



SECRETARIAT

AS/Cult (2019) CB 01

24 January 2019

## To the members of the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media

### Synopsis

### of the meeting held in Strasbourg on 21, 22, 23 and 24 January 2019

The Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media, meeting in Strasbourg on 21, 22, 23 and 24 January 2019 with Lady Diana Eccles (United Kingdom, EC), senior member present, and then with Ms María Concepción de Santa Ana, (Spain, EPP/CD), Lord George Foulkes (United Kingdom, SOC), and Mr Andres Herkel (Estonia, EPP/CD) in the Chair,

#### Monday, 21 January 2019 from 2 pm to 3 pm, as regards:

- **Election of the Bureau of the Committee:** elected by acclamation:
  - Ms María Concepción de Santa Ana (Spain, EPP/CD) Chairperson,
  - Lord George Foulkes (United Kingdom, SOC) 1<sup>st</sup> Vice-Chairperson,
  - Mr Andres Herkel (Estonia, EPP/CD) 3<sup>rd</sup> Vice-Chairperson, in his absence;
- **References to the committee and appointment of rapporteurs:** appointed Mr Constantinos Efstathiou (Cyprus, SOC) rapporteur for opinion on “Compatibility of Sharia law with the European Convention on Human Rights: can States Parties to the Convention be signatories of the “Cairo Declaration”?” (Doc. 13965) and heard his declaration of absence of conflict of interest;
- **Compatibility of Sharia law with the European Convention on Human Rights: can States Parties to the Convention be signatories of the “Cairo Declaration”?** (*Rapporteur: Mr Constantinos Efstathiou, Cyprus, SOC*): adopted the opinion of the committee, including an amendment to the draft resolution;
- **Social media: social threads or threats to fundamental freedoms?** (*Rapporteur: Mr José Cepeda, Spain, SOC*): considered a draft report and decided to change the title of the report to “Social media: social threads or threats to human rights?”;
- **Replies from the Committee of Ministers:** took note of the reply from the Committee of Ministers (Doc. 14783) to Recommendation 2139 (2018) on “Deliberate destruction and illegal trafficking of cultural heritage” and asked the rapporteur, Mr Stefan Schennach, and the Sub-Committee on Culture, Diversity and Heritage to examine the reply, prepare an analysis with proposals of follow-up and report back to the committee;
- **Committee work programme:**

**Reports on recent meetings:** was informed by Mr Stefan Schennach (Austria, SOC), rapporteur for follow-up on “Deliberate destruction and illegal trafficking of cultural heritage”, on the seminar on “Fighting the illicit trafficking of cultural property” organised by UNESCO and the European Union in Paris, on 26 November 2018;

**Tuesday, 22 January 2019 from 2 pm to 3.30 pm, as regards:**

- **Media freedom as a condition for democratic elections** (*Rapporteur: Ms Gülsün Bilgehan, Turkey, SOC*): considered 17 amendments to the draft resolution;
- **Public service media in the context of disinformation and propaganda** (*Rapporteur: Mr Petri Honkonen, Finland, ALDE*): took note that there were no amendments to the draft resolution;
- **The value of cultural heritage in a democratic society** (*Rapporteur: Alexander [the Earl of] Dundee, United Kingdom, EC*): unanimously adopted a draft resolution and a draft recommendation and approved the report;
- **Follow-up of replies from the Committee of Ministers**: considered and agreed on the proposal of follow-up prepared by Mr Stefan Schennach (Austria, SOC), General Rapporteur on Science and Technology Impact Assessment, to the reply from the Committee of Ministers (Doc. 14432) to Recommendation 2102 (2017) on “Technological convergence, artificial intelligence and human rights”;

**Wednesday, 23 January 2019 from 2 pm to 3.30 pm, as regards:**

- **Other business**: decided to open its 2019 meetings to the elected representatives of the Turkish Cypriot Community;<sup>1</sup>
- **Internet governance and human rights** (*Rapporteur: Mr Andres Herkel, Estonie, EPP/CD*): took note that there were no amendments to the draft resolution;
- **Composition of sub-committees**: reconstituted its three sub-committees and approved their composition:<sup>2</sup>
  - Sub-Committee on Culture, Diversity and Heritage,
  - Sub-Committee on Education, Youth and Sport,
  - Sub-Committee on Media and Information Society;
- **Appointment of General Rapporteurs**: appointed:
  - Lord George Foulkes (United Kingdom, SOC) as General Rapporteur on Media Freedom and Safety of Journalists and heard his declaration of absence of conflict of interest;
- **Assembly’s institutional representation**: designated the following representatives to be appointed by the Bureau of the Assembly:
  - Mr Luís Leite Ramos (Portugal, EPP/CD) as representative and Ms Judith Pallarés (Andorra, ALDE) as substitute to the European Centre for Global Interdependence and Solidarity (North-South Centre),
  - Mr Constantinos Efstathiou (Cyprus, SOC) as representative to the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI),
  - Lady Diana Eccles (United Kingdom, EC) and Ms Nino Gogvadze (Georgia, EC) as representatives to the Council of Europe Committee for Works of Art (C-ART),
  - Mr Andries Gryffroy (Belgium, NR) as representative to Europa Nostra - Pan-European Federation for Heritage;
- **Committee work programme**:

**Extension of references**: decided to request to the Bureau of the Assembly to extend until 30 June 2019 the reference on *The role of education in the digital era: from “digital natives” to “digital citizens”* (Rapporteur: Mr Constantinos Efstathiou, Cyprus, SOC);

---

<sup>1</sup> In accordance with Resolution 1376 (2004).

<sup>2</sup> The composition appears in the appended lists as approved by the Committee during the January 2019 part-session.

- **Other business:**

- took note of the call for nominations for the 2019 Václav Havel Human Rights Prize,
- was informed by the Chairperson on the organisation of the meeting of the committee in Granada on 4 March 2019;

**Thursday, 24 January 2019 from 8.30 am to 10 am, as regards:**

- **Threats to media freedom and journalists' security in Europe** (*Rapporteur: Lord George Foulkes, United Kingdom, SOC*): held a hearing on "Public Service Media in transition: challenges to face and ways forward" with the participation of Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department, DGI - Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law, Council of Europe, Mr Boris Bergant, former Vice-president of the European Broadcasting Union (EBU), Slovenia, Mr Vadym Miskyi, Secretary of Supervisory Board of the National Public Broadcasting Company of Ukraine (UA:PBC), Ukraine, Mr Marko Filli, Representative of the *Radiotelevizija Slovenija* (RTV SLO), Slovenia, and Ms Monika Garbačiauskaitė-Budrienė, Director General, Lithuanian National Radio and Television (LRT), Lithuania;
- **Next meetings:** took note of the next meetings of the committee:
  - Granada, Spain, 4 March 2019,
  - Strasbourg, 2<sup>nd</sup> part-session (8-12 April 2019),
  - Paris, 27-28 May 2019 (*tbc*),
  - Strasbourg, 3<sup>rd</sup> part-session (24-28 June 2019),
  - Strasbourg, 4<sup>th</sup> part-session (30 September-4 October 2019),
  - Paris, 5-6 December 2019 (*tbc*).

\*\*\*

**The Sub-Committee on Culture, Diversity and Heritage** (of the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media), meeting in Strasbourg on 24 January 2019 from 2 pm to 2.30 pm with Mr Carlos Alberto Gonçalves (Portugal, EPP/CD), senior member present, and then with Ms Nino Goguadze (Georgia, EC) in the Chair,

as regards:

- **Composition of the bureau of the sub-committee:** elected by acclamation:
  - Ms Nino Goguadze (Georgia, EC) Chairperson,
  - Mr Andries Gryffroy (Belgium, NR) Vice-Chairperson, in his absence;
- **Next meeting:** decided to leave it to the Chairperson to convene the next meeting.

\*\*\*

**The Sub-Committee on Media and Information Society** (of the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media), meeting in Strasbourg on 24 January 2019 from 2.30 pm to 3 pm with Lord George Foulkes (United Kingdom, SOC), senior member present, and then with Ms Maura Hopkins (Ireland, EPP/CD) in the Chair,

as regards:

- **Composition of the bureau of the sub-committee:** elected by acclamation:
  - Mr Petri Honkonen (Finland, ALDE) Chairperson, in his absence,
  - Ms Maura Hopkins (Ireland, EPP/CD) Vice-Chairperson;
- **Next meeting:** decided to leave it to the Chairperson to convene the next meeting.

\*\*\*

**The Sub-Committee on Education, Youth and Sport** (of the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media), meeting in Strasbourg on 24 January 2019 from 3 pm to 3.30 pm with Lord George Foulkes (United Kingdom, SOC), senior member present, and then with Ms Judith Pallarés (Andorra, ALDE) in the Chair,

as regards:

- **Composition of the bureau of the sub-committee:** elected by acclamation:
  - Mr Georgios Mavrotas (Greece, SOC) Chairperson, in his absence,
  - Ms Judith Pallarés (Andorra, ALDE) Vice-Chairperson;
- **Next meeting:** decided to leave it to the Chairperson to convene the next meeting.

Roberto Fasino, Dana Karanjac, Eugen Cibotaru

---

cc: Secretary General of the Assembly  
Directors and all staff of the Secretariat of the Assembly  
Secretaries of National Delegations and of Political Groups of the Assembly  
Secretaries of observer and partner for democracy delegations  
Secretary General of the Congress  
Secretary to the Committee of Ministers  
Directors General  
Director of the Private Office of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe  
Director of the Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights  
Director of Communication  
Permanent Representations to the Council of Europe

## Appendix

Sub-Committee on Culture, Diversity and Heritage/  
Sous-commission de la culture, de la diversité et du patrimoine  
(27+1)

### Members / Titulaires

### Alternates / Remplaçants

#### Chairperson / Président(e)

GOGUADZE, Nino [Ms] Georgia

#### Vice-Chairperson / Vice-Président(e)

GRYFFROY, Andries [Mr] Belgium

#### Members / Membres

1. AYDIN, Kamil [Mr]	Turkey	ÇELİK, Sena Nur [Ms]
2. BRENNER, Koloman [Mr]	Hungary	
3. DUNDEE, Alexander, [The Earl of] [-]	United Kingdom	JONES, Susan Elan [Ms]
4. ECCLES, Diana [Lady]	United Kingdom	
5. EFSTATHIOU, Constantinos [M.]	Cyprus	LOUCAIDES, George [Mr]
6. FOURNIER, Bernard [M.]	France	
7. GOGUADZE, Nino [Ms]	Georgia	
8. GONÇALVES, Carlos Alberto [Mr]	Portugal	
9. GRYFFROY, Andries [Mr]	Belgium	VERCAMER, Stefaan [Mr]
10. HUSEYNOV, Rafael [Mr]	Azerbaijan	
11. IGITYAN, Hovhannes [Mr]	Armenia	
12. KLEINWAECHTER, Norbert [Mr]	Germany	RÖSSNER, Tabea [Ms]
13. LEITE RAMOS, Luís [Mr]	Portugal	
14. MANIERO, Alvise [Mr]	Italy	
15. MOTSCHMANN, Elisabeth [Ms]	Germany	HARDT, Jürgen [Mr]
16. MUTSCH, Lydia [Mme]	Luxembourg	
17. O'REILLY, Joseph [Mr]	Ireland	
18. POPA, Ion [Mr]	Romania	NICOLAE, Andrei [Mr]
19. PUTICA, Sanja [Ms]	Croatia	
20. SCHENNACH, Stefan [Mr]	Austria	
21. SORRE, Bertrand [M.]	France	
22. STAFFLER, Katrin [Ms]	Germany	KUHLE, Konstantin [Mr]
23. TILKI, Attila [Mr]	Hungary	
24. TORNARE, Manuel [M.]	Suisse	COMTE, Raphaël [M.]
25. XUCLÀ, Jordi [Mr]	Spain	

#### Ex-Officio

de SANTA ANA, María Concepción [Ms] Spain

Sub-Committee on Education, Youth and Sport/  
Sous-commission de l'éducation, de la jeunesse et du sport  
(27+1)

**Members / Titulaires**

**Alternates / Remplaçants**

**Chairperson / Président(e)**

MAVROTAS, Georgios [Mr] Greece

**Vice-Chairperson / Vice-Président(e)**

PALLARÉS, Judith [Ms] Andorra

**Members / Membres**

- |  |                |                                      |
|--|----------------|--------------------------------------|
| 1. BERLINGHIERI, Marina [Ms]             | Italy          |                                      |
| 2. BLANCHART, Philippe [M.]              | Belgium        | VAN DEN DRIESSCHE, Pol [Mr]          |
| 3. CEPEDA, José [Mr]                     | Spain          |                                      |
| 4. EFSTATHIOU, Constantinos [M.]         | Cyprus         | LOUCAIDES, George [Mr]               |
| 5. FOULKES, George [Lord]                | United Kingdom | DUNDEE, Alexander, [The Earl of] [-] |
| 6. GONÇALVES, Carlos Alberto [Mr]        | Portugal       |                                      |
| 7. GORGHIU, Alina Ștefania [Ms]          | Romania        | DUMITRESCU, Cristian-Sorin [Mr]      |
| 8. HOPKINS, Maura [Ms]                   | Ireland        |                                      |
| 9. HUSEYNOV, Rafael [Mr]                 | Azerbaijan     |                                      |
| 10. JANIK Grzegorz [Mr]                  | Poland         | ARENT, Iwona [Ms]                    |
| 11. JENSEN, Mogens [Mr]                  | Denmark        |                                      |
| 12. KERN, Claude [M.]                    | France         |                                      |
| 13. KNEŽEVIĆ, Milan [Mr]                 | Montenegro     |                                      |
| 14. KUHLE, Konstantin [Mr]               | Germany        |                                      |
| 15. LORSCHÉ, Josée [Mme]                 | Luxembourg     |                                      |
| 16. MAVROTAS, Georgios [Mr]              | Greece         |                                      |
| 17. MÖLLER, Ola [Ms]                     | Sweden         |                                      |
| 18. NOVAK, Ljudmila [Ms]                 | Slovenia       |                                      |
| 19. OBRADOVIĆ, Žarko [Mr]                | Serbia         |                                      |
| 20. PALLARÉS, Judith [Ms]                | Andorra        |                                      |
| 21. PUTICA, Sanja [Ms]                   | Croatia        |                                      |
| 22. REISS, Frédéric [M.]                 | France         |                                      |
| 23. SCHÄFER, Axel [Mr]                   | Germany        | KLEINWAECHTER, Norbert [Mr]          |
| 24. SCHNEIDER-SCHNEITER, Elisabeth [Mme] | Suisse         | BÜCHEL, Roland Rino [M.]             |
| 25. SIDALI, Zeki Hakan [Mr]              | Turkey         | AYDIN, Kamil [Mr]                    |
| 26. SORRE, Bertrand [M.]                 | France         |                                      |
| 27. WALLINHEIMO, Sinuhe [Mr]             | Finland        |                                      |

**Ex-Officio / Ex-Officio**

de SANTA ANA, María Concepción [Ms] Spain

Sub-Committee on Media and Information Society/  
Sous-commission des médias et de la société de l'information  
(27+1)

**Members / Titulaires**

**Alternates / Remplaçants**

**Chairperson / Président(e)**

HONKONEN, Petri [Mr] Finland

**Vice-Chairperson / Vice-Président(e)**

HOPKINS, Maura [Ms] Ireland

**Members / Membres**

1.	ARENT, Iwona [Ms]	Poland	JANIK Grzegorz [Mr]
2.	AVETISYAN, Sos [Mr]	Armenia	IGITYAN, Hovhannes [Mr]
3.	BARDELL, Hannah [Ms]	United Kingdom	JONES, Susan Elan [Ms]
4.	BENNING, Sybille [Ms]	Germany	SCHÄFER, Axel [Mr]
5.	BERTI, Francesco [Mr]	Italy	
6.	CEPEDA, José [Mr]	Spain	
7.	EMRE, Yunus [Mr]	Turkey	SIDALI, Zeki Hakan [Mr]
8.	ENGBLOM, Annicka [Ms]	Sweden	
9.	FOULKES, George [Lord]	United Kingdom	
10.	GOGUADZE, Nino [Ms]	Georgia	
11.	HONKONEN, Petri [Mr]	Finland	
12.	HOPKINS, Maura [Ms]	Ireland	
13.	JENSEN, Mogens [Mr]	Denmark	JØRGENSEN, Jan E. [Mr]
14.	KNEŽEVIĆ, Milan [Mr]	Montenegro	
15.	MUTSCH, Lydia [Mme]	Luxembourg	
16.	PLEȘOIANU, Liviu Ioan Adrian [Mr]	Romania	TUȘA, Adriana Diana [Ms]
17.	REISS, Frédéric [M.]	France	KERN, Claude [M.]
18.	ROCA, Jordi [Mr]	Spain	
19.	ROJHAN GUSTAFSSON Azadeh [Ms]	Sweden	
20.	SCHENNACH, Stefan [Mr]	Austria	
21.	TAQUET, Adrien [M.]	France	BECHT, Olivier [M.]
22.	TORNARE, Manuel [M.]	Suisse	BÜCHEL, Roland Rino [M.]
23.	VAN DEN DRIESSCHE, Pol [Mr]	Belgium	GRYFFROY, Andries [Mr]

**Ex-Officio / Ex-Officio**

de SANTA ANA, María Concepción [Ms] Spain