l'Homme et de l'Etat de Droit

PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY / ASSEMBLÉE PARLEMENTAIRE

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development / Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

NAME / NOM

Head of the Secretariat / Cheffe du Secrétariat
Secretary to the Committee / Secrétaire de la commission
Secretary to the Committee / Secrétaire de la commission
Secretary to the Committee / Secrétaire de la commission
Project Manager / Chef de projet
Responsible for the Europe Prize section /
Responsable pour la section Prix de l'Europe
Principal Assistant / Assistante principale
Assistant / Assistante
Trainee / Stagiaire