



SECRETARIAT

AS/Cult (2019) CB 06

4 October 2019

To the members of the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media

Synopsis

of the meeting held in Strasbourg on 30 September, 1 and 3 October 2019

The Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media, meeting in Strasbourg on 30 September, 1 and 3 October 2019 with Lord George Foulkes (United Kingdom, SOC) and Mr Bernard Fournier (France, EPP/CD) in the Chair,

Monday, 30 September 2019 from 2 pm to 2.40 pm, as regards:

- **Media education in the new media environment** (*Rapporteur: Ms Nino Gogvadze, Georgia, EC/DA*): took note of the explanatory memorandum, then unanimously adopted a draft resolution, thereby adopting the report;
- **Strengthening the role of young people in the prevention and resolution of conflicts** (*Rapporteur: Ms Inka Hopsu, Finland, SOC*): heard a declaration of absence of conflict of interest from the rapporteur and held a hearing with the participation of Mr Nikola Puharić, Croatia, Mr Ivan Djuric, Serbia, Mr Bojan Stanković, Serbia, Ms Marigona Shabiu, Kosovo¹, and Ms Edina Hasanaga Cobaj, Montenegro, representatives of the NGO Youth initiative for human rights (YIHR), winner (*ex-aequo* with Ilham Tohti) of the 2019 Vaclav Havel Human Rights Prize;

Tuesday, 1 October 2019 from 8.30 am to 10 am, as regards:

- **Threats to media freedom and journalists' security in Europe** (*Rapporteur: Lord George Foulkes, United Kingdom, SOC*): considered a preliminary draft report;
- **Committee work programme:**

Draft motions of resolutions and recommendations: adopted the two following motions for resolutions (texts in addendum), with the requisite quorum as defined in Rule 47.3:

- The role of culture and education in a new technological era, presented by Mr Constantinos Efstathiou (Cyprus, SOC),
- Transmission of traditional crafts and heritage related skills, presented by Mr Andries Gryffroy (Belgium, NR);
- **Artificial intelligence: the role of culture and education in the new technological era:** held an exchange of views with the participation of Mr Vladan Joler, Professor at the New Media department of the University of Novi Sad and co-founder of SHARE Foundation, Serbia; and Mr Vuk Ćosić, Expert on AI, culture and creativity, Slovenia;

¹ Throughout this text, all reference to Kosovo, whether to the territory, institutions or population shall be understood in full compliance with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 and without prejudice to the status of Kosovo.

- **Composition of sub-committees:** approved the following changes:

Sub-Committee on Culture, Diversity and Heritage:

- Mr Bob de Brabandere (Belgium, NR) becomes the alternate to Mr Andries Gryffroy (Belgium, NR),
- Mr Evaristos Stylianidis (Greece, EPP/CD) becomes member and Ms Foteini Pipili (Greece, EPP/CD) becomes his alternate;

Sub-Committee on Education, Youth and Sport:

- Mr Sos Avetisyan (Armenia, SOC) becomes member;
- Mr Andries Gryffroy (Belgium, NR) becomes member and Mr Christophe Lacroix (Belgium, SOC) becomes his alternate,
- Mr Theodoros Rousopoulos (Greece, EPP/CD) becomes member and Mr Alexandros Triantafyllidis (Greece, UEL) becomes his alternate;

Sub-Committee on Media and Information Society:

- Ms Karin Brouwers (Belgium EPP/CD) becomes member and Mr Bob de Brabandere (Belgium, NR) becomes her alternate,
- Mr Alexandros Triantafyllidis (Greece, UEL) becomes member and Mr Theodoros Rousopoulos (Greece, EPP/CD) becomes his alternate;

Tuesday, 1 October 2019 from 5.30 pm to 7 pm, as regards:

- **World Forum for Democracy (Strasbourg, 6-8 November 2019):** took note of the dates of the next World Forum for Democracy on the theme of “Information and democracy” which will be held on 6-8 November 2019 in Strasbourg;
- **Time to act: Europe’s political response to fighting the manipulation of sports competitions (Rapporteur: Mr Roland Rino Büchel, Switzerland, ALDE):** held a hearing with the participation of Mr Vincent Ven, Head of Integrity, International Federation of Association Football (FIFA), Zürich, Switzerland; Mr João Paulo Almeida, Director General, National Olympic Committee of Portugal, Lisbon; Mr Claudio Marinelli, Criminal Intelligence Officer, Anti-Corruption Office of the Organised and Emerging Crime Directorate, Interpol, Lyon, France (via video-conference); Mr Coretin Segalen, Coordinator of the French National Platform, French Online Gaming Regulatory Authority (ARJEL) Paris; and Mr Giancarlo Sergi, Secretary General, Global Lottery Monitoring System (GLMS) and President of the Swiss Basketball Federation, Lausanne, Switzerland;

Thursday, 3 October 2019 from 8.30 am to 10 am, as regards:

- **Election of the Bureau of the committee:** elected by acclamation Mr Frédéric Reiss (France, EPP/CD) Chairperson, in his absence;
- **Council of Europe Museum Prize:** appointed Mr Roberto Rampi (Italy, SOC) as Representative of the committee for the Museum Prize 2020;
- **Committee work programme:**

References to the committee and appointment of rapporteurs: appointed Lord George Foulkes (United Kingdom, SOC) rapporteur on “Football governance and ethics: business or values?” (Doc. 14447), and heard his declaration of absence of conflict of interest;

Extension of references: decided to ask to the Bureau of the Assembly for the extension of the validity of the following references:

- “Threats to academic freedom and autonomy of universities in Europe” (Doc. 14365) (Rapporteur: Mr Koloman Brenner, Hungary, NR) until 30 April 2020,
- “Football governance and ethics: business or values” (Doc. 14447) (Rapporteur: Lord George Foulkes, United Kingdom, SOC) until 31 December 2020;
- **New forms of public debate on the ethical aspects of rapid advances in science and technology (Rapporteur: Mr Stefan Schennach, Austria, SOC):** considered an expert report and an information document with case studies;

- **Other business:** appointed Mr Stefan Schennach (Austria, SOC) to represent the committee on Friday, 4 October morning, at the Assembly debate on “Jewish cultural heritage preservation” (Rapporteur: Mr Raphaël Comte, Switzerland, ALDE);
- **Threats to academic freedom and autonomy of universities in Europe** (Rapporteur: M. Koloman Brenner, Hongrie, NR): considered an expert report and held a hearing with the participation of Mr Terence Karran, Senior Academic and Director of Research, School of Education, University of Lincoln, United Kingdom (via video-conference); Mr Liviu Matei, Provost of the Central European University, Budapest (via video-conference); and Mr Tony Gallagher, Acting Dean of Research, Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Queen's University Belfast;

Thursday 3 October 2019 from 2 pm to 2.30 pm, as regards

- **Jewish cultural heritage preservation** (Rapporteur: Mr Raphaël Comte, Switzerland, ALDE): took note that there were no amendments to the draft resolution and the draft recommendation;

- **Replies from the Committee of Ministers:**

- considered the proposals of follow-up of the reply from the Committee of Ministers (Doc. 14893) to the Recommendation 2144 (2019) “Internet governance and human rights”, submitted by the Sub-Committee on Media and Information Society,
- took note of the reply from the Committee of Ministers (Doc. 14962) to the Recommendation 2149 (2019) “The value of cultural heritage in a democratic society” and asked the rapporteur, Lord Alexander Dundee (United Kingdom, EC/DA) and the Sub-committee on Culture, Diversity and Heritage to prepare an analysis with proposals of follow-up, as required, and to report back to the committee;

- **Committee work programme:**

Appointment of representatives for forthcoming events:

appointed, at no costs for the Assembly:

- Mr Luís Leite Ramos (Portugal, EPP/CD), Assembly representative to the European Centre for interdependence and worldwide solidarity (North-South Centre), to participate in the Lisbon Forum 2019 of the North South Centre, on 28-29 November 2019 in Lisbon;

appointed, subject to the availability of funds:

- Mr Roland Rino Büchel (Switzerland, ALDE), Rapporteur on “Time to act: Europe’s political response to fighting the manipulation of sports competitions”, to participate in a meeting of a restraint committee with members of the European parliament, on 25 November 2019, and in the Conference “EU sports diplomacy: prospects for cooperation with international organisations”, on 26 November 2019, in Strasbourg,
- Mr Roberto Rampi (Italy, SOC), Representative of the committee for the Council of Europe Museum Prize, to participate at the meeting of the Jury of the European Museum Forum (EMF), on 22-23 November 2019 at Portimão, Portugal;

- **Next meetings:** took note of the next meeting of the committee which will be held on 5-6 December 2019 in Paris.

The Sub-Committee on Media and Information Society (of the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media) meeting in Strasbourg on 2 October 2019 from 2 pm to 3 pm, with Lord George Foulkes (United Kingdom, SOC) in the Chair, as regards:

- **Election of the Bureau of the sub-committee:** elected by acclamation Ms Maura Hopkins (Ireland, EPP/CD) Chairperson, in her absence;

- **Work programme of the sub-committee and future priorities:** considered the future priorities of the sub-committee and held an exchange of views with the participation of Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of the Information Society Department, DGI - Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law, Council of Europe;
- **Follow-up of the Replies from the Committee of Ministers:** considered the analysis of the reply from the Committee of Ministers ([Doc. 14893](#)) to the [Recommendation 2144 \(2019\)](#) "Internet governance and human rights" and decided to submit the proposals of follow-up to the committee;
- **Next meeting:** decided to leave it to the Chairperson to convene the next meeting.

Roberto Fasino, Ivi-Triin Odrats, Dana Karanjac, Eugen Cibotaru

cc: Secretary General of the Assembly
Directors and all staff of the Secretariat of the Assembly
Secretaries of National Delegations and of Political Groups of the Assembly
Secretaries of observer and partner for democracy delegations
Secretary General of the Congress
Secretary to the Committee of Ministers
Directors General
Director of the Private Office of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe
Director of the Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights
Director of Communication
Permanent Representations to the Council of Europe

Appendix

Doc. ...

... October 2019

Transmission of traditional crafts and heritage related skills

Motion for a resolution

Tabled by the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media, in compliance with the Rule 25.2

This motion has not been discussed in the Assembly and commits only those who have signed it

Industrialisation, urban development, mass tourism, the standardisation of lifestyles and of the various forms of knowledge and skills, all constitute a context which places heritage related skills and traditional crafts in a vulnerable position.

In the follow-up to the PACE Resolution 2269 and Recommendation 2148 (2019) on "*Safeguarding and enhancing intangible cultural heritage in Europe*", the Assembly could consider specific measures and incentives that are needed to sustain traditional crafts but also to help them to be open to innovation and the use of new technologies. The aim should be to enable traditional crafts to develop and evolve with the times, and not to rigidly entrench age-old practices seeking to shield this area of intangible cultural heritage.

Crafts offer a huge repository of skills. The "maker movement" has opened up new spaces that use technologies and creativity to repair, revise and refashion products, as well as to make new products. Adequate training or education are required to ensure the preservation and transmission of those skills, but also to widen their range, so that they can be a resource for the future, and for innovation.

The Assembly could recommend expanding the ongoing activities under the European Heritage Strategy for the 21st century and the Council of Europe Framework Convention on the Value of Cultural Heritage for Society (Faro Convention) to assist member States in this field.

The role of culture and education in a new technological era

Motion for a resolution

Tabled by the Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media, in compliance with the Rule 25.2

This motion has not been discussed in the Assembly and commits only those who have signed it

New technologies and their applications are blurring the boundaries between human and machine, between online and offline activities, between the physical and the virtual world, and between the natural and the artificial. They raise some fundamental questions: what is human? What are the boundaries to be respected to preserve what we can define as human? What kind of society do we want for the future and how to prepare the cohabitation of humankind with intelligent machines? Citizens ought to take an active part in replying to these fundamental issues and not be subject to corporate interests.

In the follow up to the PACE Recommendation 2102 (2017) on "*Technological convergence, artificial intelligence and human rights*", the Assembly should explore ways to reinforce individual capacity to engage in a wider reflection not only with the view to regulate the advancements of science and technology and their implementation, but more fundamentally to question - early on in the process - their essence, their direction and whether they are acceptable and beneficial to society as a whole.

Cultural and educational sectors - including individual artists, cultural activists, associations, cultural institutions and schools - have a key role to play in this context, by stimulating critical thinking and ethical analysis in this new technological era which would be so fundamental for citizens, and particularly young people, to address numerous challenges in the form of a continuous, open and informed debate.

Specific guidelines to assist and stimulate culture and educational sectors in this important task, should be developed, building on the Council of Europe *acquis* in these domains, and in particular the Framework of Competences for Democratic Culture.