

**Declassified<sup>1</sup> AS/Soc (2021) PV 06add**9 September 2021
Asocpv06add 2021

## Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

## **Minutes**

Public hearing on "Eradicating extreme child poverty in Europe: an international obligation and a moral duty", held by videoconference, on Thursday, 17 June 2021

In the framework of the report currently in preparation on "Eradicating extreme child poverty in Europe: an international obligation and a moral duty" by **Mr Pierre-Alain Fridez** (Switzerland, SOC), the Committee held a public hearing with the participation of:

- Mr Bjørn Berge, Deputy Secretary General of the Council of Europe
- Mr Gerard Quinn, United Nations Special Rapporteur on the rights of persons with disabilities
- Mr Jacques Vandenschrik, President of the European Food Banks Federation (FEBA)
- **Mr Zachary Parolin**, Senior Fellow, Center on Poverty and Social Policy, Columbia University and Assistant Profession, Bocconi University
- **Ms Lucia Ďuriš Nicholsonová,** (Slovak Republic, Renew Europe), Chairperson of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs of the European Parliament

**Mr John Howell, First Vice-Chairperson,** introduced the Deputy Secretary General and the invited experts and opened the hearing.

**Mr Fridez** gave a brief outline of his preliminary draft report and urged the member States to reverse the increase of extreme child poverty in Europe.

Almost 385 million children in the world (i.e., 1 child in 5) lived in extreme poverty. This phenomenon existed in Europe as well, with 22 million children living in poverty. Although ambitious policies and objectives had been adopted in the past, their goals had never been achieved. European countries would not meet their commitment to end extreme poverty corresponding to sustainable development goal 1.2. The pandemic had worsened the situation on top of this initial failure.

Mr Fridez addressed the main reasons for child poverty. First and foremost, child poverty was a direct consequence of family poverty. Child poverty also affected children in specific situations like migrants and unaccompanied minors. These children feared for their future and were desperate.

He underlined that children in poverty were particularly vulnerable because they didn't have access to elementary hygiene in the broadest sense. They often did not live in a healthy environment, could not practice sport, did not eat a balanced diet of healthy food, did not live in decent housing where they feel safe and can do their homework carefully, did not receive quality education and enjoy quality healthcare, including dental care. The inequalities stemming from these elements also jeopardised their mental health. They were deprived of the life in security with their loved ones that every child deserves.

The Committee then **held** a public hearing.

**The Deputy Secretary General, Mr Berge,** expressed his support for the Committee's work on child poverty. He added that to combat this breach of human rights, political will was essential and hard choices had to be made. Plenty of room for progress existed, because one child living in poverty was one child too many.

The European Convention on Human Rights and the European Social Charter were the main frameworks to combat child poverty. Article 30 of the revised Social Charter stipulated the right to protection against poverty and social exclusion. Even if Europe was a rich continent, the number of children living in poverty had remained stable for many years and the Covid-19 pandemic had complicated the situation. Budgetary cuts to overcome

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>The minutes were approved and declassified by the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development at its meeting on 9 September 2021, held in a hybrid manner.

the consequences of the pandemic had hit the poor the hardest. Each international organisation with a mandate including the fight against poverty and the protection of human rights had an obligation to guide national governments in how to respond. The Council of Europe had an important role to play. It was incumbent on member States to enhance equality in the most different circumstances. Compliance with Article 30 of the Revised European Social Charter would help the State parties to combat poverty. Unfortunately, there was a gap between the commitments entered into by states and their exercise by individuals. The Social Charter should be more largely ratified, and its monitoring system should be made more effective.

Different bodies within the Council of Europe were working to reduce child poverty. For instance, the Steering Committee on the Rights of the Child (CDENF) features child poverty as a main area of work in the current and in the upcoming Strategies. This was an issue addressed across the whole organisation. The Committee on Social Affairs of the Parliamentary Assembly had a pivotal role to play in mobilising the Committee of Ministers and Member States. There was a moral obligation to act. The entire Council of Europe should pull in the same direction because child poverty was a disgrace. Finally, he spoke in favour of the need for collective efforts.

**Mr Vandenschrik** thanked the Rapporteur and the Committee for the invitation to speak during this meeting and quoted principle 11 of the European Pillar of Social Rights of the European Union, which stipulated that every child has a right to protection against poverty and that children coming from disadvantaged backgrounds have the right to specific measures to enhance equal opportunities. This principle was at the core of the European Food Banks Federation, whose mission is to fight poverty and food waste.

The European Food Banks Federation collected healthy, edible food that would otherwise end up as wasted food from producers and distribution chains. The food was then sorted, stored, and redistributed by a network of affiliated charities – such as community charities, soup kitchens, shelters, or other organisations helping those in need.

The Covid-19 pandemic had caused a sudden food emergency, whose primary victims were children. There was an increase of 34,7 % of people in need of food aid in Europe. The European Food Banks Federation's members had adapted their activities and had begun collecting food from airlines, restaurant chains and canteens. The economic and social consequences of the pandemic had become more and more noticeable. There was a continuous progression of poverty in relation to the Covid-19 pandemic. 60% of people who fell into poverty in 2020 were families with children, who had been relying on school meals before the closing of their schools. In addition, the pandemic had reduced access to healthy and appropriate food for children. The percentage of children living in households unable to offer at least one meal a day containing meat, chicken or fish was 21.4% in Hungary and 40% in Bulgaria.

The members of the European Food Banks Federation had turned the vicious circle of wasted food into a virtuous circle for the sake of the good use of food. They had redistributed 860,000 tonnes of foodstuffs to 12.8 million of the poorest people through 48,126 charities. They relied on the dedication of 37,016 workers (85% of whom were volunteers). In 2020, their members had redistributed 12% more food to 34.7% more beneficiaries compared to 2019. In 2020, they had helped 1,161,091 children.

Child poverty was still a serious problem in the European Union, because one fourth of children were at risk of poverty and social exclusion. In 2020, that number had increased due to the sanitary crisis. Child poverty was a Pan-European problem that affected all countries in Europe. In this context, States were invited to contribute financially to prevent children from living in destitution. The new EU Mechanism of the Child Guarantee would contribute to this objective.

The activity of the Food Banks had a structural impact with significant benefits for society in general, for the environment, for the economy, and for the resilience of the food chain. It provided a multitude of assistance programmes to individuals, not only through food assistance but with the integration of this assistance into various programs based on local needs and run by local charities. By working with these charities, the Food Bank could reach people who were often invisible, such as children.

In conclusion, he said that "no child should go to bed or school hungry". Under no circumstances should children be blamed for a lack of food. The Covid-19 crisis had increased the number of people living in poverty. This could be turned around with awareness raising and with the implementation of poverty prevention programmes.

**Mr Parolin** presented his recent research on the expected results of Covid-19 Acts in the US to halt extreme poverty. He started with a presentation on child poverty rates in the United States, examining three main periods – the first, the pre-pandemic, when child poverty rates in the United States were relatively higher compared to the European Union Member States; the second, during the pandemic, when the administration had launched a massive policy response, which largely stopped the increase of poverty and finally, the near future, when the recent Biden reforms would bear fruit. This policy had the potential to cut child poverty in half.

The reforms were established on a different perception of poverty which was the income necessary to live in a specifically defined area. People who did not dispose of this amount of money were considered to be under the poverty threshold. The poverty threshold for a family of four in an average-cost city like Phoenix was around 28,000 USD per year.

During the pandemic, the United States had introduced a massive policy response, which had largely prevented an increase in poverty. The CARES Act (Coronavirus Aid, Relief and Economic Security Act) had introduced expanded unemployment benefits, which included Pandemic Unemployment Compensation (PUC) of 600 USD per week, Pandemic Unemployment Assistance (PUA) and Pandemic Emergency Unemployment Compensation (PEUC), in addition to stimulus checks. The project had shown that without these policy responses child poverty rates would have increased.

Moreover, the expanded Child Tax Credit would go into effect in July 2021. It had the potential to cut child poverty in half. The fully refundable Child Tax Credit of 3000 USD per month was part of the American Rescue Plan, which had been adopted in March 2021.

**Ms Nicholsonová** thanked the rapporteur and the Committee for the invitation to speak on the topic of eradicating child poverty in Europe. It constituted a major problem. The European Child Guarantee had been crucial for the European Parliament since 2015. Members of the Parliament were convinced that every child should be guaranteed access to free healthcare, education and childcare, decent housing, and adequate nutrition. Regrettably, in the European Union one in five children or 18 million children lived in poverty.

On 14 June 2021, the Council of the European Union had adopted a recommendation establishing a European Child Guarantee. Its main aim was to prevent and combat the social exclusion of children by guaranteeing access to a set of key services by children in need. It was also meant to combat child poverty and foster equal opportunities. In addition, this recommendation contained a number of propositions for the member States, to address, for instance, social exclusion of children and participation in education and care; to provide at least one healthy meal each school day and educational materials, including digital educational tools, books, uniforms, etc.; to ensure equal and inclusive access to school-based activities; to implement accessible health promotion and disease prevention; to guarantee priority and timely access to social housing or housing assistance.

The pandemic had forced some parents to make huge sacrifices, because many of them had lost their jobs and fallen into precarity, with devastating consequences for their children. Moreover, the limited access to education had had severe, long-lasting effects for children in poverty. The pandemic should not diminish the life prospects of an entire generation — children should have the opportunity to grow, develop and thrive. Member States should break the existing intergenerational cycle of poverty that the pandemic had only exacerbated.

To break the cycle of poverty, Member States should take urgent action and translate their commitments into specific measures. National action plans should put child welfare at the heart of employment, social, housing and health policies. In additions, internet connection in schools and access to digital devices for all children were required to prevent school dropout.

The European Parliament had legislated on financial instruments to support policies and actions to safeguard children's well-being. An unprecedented amount of resources would be available to Member States. In addition, for the Child Guarantee to be successful, it was crucial that it be regularly monitored. The 27 Member States should nominate a national Child Guarantee co-ordinator and submit to the Commission, within nine months of the adoption of the recommendation, an action plan covering the period until 2030 to implement this recommendation.

In conclusion, everyone needed to come together and join forces to end child poverty. Children's voices had to be heard when the Child Guarantee was put into practice. The measures to end child poverty were not a cost, but an investment in the future of European society as whole.

**Ms Khomenko** thanked the rapporteur and referred to the situation of women and different measures to combat household poverty, like universal basic income, but also emergency needs for internally displaced persons.

Ms Hetto-Gaasch underlined that wasted food was sometimes a consequence of excessively complex regulation.

**Mr Fridez** thanked all the participants and expressed his support for the efforts of the European Union to find the financial means to guarantee the welfare of children.

## Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

Chairperson / Présidente :

Onaliperson / Tresidente.	
M. Luís LEITE RAMOS	Portugal
Vice-Chairpersons / Vice-Présidents :	
Mr John HOWELL	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni
Mme Edite ESTRELA	Portugal
Mr Andrej HUNKO	Germany/ Allemagne

ZZ	Albania / <i>Albanie</i>	ZZ
M. Pere LÓPEZ	Andorra / Andorre	Mme Mònica BONELL
M. Mikayel MELKUMYAN	Armenia / Arménie	Mr Ruben RUBINYAN
Mr Franz Leonhard ESSL	Austria / Autriche	Mr Michel REIMON
Mr Stefan SCHENNACH	Austria / Autriche	Ms Doris BURES
Ms Nigar ARPADARAI	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan	Ms Parvin KARIMZADA
Ms Sevinj FATALIYEVA	Azerbaijan / <i>Azerbaïdjan</i>	Ms Konul NURULLAYEVA
Mr Bob De BRABANDERE	Belgium / Belgique	Ms Els van HOOF
M. Simon MOUTQUIN	Belgium / Belgique	Mme Latifa GAHOUCHI
Ms Snježana NOVAKOVIĆ BURSAĆ	Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnie-Herzégovine	Mr Amir FAZLIĆ
Mr Nikolay ALEKSANDROV	Bulgaria / <i>Bulgarie</i>	Mr Krasimir BOGDANOV
Mr Georgi YORDANOV	Bulgaria / <i>Bulgarie</i>	Ms Ivelina VASSILEVA
Ms Zdravka BUŠIĆ	Croatia / Croatie	Ms Rada BORIĆ
Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU	Cyprus / Chypre	Mr Constantinos EFSTATHIOU
ZZ	Czech Republic / République tchèque	Ms Alena GAJDŮŠKOVÁ
Mr Jaroslav KYTÝR	Czech Republic / République tchèque	Mr Jiři STRÝČEK
Mr Henrik MØLLER	Denmark / Danemark	Mr Kim VALENTIN
Mr Urmas REITELMANN	Estonia / Estonie	Ms Vilja TOOMAST
Ms Minna REIJONEN	Finland / Finlande	Ms Tarja FILATOV
Mme Jennifer DE TEMMERMAN	France	M. Dimitri HOUBRON
M. Bruno FUCHS	France	Mme Martine WONNER
M. Alain MILON	France	M. Christian KLINGER
Mme Laurence TRASTOUR-ISNART	France	ZZ
ZZ	Georgia / Géorgie	Mr Fridon INJIA
Ms Sybille BENNING	Germany / Allemagne	Mr Josef RIEF
Mr Andrej HUNKO	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Bela BACH
Mr Matern von MARSCHALL	Germany / Allemagne	Mr Christian PETRY
Mr Ulrich OEHME	Germany / Allemagne	Mr Christoph HOFFMANN
Mr Sokratis FAMELLOS	Greece / Grèce	Mr Kyriakos VELOPOULOS
Ms Nina KASIMATI	Greece / Grèce	Ms Foteini PIPILI
Ms Mónika BARTOS	Hungary / Hongrie	Mr Jenő MANNINGER
Mr Róbert DUDÁS	Hungary / Hongrie	Mme Zita GURMAI
Mr Bergþór ÓLASON	Iceland / Islande	Mr Birgir THÓRARINSSON

Mr Joseph O'REILLY	Ireland / Irlande	Ms Lynn BOYLAN
Mr Fabio DI MICCO	Italy / Italie	Mr Gianluca PERILLI
Mr Emilio FLORIS	Italy / Italie	Ms Maria RIZZOTTI
Mr Gaspare Antonio MARINELLO	Italy / Italie	Ms Barbara GUIDOLIN
Mr Gianfranco RUFA	Italy / Italie	Mr Manuel VESCOVI
Mr Uldis BUDRIĶIS	Latvia / Lettonie	Mr Edgars TAVARS
Ms Franziska HOOP	Liechtenstein	Mr Peter FRICK
Mr Gintautas PALUCKAS	Lithuania / Lituanie	Mr Kęstutis MASIULIS
Mme Françoise HETTO-GAASCH	Luxembourg	M. Marc SPAUTZ
Mr Ian CASTALDI PARIS	Malta / Malte	Ms Rosianne CUTAJAR
Ms Inga GRIGORIU	Republic of Moldova / République de Moldova	Mr Liviu VOVC
M. José BADIA	Monaco / Monaco	Mme Béatrice FRESKO-ROLFO
Mr Miloš KONATAR	Montenegro / Monténégro	Mr Marko KOVAČEVIĆ
Ms Reina de BRUIJN-WEZEMAN	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	Mr Bob van PAREREN
Ms Ria OOMEN-RUIJTEN	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	ZZ
Ms Artina QAZIMI	North Macedonia / Macédoine du Nord	Mr Vlado MISAJLOVSKI
Ms Silje HJEMDAL	Norway / Norvège	Ms Emilie Enger MEHL
Ms Danuta JAZŁOWIECKA	Poland / Pologne	Mr Tomasz LATOS
Mr Bolesław PIECHA	Poland / Pologne	Mr Zbigniew GIRZYŃSKI
Mr Andrzej SZEJNA	Poland / Pologne	ZZ
Mme Edite ESTRELA	Portugal	Mr Pedro CEGONHO
M. Luís LEITE RAMOS	Portugal	Ms Jamila MADEIRA
M. Viorel Riceard BADEA	Romania / Roumanie	Mr Cristian-Augustin NICULESCU-ŢÂGÂRLAŞ
Mr Andi-Lucian CRISTEA	Romania / Roumanie	M. Ion PRIOTEASA
Ms Diana STOICA	Romania / Roumanie	Mr Iulian BULAI
Mr Oleg ALEKSEEV	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Mr Denis GUSEV
Ms Alfiia KOGOGINA	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Ms Oksana PUSHKINA
Mr Vladimir KRUGLYI	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Mr Iaroslav NILOV
Mr Sergei PAKHOMOV	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Mr Alexandr PROKOPIEV
Ms Marica MONTEMAGGI	San Marino / Saint-Marin	Mr Marco NICOLINI
Mr Enis IMAMOVIĆ	Serbia / Serbie	Mr Milan RADIN
Mr Zoran TOMIĆ	Serbia / Serbie	Mr Gojko PALALIĆ
Mme Anna ZÁBORSKÁ	Slovak Republic / République slovaque	Mr Juraj ŠELIGA
Ms Andreja ZABRET	Slovenia / Slovénie	Ms Suzana LEP ŠIMENKO
Mr Antón GÓMEZ-REINO	Spain / Espagne	Ms María Teresa JIMÉNEZ-BECERRIL
Ms Carmen LEYTE	Spain / Espagne	Mr Antonio GUTIÉRREZ
Ms Susana SUMELZO	Spain / Espagne	Ms Esther PEÑA
Mr Alexander CHRISTIANSSON	Sweden / Suède	Mr Ola MÖLLER
Ms Carina OHLSSON	Sweden / Suède	ZZ
Ms Sibel ARSLAN	Switzerland / Suisse	M. Pierre-Alain FRIDEZ

M. Jean-Pierre GRIN	Switzerland / Suisse	Mme Ada MARRA
Ms Emine Nur GÜNAY	Turkey / <i>Turquie</i>	Mr Mehmet Mehdi EKER
Mr Halil ÖZŞAVLI	Turkey / Turquie	Ms Sena Nur ÇELİK
Mr Hişyar ÖZSOY	Turkey / Turquie	Ms Feleknas UCA
Ms Selin SAYEK BÖKE	Turkey / Turquie	M. Haluk KOÇ
Ms Olena KHOMENKO	Ukraine	Ms Larysa BILOZIR
Ms Yuliia OVCHYNNYKOVA	Ukraine	Mr Andrii LOPUSHANSKYI
ZZ	Ukraine	Ms Lesia ZABURANNA
Mr Richard BACON	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Mr Duncan BAKER
Mr Geraint DAVIES	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Mr Steve DOUBLE
Mr John HOWELL	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Mr Mark FLETCHER
Baroness Doreen E. MASSEY	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Ms Ruth JONES

### OTHER PARLIAMENTARIANS PRESENT / AUTRES PARLEMENTAIRES PRESENTS

# SECRETARIAT OF DELEGATION OR OF POLITICAL GROUP / SECRETARIAT DE DELEGATION OU DE GROUPE POLITIQUE

Mr / M. Georg Magerl, Delegation Secretary, Austrian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation autrichienne auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Karine Shimshiryan, Delegation Secretary, Armenian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation arménienne auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Elena Persiani, International Relations Officer, Cypriot delegation to PACE / Officier de relations internationales, Délégation chypriote auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Kamilla Kjelgaard, Delegation Secretary, Danish delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, Délégation danoise auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Dorthe Bakke, Delegation Secretary, Norwegian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation norvégienne auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Ana Guapo, Delegation Secretary, Portugese delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de Portugal auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Alina Ilie, Delegation Secretary, Romanian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de la Roumanie auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Carmen Ionescu, Delegation Secretary, Romanian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de la Roumanie auprès de l'APCE

Mr / M. Răzvan Tănase, Delegation Secretary, Romanian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de la Roumanie auprès de l'APCE

Mr / M. Pavel Ermoshin, Delegation Secretary, Russian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation russe auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Anna Kucherevskaya, Delegation Secretary, Russian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation russe auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Johanna Ingvarsson, International Advisor, Swedish delegation to PACE / Conseillère internationale, délégation suédise auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Anna Lea Gnägi, specialised administration secretary, Swiss delegation to PACE / Secrétaire administrative spécialisée, délégation suisse auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Hatice Biyikli Ozansoy, Delegation Secretary, Turkish delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation turque auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Francesca Arbogast, Secretary of the Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group (SOC) / Secrétaire du Groupe des socialistes, démocrates et verts (SOC)

Ms / Mme Maria Bigday, Secretary of the Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe Group (ALDE) / Secrétaire du Groupe Alliance des démocrates et des libéraux pour l'Europe (ADLE)

Ms / Mme Marianna Ntalla, Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group (SOC) / Groupe des socialistes, démocrates et verts (SOC)

#### **EXPERTS / EXPERT.E.S**

Mr / M. Jacques Vandenschrik, President of the European Food Banks Federation / Président de la Fédération européenne des banques alimentaires

Mr / M. Zachary Parolin, Senior Fellow at the Center on Poverty and Social Policy of Columbia University, and Assistant Professor at Bocconi University / Membre sénior, Centre d'études de la pauvreté et de la politique sociale, Université de Columbia et Professeur assistant, Université Bocconi

Ms / Mme Lucia Ďuriš Nicholsonová (Slovak Republic, Renew Europe), Chairperson of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs of the European Parliament / (République slovaque, Renew Europe), Présidente de la Commission de l'emploi et des affaires sociales du Parlement européen

#### COUNCIL OF EUROPE STAFF / SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Mr / M. Bjorn Berge, Deputy Secretary General of the Council of Europe / Secrétaire Général adjoint du Conseil de l'Europe

Ms / Mme Tanya Montanari, Secretariat of the European Social Charter / Secrétariat de la Charte sociale européenne

Ms / Mme Maren Lambrecht-Feigl, Children's Rights Policies and Co-operation / Politique des droits des enfants et coopération

# SECRETARIAT OF THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY / SECRÉTARIAT DE L'ASSEMBLÉE PARLEMENTAIRE

Ms / Mme Marja Ruotanen, Director of Committees / Directrice des commissions

Mr / M. Angus MacDonald, Administrative Officer, Communication Division / Administrateur, Division de la communication

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development / Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

Ms / Mme Tanja Kleinsorge	Head of the Secretariat / Cheffe du Secrétariat
Ms / Mme Aiste Ramanauskaite	Secretary to the Committee / Secrétaire de la commission
Ms / Mme Yulia Pererva	Secretary to the Committee / Secrétaire de la commission
Mr / M. Guillaume Parent	Co-Secretary/ Co-Secrétaire
Ms / Mme Prisca Barthel	Europe Prize section / Section Prix de l'Europe
Ms / Mme Bogdana Buzarnescu	Principal Assistant / Assistante Principale
Ms / Mme Melissa Charbonnel	Assistant / Assistante
Ms / Mme Raya Dimitrova	Trainee / Stagiaire
Ms / Mme Susan Gentes	Trainee / Stagiaire