



SECRETARIAT

AS/Cult (2016) CB 06

23 September 2016

To the members of the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media

Synopsis

of the meeting held in Kyiv, Ukraine, on 19 and 20 September 2016

The Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media, meeting in Kyiv with Mr Volodymyr Arieiev (Ukraine, EPP/CD) and Ms Adele Gambaro (Italy, ALDE) in the Chair,

- on Monday 19 September 2016 from 9 am to 5 pm:

heard an opening statement by Mr Andriy Parubiy, Chair of the *Verkhovna Rada* (Ukrainian Parliament);

as regards:

- **Attacks against journalists and media freedom in Europe** (*Rapporteur: Mr Volodymyr Arieiev, Ukraine, EPP/CD*): considered an information memorandum and held a hearing with Mr Ricardo Gutiérrez, Secretary General of the European Federation of Journalists (EFJ), Brussels; Ms Oksana Romaniuk, International Media Institute (IMI), Kyiv; Mr Igor Rozkladaj, Reanimation Reform Package (RPR), Kyiv; and Ms Anna Andrievska, Journalist, Crimea SOS;

- **The use of media for political purposes and war propaganda**: held a hearing with Mr Jeffrey Erlich, Senior Project Officer, OSCE office, Kyiv; Mr Yevhen Fedchenko, Stopfake.org, Kyiv; and Mr Jakub Kalenský, East StratCom Task Force, European External Action Service (EEAS), Brussels;

- **New methods of political influence over independent journalism** (*Rapporteur: Ms Vesna Marjanović, Serbia, SOC*): considered a report by Ms Margo Smit, Ombudsman at the Dutch public broadcaster NOS, Journalism teacher at the State University of Groningen, and held an exchange of views with the expert;

- **Parliamentary scrutiny over corruption: parliamentary co-operation with investigative media** (*Rapporteur: Ms Gülsün Bilgehan, Turkey, SOC*): considered a preliminary draft report and held a joint hearing for this topic and **Youth against corruption** (*Rapporteur: Ms Eleonora Cimbro, Italy, SOC*) with Mr Yuriy Lutsenko, General Prosecutor of Ukraine; Mr Ricardo Gutiérrez, Secretary General of the European Federation of Journalists (EFJ), Brussels; Ms Galyna Petrenko, Detector.media, Kyiv; and Ms Margo Smit, Ombudsman at the Dutch public broadcaster NOS, Journalism teacher at the State University of Groningen;

- on Tuesday 20 September 2016 from 9.30 am to 3 pm, as regards:

- **Technological convergence, artificial intelligence and human rights** (*Rapporteur: Mr Jean-Yves Le Déaut, France, SOC*): held a hearing with Mr Rinie van Est, Research coordinator, Rathenau Instituut, Netherlands; Mr Raja Chatila, Director, Institute of intelligent systems and robotics (*Institut des systèmes intelligents et de robotique (ISIR)*), University Pierre et Marie Curie, France; and Mr Dmytro Shymkiv, Deputy head of the Presidential Administration of Ukraine on administrative, social and economic reforms;

- **Online media and journalism: challenges and accountability** (*Rapporteur: Ms Adele Gambaro, Italy, ALDE*): considered a preliminary draft report;
- **References to the committee and appointment of rapporteurs:**
 - appointed Alexander, the Earl of Dundee (United Kingdom, EC) rapporteur on *The value of cultural heritage in a democratic society* (Doc. 14026), subject to his declaration of absence of conflict of interest;
 - appointed Mr Stefan Schennach (Austria, SOC) rapporteur on *New methods of political influence over independent journalism* (Doc. 13775) (to replace Ms Vesna Marjanović (Serbia, SOC) who resigned from her functions as rapporteur as she will cease to be member of PACE) and heard his declaration of absence of conflict of interests;
 - decided to postpone the appointment of the rapporteur for opinion on *Restricting rights to protect national security – how far can States go?* (Doc. 14044) and *Legal challenges arising from the hybrid war* (Doc. 14048);
 - decided to ask the Bureau of the Assembly to be seized for opinion on the report of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights on *Compatibility of Sharia law with the European Convention on Human Rights: can States Parties to the Convention be signatories of the “Cairo Declaration”?* (Doc. 13965);
- **Committee work programme:**

Appointment of the Rapporteur of the committee on the 2017 Council of Europe Museum Prize: appointed Ms Adele Gambaro (Italy, ALDE) as rapporteur (to replace Ms Vesna Marjanović (Serbia, SOC) who resigned from her functions as rapporteur as she will cease to be member of PACE) and heard her declaration of absence of conflict of interests;

Reports on recent events: was informed by:

- Mr Volodymyr Arieu (Ukraine, EPP/CD), rapporteur on *Attacks against journalists and media freedom in Europe*, on the conference on “Internet Freedom: a constant factor of democratic security in Europe” held in Strasbourg (9 September 2016), that Mr Andres Herkel (Estonia, EPP/CD), rapporteur on *Co-ordination for efficient Internet governance*, and himself attended;
- Mr Suat Önal (Turkey, EC), representative of the committee to the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), on the 70th plenary meeting of ECRI held in Strasbourg (28 June – 1 July 2016);

Approval of rapporteurs’ fact finding visits: subject to the availability of funds, approved the visit by Mr Volodymyr Arieu (Ukraine, EPP/CD), rapporteur on *Attacks against journalists and media freedom in Europe*, to Turkey (dates to be agreed with the host authorities);

Designation of representatives for forthcoming events: designated,

subject to the availability of funds:

- Mr Jean-Yves Le Déaut (France, SOC), General Rapporteur on Science and Technology Impact Assessment, to attend the workshop of the European Parliament on “Robotics and artificial intelligence - ethical issues and regulatory approach” in Brussels (17 October 2016);
- Mr Martin Poliačik (Slovak Republic, EC) to attend the PACE seminar on “Parliaments and Technology Assessment Capabilities” and the EPTA annual conference in Vienna (20-21 October 2016);
- Ms Adele Gambaro (Italy, ALDE), Rapporteur on the Council of Europe Museum Prize, to attend the meeting of the European Museum Forum Jury in Frankfurt, Germany (14-15 November 2016);

with no costs for the Assembly:

- Mr Stefan Schennach (Austria, SOC) to attend the PACE seminar on “Parliaments and Technology Assessment Capabilities” and the EPTA annual conference in Vienna (20-21 October 2016);

Sub-committees: took note that the Sub-Committee on Education, Youth and Sport will meet in Monaco on 3-4 November 2016;

- **Procedures for the adoption of reports in committees and in plenary session:** took note of an opinion adopted by the Committee on Rules of Procedure, Immunities and Institutional Affairs;

- **World Forum for Democracy – Strasbourg, 7-9 November 2016:** took note that, in addition to the members already designated, other members who would be interested to be designated as members of the *Ad Hoc* committee of the Assembly Bureau could inform the Secretariat;

- **Other business:**

- decided, following a proposal by the Chairperson, to hold a hearing on “religions and peace”, possibly at its next meeting;
- was informed by Ms Vesna Marjanović that a museum from Guadeloupe has applied as candidate for the 2017 Council of Europe Museum Prize and decided that this museum, which is a museum from France, is eligible as a candidate for the Museum Prize;

- **Next meetings:** decided to hold its next meetings as follows:

Strasbourg, 4th part-session (10-14 October 2016)
Paris, 8-9 December 2016

Roberto Fasino, Rüdiger Dossow, Dana Karanjac

cc: Secretary General of the Assembly
Director General, Director and all staff of the Secretariat of the Assembly
Secretaries of National Delegations and of Political Groups of the Assembly
Secretaries of observer and partner for democracy delegations
Secretary General of the Congress
Secretary to the Committee of Ministers
Directors General
Director of the Private Office of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe
Director of the Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights
Director of Communication
Permanent Representations to the Council of Europe