



Declassified¹ AS/Soc (2021) PV 10add 24 January 2022 Asocpv10add_2021

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Minutes

Exchange of views on "For an assessment of the means and provisions to combat children's exposure to pornographic content", held in a hybrid manner, on Wednesday, 1 December 2021

In the framework of the report currently in preparation on "For an assessment of the means and provisions to combat children's exposure to pornographic content" by **Mr Dimitri Houbron** (France, ALDE), the Committee **held** an exchange of views with the participation of:

- ✓ Mr John Carr, Expert on internet safety and security, United Kingdom
- ✓ Ms Julie Miville-Dechêne, Senator, Senate of Canada
- ✓ Mr lain Corby, Executive Director, The Age Verification Providers Association

Mr Luís Leite Ramos, Committee Chairperson, introduced the invited experts and opened the hearing.

Mr Houbron outlined the context for the preparation of his draft report in particular with respect to the Lanzarote Convention. An increased number of children had been exposed to pornographic content as a consequence of the Covid-19 pandemic. Minors should be protected with the help of preventive policies. Providing relevant information, advice, and assistance, including technological assistance such as parental control was essential. In France, the platform "I protect my child" had been set up to provide guidance for parents. Most importantly, there should be an open discussion on this subject.

Mr Carr recalled the background to the development of age verification measures in the United Kingdom. In 2001-2002, children had started using smartphones and the possibility of supervision by parents was adversely impacted. Children had also started using debit cards for gambling. Minors' addiction to gambling had started to rise. The problem had been fuelled by the absence of technical solutions to check the age of gamblers. In 2003, there had been a review of all forms of gambling. The new Gambling Bill had made age verification obligatory. The UK had thus become the 1st country to introduce online age verification. Every online gambling company had to set-up efficient age verification mechanisms in order to get a license. A new law had thus created a new market. As time passed, the technology had become more sophisticated. It was high time for the pornography industry to operate in a similar way. The only thing that was required was political will. Children's exposure to pornographic content was a breach of the UNCRC and the Lanzarote Convention. The UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of opinion had considered that it was within the power of states to limit access to certain materials if the intention was to protect children. Generally speaking, this was not about banning pornography, but about protecting children from harmful content. The UK law passed in 2017 made age verification for pornography websites mandatory, but it had never been implemented. An online safety bill was to be considered in March 2022, hopefully to be adopted by the end of the year. This could mean that 5 years would have passed pass before the new pornography law entered into force.

Ms Miville-Dechêne stressed that children were bombarded with hardcore, extreme pornographic images, which were often degrading to women, and increasingly violent. Pornography giant *MindGeek*, the parent company of *Pornhub*, which had a storefront in Montreal, claimed that 10% of Canadians used *Pornhub* on a daily basis. It was not known how many of these 4 million people were children, as access was free, and with no control. About 7% of girls and 40% of boys reported having seen pornography online; 28% of boys looked it up at least once a week. The situation had worsened during the Covid-19 pandemic. The Canadian Centre for Child Protection had found that pornography was corrosive for children's brain development. Furthermore, it was used to prepare children for sexual abuse. About a year ago, Pornhub had been at the centre of a scandal, involving the use of non-consensual material and child sexual abuse material. Even after that they

¹The minutes were approved and declassified by the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development at its meeting on 24 January 2022, held in a hybrid manner.

had not introduced age verification requirement for their users. A police enquiry into MindGeek activities had stalled, because the government had not been able to confirm whether this was a Canadian company (as the servers were located abroad). Meanwhile the Canadian House of Commons had found that there had not been enough evidence of negative effects on young people to decide on the need for the age verification. Instead, it had proposed to consider stronger parental controls. Parents were demanding more decisive action. The reluctance to legislate in this area was linked to the principles of web neutrality, freedom of expression and the protection of privacy. The Canadian Charter on Rights and Freedoms provided very strong protection for these principles, and not enough protection for children. In 2021, to address this gap, Ms Miville-Dechêne had submitted a draft law on the protection of children from exposure to pornography. She had also been advocating sexual education that addressed the issue of consent and gender stereotypes. Exposure to pornography led to anxiety, reduced self-esteem, and aggressiveness. In June 2021, the law had been adopted, but faced obstacles and had had to be re-submitted. The law's opponents believed that the means proposed infringed the right to privacy. Another concern was potential misuse of private data. However, the technologies had evolved and now allowed age verification processes that did not involve personal identification. Most parents did not install filters; and 80% of parents who did install parental control software never activated it. Health professionals' associations were strong supporters of decisive policy action in this area. Adopting laws and putting them into practice was an arduous undertaking. The government should see this issue as a priority. While a lot had been done in Canada to address sexual violence, education programmes varied a lot in terms of content and quality. Education could not resolve this problem on its own.

Mr Corby pointed out that his organisation was a global trade body bringing together 23 technology suppliers. Their members performed millions of checks every year. This technology worked. The United Kingdom played a leading role in legislation for age verification. There was also a lively debate on the European General Data Protection Regulation. In this context, special care was required when processing children's data. Pornographic websites systematically processed the visitors' data, regardless of their age and generally without seeking consent. It was done to facilitate marketing and advertising, but also to select content which would entice the user to remain on the website for longer. This was abuse of children's data. There had been a campaign to act against adult websites which operated in this way. This regulation applied across the European Economic Area and should be enforced by every data protection regulator. A major challenge was extra-territorial enforcement, and even within the EU some countries acted as safe havens hosting adult websites. The European Commission was funding a consortium of academic experts in child rights and privacy, and technology providers to develop a solution across the continent. The euCONSENT consortium was to pilot its technology in early 2022 and to launch it by the summer of 2022. It aimed at ensuring equal application to all service providers, based on clear standards, as well as respect for privacy and safety of the users. Age checking needed to be done proportionally. A full range of solutions existed. The euCONSENT was to be interoperable, with the possibility of 4-8 hours of online activity without interruption. It should be open and inclusive and non-discriminatory. Age verification should be done independently by third parties. There should be a healthy age-verification market. It should make it easy to move around the Internet. It was hoped that within a few years it would be widely accepted that users had to prove that that they were old enough for the content and services on all websites. The current situation in the online world seemed strange - it was as if today, we saw children walking unchallenged into casinos or strip clubs. This change should be facilitated by emerging international standards, regulation, and certification.

Mr Houbron asked about the effectiveness of judicial sanctions and the elimination of non-compliant web portals.

Mr Leite Ramos mentioned that he worked in his parliament on questions of gambling and asked about the best practices on age verification and online money transactions. The pandemic had prompted an increase in various harmful practices, which caused substantial social and economic damage, with many families being ruined as a result.

Ms Miville-Dechêne answered that two tracks were possible to counter lack of age verification – first, criminal liability and financial fines, and second, administrative measures, such as a court's order to block the website concerned. "Mirror sites" could re-emerge as a result. Technically, it was possible to address this. The main obstacle was the heavy investment that was required. Parental control was crucial, but it was not sufficient on its own. Many parents lacked digital literacy.

Mr Corby commented that enforcement abroad relied on dealing with search engines, payment services and other support services that hosted, facilitated, and promoted non-compliant sites, to ensure that they complied with the law. Parental controls were not 100% successful. They required diligent educated parents. Less than 60% of parents used parental control software.

Mr Carr replied that parental control mechanisms and filters were a good thing, but they tended to shift responsibility from pornography publishers onto parents. Adult content providers said that they did not want children to have access to pornography, but they were doing nothing to prevent it. Age verification mechanisms allowed to assign due responsibility to the content providers. It was important to "go after the money". Cutting off the income stream, and other business disruption measures, were effective ways of forcing pornography

publishers to comply. A privacy poll in 8 EU member states had shown that many people felt that, in any case, there was no such thing as privacy any longer. They also felt that protecting children from harmful content was more important than respecting privacy. In fact, it was possible to protect both.

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

Chairperson / Présidente :

M. Luís LEITE RAMOS	Portugal		
	Foltugal	Portugal	
Vice-Chairpersons / Vice-Pré	sidents :		
Mr John HOWELL	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni		
Mme Edite ESTRELA	Portugal	Portugal	
Mr Andrej HUNKO	Germany/ Al	lemagne	
ZZ	Albania / Albania	e ZZ	
M. Pere LÓPEZ	Andorra / Andorr		
Mr Armen GEVORGYAN	Armenia / Armén		
Mr Franz Leonhard ESSL	Austria / Autriche		
Mr Stefan SCHENNACH	Austria / Autriche		
Ms Nigar ARPADARAI	Azerbaijan / Azerbai		
Ms Sevinj FATALIYEVA	Azerbaijan / Azerbai	,	
Mr Bob De BRABANDERE	Belgium / Belgiqu		
M. Simon MOUTQUIN	Belgium / Belgiqu		
Ms Snježana NOVAKOVIĆ BURSAĆ	Bosnia and Herzegov Bosnie-Herzégovi		
ZZ	Bulgaria / Bulgari		
ZZ	Bulgaria / Bulgari		
Ms Zdravka BUŠIĆ	Croatia / Croatie		
Ms Christiana EROTOKRITOU	Cyprus / Chypre	Mr Constantinos EFSTATHIOU	
ZZ	Czech Republic République tchèq		
Mr Jaroslav KYTÝR	Czech Republic République tchèq		
Ms Katarina AMMITZBØLL	Denmark / Danema	ark Mr Kim VALENTIN	
Mr Urmas REITELMANN	Estonia / Estonia	e Ms Vilja TOOMAST	
Ms Minna REIJONEN	Finland / Finland	e Ms Tarja FILATOV	
Mme Jennifer DE TEMMERMAN	France	M. Dimitri HOUBRON	
M. Bruno FUCHS	France	Mme Martine WONNER	
M. Alain MILON	France	M. Christian KLINGER	
Mme Laurence TRASTOUR-ISNART	France	M. Pierre MOREL-À-L'HUISSIER	
Ms Mariam LASHKHI	Georgia / Géorgi	e Mr Fridon INJIA	
Ms Sybille BENNING	Germany / Allemag	gne Mr Josef RIEF	
Mr Andrej HUNKO	Germany / Allemag	gne Ms Bela BACH	
Mr Matern von MARSCHALL	Germany / Allemag	gne Mr Christian PETRY	
Mr Ulrich OEHME	Germany / Allemag	gne Mr Christoph HOFFMANN	
Mr Sokratis FAMELLOS	Greece / Grèce	Mr Kyriakos VELOPOULOS	
Ms Nina KASIMATI	Greece / Grèce	Ms Foteini PIPILI	
Ms Mónika BARTOS	Hungary / Hongri	e Mr Jenő MANNINGER	
Mr Róbert DUDÁS	Hungary / Hongri	e Mme Zita GURMAI	
Mr Bergþór ÓLASON	Iceland / Islande	Mr Birgir THÓRARINSSON	
Mr Joseph O'REILLY	Ireland / Irlande	Ms Lynn BOYLAN	

Mr Fabio DI MICCO	Italy / Italie	Mr Gianluca PERILLI
Mr Emilio FLORIS	Italy / Italie	Ms Maria RIZZOTTI
Mr Gaspare Antonio MARINELLO	Italy / Italie	Ms Barbara GUIDOLIN
Mr Gianfranco RUFA	Italy / Italie	Mr Manuel VESCOVI
Mr Uldis BUDRIĶIS	Latvia / Lettonie	Mr Edgars TAVARS
Ms Franziska HOOP	Liechtenstein	Mr Peter FRICK
Mr Gintautas PALUCKAS	Lithuania / Lituanie	Mr Kęstutis MASIULIS
Mme Françoise HETTO-GAASCH	Luxembourg	M. Paul GALLES
Mr Ian CASTALDI PARIS	Malta / Malte	Ms Miriam DALLI
Mr Ion GROZA	Republic of Moldova / République de Moldova	Ms Reghina ĂPOSTOLOVA
M. José BADIA	Monaco / Monaco	Mme Béatrice FRESKO-ROLFO
Mr Miloš KONATAR	Montenegro / Monténégro	ZZ
Ms Reina de BRUIJN-WEZEMAN	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	Mr Bob van PAREREN
Ms Ria OOMEN-RUIJTEN	Netherlands / Pays-Bas	ZZ
Ms Artina QAZIMI	North Macedonia / Macédoine du Nord	Mr Vlado MISAJLOVSKI
Ms Lisa Marie Ness KLUNGLAND	Norway / Norvège	Ms Kirsti BERGSTØ
Ms Danuta JAZŁOWIECKA	Poland / Pologne	Mr Tomasz LATOS
Mr Bolesław PIECHA	Poland / Pologne	Mr Zbigniew GIRZYŃSKI
Mr Andrzej SZEJNA	Poland / Pologne	ZZ
Mme Edite ESTRELA	Portugal	Mr Pedro CEGONHO
M. Luís LEITE RAMOS	Portugal	Ms Jamila MADEIRA
M. Viorel Riceard BADEA	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Mr Cristian-Augustin NICULESCU-ŢÂGÂRLAṢ
Mr Andi-Lucian CRISTEA	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	M. Ion PRIOTEASA
Ms Diana STOICA	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Mr Iulian BULAI
Mr Oleg ALEKSEEV	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Mr Denis GUSEV
Ms Alfiia KOGOGINA	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Ms Oksana PUSHKINA
Mr Vladimir KRUGLYI	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Mr Iaroslav NILOV
Mr Sergei PAKHOMOV	Russian Federation / Fédération de Russie	Mr Alexandr PROKOPIEV
Ms Marica MONTEMAGGI	San Marino / Saint-Marin	Mr Marco NICOLINI
Mr Enis IMAMOVIĆ	Serbia / Serbie	Mr Milan RADIN
Mr Zoran TOMIĆ	Serbia / Serbie	Mr Gojko PALALIĆ
Mme Anna ZÁBORSKÁ	Slovak Republic / République slovaque	Mr Juraj ŠELIGA
Ms Andreja ZABRET	Slovenia / Slovénie	Ms Suzana LEP ŠIMENKO
Mr Antón GÓMEZ-REINO	Spain / Espagne	Ms María Teresa JIMÉNEZ-BECERRIL
Ms Carmen LEYTE	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Mr Antonio GUTIÉRREZ LIMONES
Ms Susana SUMELZO	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Ms Esther PEÑA
Mr Alexander CHRISTIANSSON	Sweden / Suède	Mr Ola MÖLLER
Ms Carina OHLSSON	Sweden / Suède	ZZ
Ms Sibel ARSLAN	Switzerland / Suisse	M. Pierre-Alain FRIDEZ
M. Jean-Pierre GRIN	Switzerland / Suisse	Mme Ada MARRA
Ms Emine Nur GÜNAY	Turkey / <i>Turquie</i>	Mr Mehmet Mehdi EKER

Mr Halil ÖZŞAVLI	Turkey / Turquie	Ms Sena Nur ÇELİK
Mr Hişyar ÖZSOY	Turkey / Turquie	Ms Feleknas UCA
Ms Selin SAYEK BÖKE	Turkey / Turquie	M. Haluk KOÇ
Ms Olena KHOMENKO	Ukraine	Ms Larysa BILOZIR
Ms Yuliia OVCHYNNYKOVA	Ukraine	Mr Andrii LOPUSHANSKYI
Mr Artem DUBNOV	Ukraine	Ms Lesia ZABURANNA
Mr Richard BACON	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Mr Duncan BAKER
Mr Geraint DAVIES	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Mr Steve DOUBLE
Mr John HOWELL	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Mr Mark FLETCHER
Baroness Doreen E. MASSEY	United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni	Ms Ruth JONES

EMBASSIES / PERMANENT REPRESENTATIONS AND DELEGATIONS AMBASSADES / REPRESENTATIONS ET DELEGATIONS PERMANENTES

Ms / *Mme* Liudmyla Protasenko, Deputy to the Permanent Representative, Permanent Representation of Ukraine to the Council of Europe / *Adjointe au Représentant Permanent, Représentation permanente d'Ukraine auprès du Conseil de l'Europe*

SECRETARIAT OF DELEGATION OR OF POLITICAL GROUP / SECRETARIAT DE DELEGATION OU DE GROUPE POLITIQUE

Ms / *Mme* Karine Shimshiryan, Delegation Secretary, Armenian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation arménienne auprès de l'APCE

Ms / *Mme* Adisa Fišić-Barukčija Delegation Secretary, delegation of Bosnia and Herzegovina to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de la Bosnie-Herzégovine auprès de l'APCE

Ms / *Mme* Martina Petek-Stupar, Delegation Secretary, Croatian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, Délégation croate auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Elena Persiani, International Relations Officer, Cypriot delegation to PACE / Officier de relations internationales, Délégation chypriote auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Kamilla Kjelgaard, Delegation Secretary, Danish delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, Délégation danoise auprès de l'APCE

Ms / *Mme* Kristina Funk, Delegation Secretary, Estonian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation estonienne auprès de l'APCE

Mr / M. Michael Hilger, Permanent Secretariat, German delegation to PACE / Secrétariat permanent, délégation allemande auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Evangelia Spanoudaki, Greek delegation to PACE / Délégation grecque auprès de l'APCE

Ms / *Mme* Dorthe Bakke, Delegation Secretary, Norwegian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation norvégienne auprès de l'APCE

Ms / *Mme* Ana Guapo, Delegation Secretary, Portugese delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de Portugal auprès de l'APCE*

Mr / M. Razvan Tanase, Delegation Secretary, Romanian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de la Roumanie auprès de l'APCE

Mr / M. Pavel Ermoshin, Delegation Secretary, Russian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation russe auprès de l'APCE

Ms / *Mme* Maria Nikulina, Delegation Secretary, Russian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation russe auprès de l'APCE

Mr / M. Alexander Tarasov, Delegation Secretary, Russian delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation russe auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Johanna Ingvarsson, International Advisor, Swedish delegation to PACE / Conseillère internationale, délégation suédise auprès de l'APCE

Ms / *Mme* Arda Ozansoy, Delegation Secretary, Turkish delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation turque auprès de l'APCE

Mr / M. Yaron Gamburg, Delegation Secretary, Israeli delegation to PACE / Secrétaire de délégation, délégation israëlienne auprès de l'APCE

Ms / Mme Maria Bigday, Secretary of the Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe (ALDE) / Secrétaire de l'Alliance des démocrates et des libéraux pour l'Europe (ADLE)

Ms / Mme Francesca Arbogast, Secretary of the Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group (SOC) / Secrétaire du Groupe des socialistes, démocrates et verts (SOC)

Ms / Mme Anna Kolotova, Secretary of the Group of the Unified European Left (UEL) / Secrétaire du Groupe pour la gauche unitaire européenne (GUE)

Ms / Mme Marianna Ntalla, Assistant, Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group (SOC) / Assistante, Groupe des socialistes, démocrates et verts (SOC)

Ms / Mme Natalia Odzimkowska, Secretary of the European People's Party Group (EPP / CD) / Secrétaire du Groupe du Parti populaire européen (PPE/ DC)

Ms / *Mme* Denise O'Hara, Secretary of the Group of the European People's Party (EPP/CD) / Secrétaire du Groupe du parti populaire européen (PPE/DC)

EXPERTS / EXPERT(E)S

Mr / M. John Carr, expert on internet safety and security (United Kingdom) / expert sur la sureté et la sécurité internet (Royaume-Uni)

Ms / Mme Julie Miville-Dechêne, Senator, Senate of Canada / sénatrice, Sénat du Canada

Mr / M. Iain Corby, Executive Director, The Age Verification Providers Association (United Kingdom) / Directeur exécutif, Association de fournisseurs de vérification d'âge (Royaume-Uni)

OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANT.E.S

Ms / *Mme* Becky Burgess, The Age Verification Providers Association (United Kingdom) / *Association de fournisseurs de vérification d'âge (Royaume-Uni)*

Mr / M. George Billinge, The Age Verification Providers Association (United Kingdom) / Association de fournisseurs de vérification d'âge (Royaume-Uni)

Ms / Mme Bénédicte Colin, collaborator, Federation of Catholic Family Associations in Europe / collaboratrice, Fédération des Associations Familiales Catholiques (FAFCE)

COUNCIL OF EUROPE STAFF / SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Ms / Mme Charlotte Altenhöner-Dion, Advisor, Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights / Conseillère, Bureau du Commissaire aux droits de l'homme

Ms / *Mme* Natalia Zaytseva, Human Rights Directorate, Bioethics Unit / *Direction des Droits de l'Homme, Unité de Bioéthique*

Ms / Mme Greta Faieta, Trainee, Children's Rights Policies and Co-operation / Stagiaire, Politique des droits des enfants et coopération

<u>SECRETARIAT OF THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY /</u> <u>SECRÉTARIAT DE L'ASSEMBLÉE PARLEMENTAIRE</u>

Ms / Mme Marja Ruotanen, Director of Committees, Directorate II - Human Dignity and Sustainable Development / Directrice des commissions, Direction II - Dignité humaine et développement durable

Mr / M. Angus MacDonald, Administrative Officer, Communication Division / Administrateur, Division de la communication

Ms / Mme Nathalie Bargellini, Principal Administrative Assistant / Assistante administrative principale, Communication Division / Division de la communication

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development / Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

Ms / Mme Tanja Kleinsorge	Head of the Secretariat / Cheffe du Secrétariat
	Secretary to the Committee / Secrétaire de la commission
	Secretary to the Committee / Secrétaire de la commission
	Co-Secretary/ Co-Secrétaire
Mr / M. Guillaume Parent	Co-Secretary/ Co-Secrétaire
	Europe Prize section / Section Prix de l'Europe
Ms / Mme Melissa Charbonnel	Principal Assistant / Assistante Principale
Mr / M. Arturs Mietulis	Trainee / Stagiaire