Parliamentary Assembly
Assemblée parlementaire

COUNCIL OF EUROPE CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Parliamentary **Assembly**
Assemblée parlementaire

For debate in the Standing Committee — see Rule 15 of the Rules of Procedure

Doc. 10869
7 April 2006

Cultural diversity of the North Caucasus

Report
Committee on Culture, Science and Education
Rapporteur : Mrs Anne Brasseur, Luxembourg, Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe

Summary

The North Caucasus, is a unique region of the Russian Federation where, in a limited area, a great number of people and ethnic groups cohabit with their different languages, religions and cultures.

This cultural diversity can be a source of conflict, but it can also contribute to regional stability if emphasis is placed on intercultural and inter-religious dialogue, on respect for national identities and on the promotion of cultures and languages.

It is recommended that the Committee of Ministers and the Government of the Russian Federation develop, in close co-operation, a medium and long term strategy for cultural and educational policies for the North Caucasus that take account of the multi-ethnic and multi-faith characteristics of the region, in the framework of respect for human rights, while also drawing on experiences elsewhere in Europe.

A. Draft recommendation

1. In the Russian Federation, the North Caucasus is a geographical, cultural, historical and linguistic area in which over forty peoples with different cultures and religions have settled and co-exist. Their religions include Islam (Sunni, Shiite), Christianity (Orthodox, Monophysitic), Judaism and Buddhism, and they speak a multitude of languages of various origins.

2. The region comprises the following seven republics: Adygea, Karachaevo-Cherkessia, Kabardino-Balkaria, North Ossetia-Alania, Ingushetia, Chechnya and Dagestan.

3. The identity-related, ethnic and religious situation and its exploitation by neighbouring states with varying degrees of interests in the region, the lack of genuine traditions of political democracy, the high level of corruption and nepotism, the systematic neglect of problems concerning culture and education and a lack of intercultural and interfaith dialogue have made this a region of instability and, as a result, of violence.

4. Since the break-up of the Soviet Union, we have seen the weakening and, in some cases, complete breakdown of the political, economic, cultural and human links between the peoples of the North Caucasus in general and, more particularly, between the representatives of the cultural milieu, writers, teachers and researchers in the region. This state of affairs has had, and is continuing to have, a negative impact.

5. The North Caucasus is still a region with a very high level of secondary and higher education, with many academic research centres, including in the human sciences. It is a region in which a good education for their children matters to families and is a source of pride for parents and grandparents, regardless of their standard of living, social class, nationality or religion. Each of the republics of the North Caucasus has a well-developed infrastructure of cultural establishments, museums, libraries and sports centres.

6. The Assembly would like the Russian federal and regional authorities to acknowledge the medium and long-term importance of culture and education, cultural diversity and intercultural and interfaith dialogue as a possible basis for stability and democratisation in the North Caucasus region.

7. In this connection, it welcomes the initiative taken by the Russian Ministry of Culture and Communications and Ministry of Education and Science in organising in 2005, in close co-operation with the Russian President's special representative for the regions of Southern Russia, conferences of the ministers of culture and education of the North Caucasus and Southern Russia with the aim of co-ordinating more effectively the activities of the various organs of government in the region.

8. The Parliamentary Assembly nevertheless regrets that the federal and regional cultural and educational policies have not yet taken sufficient account of the multi-ethnic characteristics of this region.

9. It is essential to develop transfrontier cultural co-operation by organising various cultural events between the republics of the North Caucasus and with the regions of Southern Russia and the Southern Caucasus States.

10. The problem of financing culture and education remains serious in spite of the federal government's recent efforts to increase wages and improve social conditions in these areas. The authorities could pay more attention to financing the fields of culture and education, especially in the multicultural and multi-faith regions.

11. The Parliamentary Assembly strongly condemns religious fanaticism and the use of cultural identities for terrorist purposes. In this connection, it refers to its Recommendation 1687(2004) on combating terrorism through culture. It repeats that it is necessary to promote interfaith dialogue, especially in youth circles, which are often prey to religious extremists from outside.

12. The Assembly stresses the need to preserve and develop the languages of the peoples of the North Caucasus and to encourage the learning of the Russian language, as the official language

of the state, and foreign languages. It points out that Russia signed the European Charter for Regional and Minority Languages in 2001 but has not yet ratified it, and it urges the country's authorities to speed up the ratification process.

13. The Assembly welcomes the initiatives of the Council of Europe and the European Commission for the region but considers that such initiatives should not be limited to Chechnya.

14. Consequently, the Parliamentary Assembly recommends that the Committee of Ministers:

14.1. develop, in close co-operation with Russia, a medium and long-term strategy for cultural and educational policies for the North Caucasus with both federal and regional dimensions that take account of the multi-ethnic and multi-faith characteristics of this region, in the framework of respect for human rights and drawing on experiences elsewhere in Europe;

14.2. examine the possibility of launching a new programme for the Caucasus by drawing on the positive experience of the STAGE programme for the three countries of the Southern Caucasus;

14.3. focus attention on the organisation of training seminars and other cultural and/or educational activities in the North Caucasus region, within the framework of the co-operation programmes between the Council of Europe and the Russian Federation;

14.4. encourage the drawing up of a textbook on the history of the peoples of the North Caucasus;

14.5. consider the case for involving the region in the Council of Europe's assistance and co-operation programmes, including the joint programmes with the European Union for the development of cultural tourism, for promoting its heritage in the rest of Europe and for job creation;

15. The Assembly calls on the authorities of the Russian Federation to:

15.1. introduce the history of the peoples of the North Caucasus into the curriculum of the history courses taught at educational establishments in the republics of the North Caucasus and Southern Russia as well as in other regions;

15.2. promote a knowledge of the different religions and foster a culture of tolerance, especially among the younger generation in the region, in the spirit of its Recommendation 1720(2005) on education and religion;

15.3. set about organising a parliamentary forum with representatives of the cultural and educational sectors and the various faiths in the republics of the North Caucasus, in order to develop trust-building measures for the region;

15.4. encourage exchanges of students, trainees and lecturers between higher education establishments in the North Caucasus and other Russian regions;

15.5. encourage twinning arrangements between the museums and libraries of the republics of the North Caucasus and Southern Russia, as well as with those in European countries and to launch joint projects such as exhibitions, cultural routes, and youth and student festivals;

15.6. promote at regional level the production of television and radio broadcasts on cultural and religious diversity, languages, literature and traditions of the peoples of the North Caucasus;

15.7. consider the possibility of granting tax benefits to businesses and companies in the area for the funding of cultural and educational projects, sponsorship schemes or other suitable forms of partnership with the private sector.

B. Explanatory memorandum by Mrs Brasseur

I. General background

1. In October 2004, several members of the Parliamentary Assembly presented a motion for a recommendation with a view to preparing a report on the cultural diversity of the North Caucasus.

2. The North Caucasus region of the Russian Federation, with 6.5 million inhabitants, comprises the following republics: Adygea, Karachaevo-Cherkessia, Kabardino-Balkaria, North Ossetia-Alania, Ingushetia, Chechnya[1] and Dagestan (see Appendix 1: map of the North Caucasus).

3. It is a unique geographical, cultural, historical and linguistic region in which over forty indigenous peoples with different cultures and religions have settled and co-exist. There are numerous diasporas of peoples from the Southern Caucasus. It is a region of immense cultural wealth and diversity and its peoples speak some forty languages and dialects (see Appendix 2: The languages of the Caucasus) belonging to the following language families: Indo-European (Ossetian), Caucasian (Adyghe, Avar, Dargin, Ingush, Kabardian, Chechen, Cherkessian and others) and Altaic (Balkar, Karachay). The inhabitants belong to six religions: Judaism, Buddhism (the Kalmyk people), Christianity (Orthodox, Monophysitic) and Islam (Sunni, Shiite).

4. There is no other region in Russia or Eurasia in general in which so many peoples and ethnic groups with their various languages and cultures live together in such a small area.

II. Historical background

5. The peoples of the North Caucasus – of Turkic, Caucasian, Mongolian, Indo-European and Semitic origin – live alongside each other in an isolated and mountainous region that has often served to preserve these multiple identities. The region can be divided into two parts: a relatively peaceful area in the west and an area that has been marked by unrest since the beginning of the 19th century, in particular Chechnya, Ingushetia and Dagestan.

6. The Russian presence in the plains of the North Caucasus dates from the 12th century, but it was from the 18th century onwards under Peter the Great that Russia conducted several wars against Persia and the Ottoman Empire and succeeded in imposing its control over this region. In 1774, Russia signed with the Ottoman Empire the Treaty of Kuchuk-Kainarji, under which the Ottoman Empire recognised that the territories in the North Caucasus plain belonged to imperial Russia.

7. This region is affected by a number of micro-crises, the most highly publicised being the one in Chechnya. In the North Caucasus, ethnic tensions are compounded by religious factors.

8. There is considerable tension between the Chechens and the Ingushetians and between the Dagestanis and the Chechens. There are also conflicts between the Ossetians and the Ingushetians and the Ossetians and the Georgians The Ossetians are Iranian in origin, while the Ingushetians are a Caucasian people. The tensions were heightened by the federal boundaries drawn in the Soviet Union by Stalin in 1937, as he contrived to group peoples of Turkic origins together with peoples of Caucasian origin in every politico-administrative entity (autonomous republic).

9. The situation deteriorated even more for some peoples in the North Caucasus in 1941 following the German invasion of the USSR. German espionage succeeded in infiltrating, at least superficially, certain Muslim communities in the region, and the Soviet authorities believed that Turkey might join forces with Hitler and invade the Caucasus.

[1] Until 1991, Chechnya and Ingushetia formed a single republic.

10. As a result, the Soviet authorities decided to carry out the mass deportation of over 1.5 million people, all of them Muslims, to Central Asia. Between November 1943 and March 1944, the Karachais, Balkarians, Chechens, Ingushetians and Meskhetians were deported. This great tragedy scarred the spirit of the people concerned. In 1956, Nikita Khrushchev granted an amnesty to the victims of Stalin and Beria and allowed them to return home. In the meantime, however, some regions had been repopulated.

III. Religious background

(See Appendix 3: The religions of the Caucasus)

11. As far as religions are concerned, even though tensions between the representatives of the various religious communities are rare in the region, religion has become a very strong factor in the national identities of the peoples of the North Caucasus since the religious renaissance following 70 years of atheism under the Soviet regime.

12. Most of the ethnic groups in the North Caucasus are Muslims, with the exception of the Ossetians and Abkhaz (about 20-30% of the Abkhaz are Muslims). The Muslims in the region are mainly Sunnis. There are three large Islamic centres in the North Caucasus: Dagestan, Chechnya and Karachaevo-Cherkessia.

13. Dagestan was Islamised in the 10^{th}-12^{th} centuries, and Muslim traditions are very much present in the daily life of the inhabitants. More than half the region's mosques are in Dagestan, and it was through Dagestan's brotherhoods that Islam was brought to Chechnya and Ingushetia. Dagestan, therefore, can be seen as a centre of traditional Islam in the North Caucasus.

14. Although, in 1910, there were about 1,700 mosques in Dagestan catering for a population of some 700,000, during the Soviet period the number declined almost 15 times and there were only 27 mosques for the 1.6 million inhabitants in 1980. Today, religion is taking its place once again in people's lives. According to official data for 2002, there were 1,758 mosques for over 2.5 million inhabitants in Dagestan. As regards the situation in the other religions, the Russian Orthodox Church, for example, had 12 parishes for about 120,000 inhabitants.

15. The second centre of Islam in the region is Chechnya, even though the Chechens are the youngest Muslim people in the Russian Federation, having been Islamised at the end of the 18th and beginning of the 19th century. This recent Islamisation is probably one of the reasons for Chechen radicalism from the point of view of the practice of Islam and receptiveness to new doctrines – for example Wahhabism, which was able to take root more easily and, in particular, more rapidly in Chechnya than in Dagestan.

16. Wahhabism is the religious doctrine of Saudi Arabia and is based on a very strict interpretation of Islam, namely the application of the sharia in its entirety. Chechnya has become a centre of radical Islam over the last decade, and this radicalism has gradually spread to the other republics.

17. The Republic of Karachaevo-Cherkessia is the third centre of Islam in the region. The Karachais, Kabardians and Cherkessians practise a more traditional Islam with ancient Christian and pagan customs. It is probably thanks to religion that the Karachais have succeeded in retaining their identity, isolated in the mountains from their Adyghe neighbours.

18. As regards the other religions, especially the Orthodox Christians, the number of parishes in the region was at most a few dozen in the 1980s owing to the anti-religious policy of the Soviet regime. The end of the 1980s saw a re-emergence of the churches, synagogues and Buddhist cultural sites in the region. For example, the Russian Orthodox Church has more than 90 parishes for the entire North Caucasus region, the Catholic Church has 21 parishes and the Jewish faith has 17 synagogues.

19. In the area of interfaith dialogue, the archbishop for the regions of southern Russia is preparing, in partnership with other players, a major event involving young members of the Orthodox and Muslim faiths in southern Russia. The Council of Europe should be associated with this event.

Religion is not taught at school because schools are secular, but under a directive issued by the Ministry for Education, pupils can be taught the basic principles of the various religions as an optional subject, provided their parents give their consent.

IV. Current situation

20. Since the break-up of the Soviet Union the region has been marred by violence and political instability, due in part to the systematic neglect of education and a lack of intercultural and interfaith dialogue between the republics of the North Caucasus.

21. Since the early 1990s, we have seen the weakening and, in some cases, complete breakdown of the political, economic, cultural and human relations between the peoples of the North Caucasus in general and, more particularly, between the representatives of cultural circles, writers, teachers and researchers in the region. This state of affairs has had, and is continuing to have, a negative impact and is also affecting creativity and reducing the opportunities for learning languages and getting to know the culture and literature of the peoples of the North Caucasus, which may isolate the republics in the region still further.

22. Despite this situation, the North Caucasus is still a region with a very high level of secondary and higher education and with many academic research centres, including in the human sciences. It is a region where a good education for their children matters to families, regardless of their standard of living, social class, nationality or religion.

23. The republics of the North Caucasus have a well-developed network of cultural establishments, museums, libraries and sports centres (see Appendix 4: Cultural establishments).

24. It should be stressed that, throughout the 20th century, many experts studied and described the languages, literature, cultures, customs and traditions of the peoples of the North Caucasus. As a rule, however, the studies were constrained by ideological approaches. Drawing on the humanist values reflected in literary and artistic works and the studies already conducted, the aim today should be to seek to capitalise on the intellectual and spiritual potential of the various peoples, which could in the long run also contribute to peace and stability in the region.

V. Study visit to the Russian Federation

1. In Moscow

25. On the invitation of the authorities of the Russian Federation, the Rapporteur made a study visit to Moscow and the region on 12-17 September 2005. The Rapporteur had a meeting with Mr Alexander Sokolov, the Russian Minister for Culture, and Mr Fridlianov, the Deputy Minister for Education and Science. The meeting was also attended by deputy ministers and senior officials from various ministries responsible for preparing and implementing programmes in the North Caucasus.

26. The Rapporteur visited school No. 1332 in Moscow, where teaching focuses on an in-depth study of culture and related subjects. The school was also chosen because its pupils include children from the diasporas of the North Caucasus. The Rapporteur was joined at the school by two members of the Federation Council, Mr Andrey Artyukhov, Vice-Chair of the Committee on Culture, Education and Science, and Mr Korobeynikov, a member of the same committee and of the Parliamentary Assembly, and discussions were held with the head teacher and her staff.

27. The Federal authorities are aware of the role that culture, education, cultural diversity and intercultural and interfaith dialogue can play in the medium and long term as a possible basis for stability and democratisation in the North Caucasus. However, at federal level there is no cultural or educational plan or strategy that takes account of the specific features of the multiethnic societies in the region.

28. Nevertheless, regular meetings are held at the ministries of culture, education and regional development in order to co-ordinate more effectively the various programmes in the North Caucasus,

under the impetus of Mr Kozak, the Russian President's representative for the regions of southern Russia.

29. More specifically, a conference of culture ministers from the republics of the North Caucasus and the regions of southern Russia was held in August 2005. The second part of the conference will be held later in Krasnodar. The Culture Minister, Mr Sokolov, underlined the importance of co-operation with the Council of Europe in this area.

30. The aim of the conference was to create a common cultural and informational space in this region, to seek new ways of funding and administering the cultural sphere, to examine new draft legislation in the cultural area at regional level and to exchange information and experiences in order to further develop federal policy in this field.

31. In early 2005, a conference of education ministers of southern Russia and the North Caucasus was organised on the initiative of Mr Kozak, the Russian President's representative for this region. The participants included university chief education officers, head teachers and other interested parties. The aim of the conference was to improve the co-ordination of federal education and teaching policy in this region, including the problems involved in teaching young people about tolerance.

32. The initiatives of the various organisations aimed at promoting peace through culture and education must be strongly encouraged. For example, in 1995 the University of Piatigorsk, in southern Russia, took the initiative of organising a series of conferences on "peace in the North Caucasus through languages, education and culture", the last of which was held in October 2004. The contributions made by the conference participants are regularly published in the university's magazines.

33. Various cultural events are being prepared, such as a festival of young people and students of the North Caucasus and southern Russia. It should be pointed out that the last festival of this nature took place in 1985, in the Soviet era.

34. The Culture Ministry intends to develop transfrontier cultural co-operation between the republics of the North Caucasus and to set up television channels and radio stations for this region. In this connection, too, the federal authorities have indicated their interest in co-operating with the relevant Council of Europe bodies.

35. It is important to organise joint cultural events in the North Caucasus, such as a festival of young people and students, concerts by folk groups, sports competitions, art exhibitions, etc. However, it is also necessary to make the region's cultural diversity known both in other parts of Russia and in European countries, for example during the celebration of the Russian national holiday (12 June). This is an opportunity to show the multicultural aspect of Russian society.

36. The Russian Ministry of Education and Science is working closely with the Council of Europe to eliminate the stereotypes that exist in the teaching of history. In June 2005, a seminar was held in the southern Russian city of Piatigorsk on new interactive methods for teaching world and national history in a multicultural context. Teachers from Chechnya also took part in this seminar.

2. In the North Caucasus

(See Appendix 5: The ethnic composition of the republics of the North Caucasus)

37. It was clear that it would not be possible to visit all seven republics during a mission lasting four days. The choice of the itinerary depended on the following factors: the representativeness of the republic to be visited from the point of view of cultural, linguistic and religious diversity, the ability to move around a republic, the fact that a particular republic is rarely or never visited by the Parliamentary Assembly's rapporteurs, and the security conditions laid down by the Russian authorities.

38. The federal authorities, senior officials of the republics visited and representatives of civil society stressed that it was extremely positive that the Parliamentary Assembly was for the first time showing an interest in the cultural diversity of the North Caucasus, whereas all the preceding visits had generally been in connection with conflicts.

39. The Rapporteur had also wished to visit Chechnya, but the relevant authorities said that the security situation was not stable enough. Moreover, the tragic events of 13 October in Kabardino-Balkaria, one month after the Rapporteur's visit to this republic proved that the authorities were justified.

a. In Kabardino-Balkaria

40. The Rapporteur met the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker of the republic's parliament, attended a plenary sitting of the parliament and explained the purpose of her visit, and also held an exchange of views with members of the parliament. She met the Minister for Culture and the Chair of the parliamentary Committee on Culture, Education and the Mass Media.

41. In Nalchik, the Rapporteur met Archbishop Feofan (of Russia's southern regions), whose seat is in Krasnodar.

b. In North Ossetia-Alania

42. The Rapporteur met the Speaker of the Parliament, along with the chairs of the relevant committees. She met the ministers for national minorities, culture and education and visited Vladikavkaz mosque, where she met representatives of the Muslim community.

43. The Rapporteur visited Vladikavkaz synagogue and attended a meeting at the Jewish cultural centre with the heads of 27 cultural centres of the national minority communities in North Ossetia-Alania.

44. The Rapporteur visited Beslan school and then the town hall, where she met Ms Dudieva, Chair of the Beslan Mothers' Committee. She assured the mothers of the Assembly's support in their struggle for justice.

c. In Dagestan

45. The Rapporteur met the Speaker of the Parliament, the acting Prime Minister and the ministers for national minorities and culture.

46. She took part in a roundtable in Dagestan National Library, which was attended by representatives of cultural circles, university lecturers, researchers and journalists, as well as Mr Umakhanov, First Vice-Chair of the Federation Council's Foreign Affairs Committee and representative of Dagestan. He is a member of the Russian delegation to the Parliamentary Assembly.

47. In the town of Derbent, which is on the UNESCO World Heritage List, the Rapporteur visited the mosque, the synagogue and the Orthodox church and met religious representatives of the republic.

VI. **Conclusions**

48. In each of the three republics visited, the people whom the Rapporteur met pointed out the danger of the standardisation of cultures and the loss of each people's identity. It is important to cultivate national roots but not nationalism. Those with whom she spoke were aware that local or regional patriotism is not dangerous if the peoples of the region know and respect their neighbours' traditions and cultures. In the North Caucasus, the co-existence of and interaction between different cultures is a historical reality.

49. According to the representatives of the authorities and civil society, there are two external factors that have an impact on the three republics visited. The first is related to conflicts, especially the conflict in Chechnya, which is making the situation worse and rendering it impossible to fully develop cultural and educational projects and maintain cultural links between the peoples of the Caucasus.

50. The second external factor relates to extremist religious movements, especially Wahhabism, and terrorist attacks. In this context, mention was made of the problem of religious extremists from outside the country recruiting young unemployed people.

51. In this connection, the problem of double standards in the mass media and certain international organisations was mentioned in the three republics, especially in the town of Beslan. The perpetrators of terrorist attacks are called terrorists, combatants or separatists depending on where the terrorist acts have been committed.

52. The question of financing culture and education remains a serious worry, especially in a multicultural and multi-faith region. In the North Caucasus, the salaries of the staff of libraries, museums, theatres and other cultural or educational establishments are sometimes half those paid in the other regions of Russia. For example, a museum curator or librarian receives the equivalent of 55-60 euros a month.

53. During the visit to the North Caucasus, those with whom the Rapporteur spoke in each of the three republics frequently emphasised that, in the medium and long term, culture and education and intercultural and interfaith dialogue could help bring the region's peoples together and constitute a basis for stability.

54. The Rapporteur is convinced that, in view of the conflicts and political disputes between the peoples of the North Caucasus, the fields of culture and education offer a genuine possibility of strengthening development, peace and stability.

55. It appears worth considering the possibility of setting up with the Russian authorities and the relevant Council of Europe directorates a task force on the North Caucasus tasked with drawing up and implementing measures for restoring confidence in this region by making use of the potential for intercultural and interfaith dialogue.

56. This body, with the agreement and co-operation of the Russian authorities and based on the positive experience gained by the Council of Europe in the context of its experts' work on the Russian Federation's cultural policy, which was published in 1998, could draw up a strategy for the development of culture and education in the multicultural and multiethnic environment of the North Caucasus.

57. During her visit to Moscow and the North Caucasus, the Rapporteur saw that various activities in the cultural and educational field are either being prepared or implemented by some Council of Europe member states or international organisations, such as the European Union.

58. In this context, information on these activities should be gathered in order to co-ordinate the actions of the Council of Europe and other parties involved to improve effectiveness and avoid duplication of effort.

59. The Rapporteur is convinced of the imperative need to improve cultural and educational policies, or indeed reinvent cultural and educational institutions operating in line with a multicultural and multi-faith environment, and to do so by drawing on European experiences.

<u>Appendix 1</u>: Map of the North Caucasus



Source: Institute for War and Peace Reporting

<u>Appendix 2</u>: Languages of the Caucasus

Caucasian	Northern-west	Abaza Abkhaz Adyghe Kabardian Cherkessian
	Northern-east	Avarish Chechen Dargin Ingush Lakk Lezgian Rutul Tabasaran Tsakhur
	South	Georgian Laz Mingrelian Svan
Indo-European	Armenian	Armenian
	Iranian	Juhuri Ossetian Tat
Altaic	Turkic	Azeri Balkar Karachay Kumyk Nogay
	Mongolian	Kalmyk

<u>Appendix 3</u>: The religions of the Caucasus (data for 2002-2003)

Table 1: Number of mosques

Name of republic or territory	Number of mosques
Adygea	28, of which 15 are officially registered
Kabardino-Balkaria	115
Karachaevo-Cherkessia	113, of which 97 are officially registered
North Ossetia-Alania	19, of which 7 are officially registered
Ingushetia	107, of which 97 are officially registered
Chechnya	352
Dagestan	1758, of which 525 are officially registered

Table 2: Number of Orthodox Churches

Name of republic or territory	Number of parishes
Ingushetia	3
Chechnya	7
Dagestan	12
Karachaevo-Cherkessia	18
North Ossetia-Alania	32
Kabardino-Balkaria	18

Table 3: Number of organisations of religious faiths registered in Kabardino-Balkaria

Muslim:	105	
Orthodox:		19
Jewish:	1	
Catholic:		3
Protestant:		23
Molokan Christian:		1

Kabardino-Balkaria has 1 Islamic religious establishment, 1 Orthodox monastery with 10 primary schools, 1 synagogue and 23 houses of prayer. Religious practices, services and rites are performed by157 representatives of the Islamic religion, 25 of the Orthodox Church, 2 of the Catholic Church, 1 rabbi and approximately 30 Protestant ministers.

Table 4: Fluctuations in the number of mosques in Dagestan

Year	Population	Mosques
1910	700,000	1,700
1980	1,627,000	27
1992	1,900,000	800
2002	2,576,000	1,758

In Dagestan in 2001, there were 17 religious higher education establishments, 136 Koranic schools and 203 primary schools attached to mosques.

Table 5: Number of organisations of the religious faiths registered in Dagestan

Type of religion	Number of places of worship	Number of clerics
Islam	1,758	2,600
Judaism	4	10
Orthodox	10	106
Evangelists	4	
Catholics	1	
Adventist	4	
Armenian church	1	
Old Believers	1	
Jehovah's Witnesses	6	

Table 6: Number of mosques in Chechnya

Year	Number of mosques
1985	10
1991	175
2002	352

Appendix 4: Cultural establishments

Table 1: Number of theatregoers per 1,000 inhabitants

Name of republic	1990	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003
Adygea	499	153	89	95	113	89	87	145	97	1101
Dagestan	269	200	195	150	144	136	147	148	145	135
Ingushetia	274	107	72	86	105	102	100	138	74	65
Kabardino-Balkaria	354	91	86	86	106	110	139	130	128	94
Karachaevo-Cherkessia	294	204	172	157	122	106	76	109	95	78
North Ossetia-Alania	452	242	191	169	184	222	176	226	235	215
Chechnya	274							27	34	8

Table 2: Number of museum visitors per 1,000 inhabitants

Name of republic	1990	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003
Adygea	266	72	165	147	210	91	133	158	149	134
Dagestan	151	76	49	65	75	84	96	157	164	125
Ingushetia	211	55	82	116	177	119	112	95	98	109
Kabardino-Balkaria	441	126	87	72	61	40	62	63	55	47
Karachaevo-Cherkessia	359	197	154	163	218	180	201	197	170	177
North Ossetia-Alania	244	104	110	96	122	59	72	108	80	78
Chechnya	211							13	9	5

Appendix 5: **The ethnic composition of the republics of the North Caucasus (2002-2003)**

Republics/ Peoples	Kabardino-Balkaria	North Ossetia-Alania	Dagestan	Chechnya *	Karachaevo-Cherkessia	Adygea	Ingushetia
Abazinians					**33,346**		
Adygheis						**108,115**	
Aguls			**23,300**				
Armenians	**5,342**	**17,147**					
Avars			**758,400**				
Azeris	**2,281**		**111,700**				
Balkars	**104,951**						
Belorussians	**1,194**						
Chechens	**4,241**	**3,383**	**87,900**	**1,032,686**			**95,403**
Cherkessians					**49,591**		
Dargins			**425,500**				
Georgians	**1,731**	**10,803**					
Greeks		**2,332**					
Ingush		**21,442**					**361,057**
Jews	**1,088**		**24,300**				
Kabardians	**498,702**	**2,902**					
Kalmucks			**9,500**				
Karachais	**1,273**				**169,198**		
Kumyks		**12,659**	**365,500**				
Lakks	**1,800**		**139,700**				
Lezgians			**336,700**				
Meskhet-Turks	**2,286**						
Nogays					**14,873**		
Ossetians	**9,845**	**445,310**					
Russians	**226,620**	**164,734**	**120,900**		**147,878**	**306,000**	**5,559**
Rutuls			**38,200**				
Tabasarans			**110,700**				
Tatars	**2,851**						
Tsakhurs			**8,200**				
Turks	**8,770**	**2,835**					**903**
Ukrainians	**7,592**	**5,198**					
Others				**71,000**	**35,000**	**40,000**	
Total	**>900,000**	**709,900**	**2,500,000**	**1,103,686**	**>450,000**	**>456,000**	**462,922**

* The figures are disputed.

Bibliography:

- Géopolitique du Caucase. Viatcheslav Avioutski, Edition Armand Colin, Paris, 2005.
- Géopolitique des Caucases. François Thual,
  Ellipses, Paris, 2004.
- Atlas des langues. Le grand livre du mois. Paris, 2004.
- The peoples of Dagestan. “Peoples and cultures” series, Moscow, 2004.
- Nauchnaya Mysl Kavkaza (Scientific Thought in the Caucasus), 2005.
- Magazine of the state university of the city of Piatigorsk (Russia); Issue no.4, 1998; Issue no. 3, 2001; Issues nos. 2,3 and 4, 2004.
- Statistical data provided by the authorities of the republics of the North Caucasus.

***

Reporting committee: Committee on Culture, Science and Education

Reference to committee: Doc. 10345, Reference No 3027 of 23.11.2004

Draft recommendation unanimously adopted by the committee on 30 March 2006

Members of the Committee: Mr Jacques **Legendre** (Chairman), Baroness **Hooper**, Mr Josef **Jařab**, Mr Wolfgang **Wodarg**, (Vice-Chairpersons), Mr Hans Ager, Mr Toomas **Alatalu**, Mr Emerenzio Barbieri, Mr Rony **Bargetze**, Mrs Marie-Louise Bemelmans-Videc, Mr Radu-Mircea Berceanu, Mr Levan Berdzenishvili, Mr Italo **Bocchino**, Mr Božidar Bojović, Mr Ioannis **Bougas**, Mrs Anne **Brasseur**, Mr Osman Coşkunoğlu, Mr Vlad Cubreacov, Mrs Maria **Damanaki**, Mr Joseph Debono Grech, Mr Stepan Demirchyan, Mr Ferdinand Devinski, Mrs Kaarina **Dromberg**, Mrs Åse Gunhild Woie **Duesand**, Mr Detlef Dzembritzki, Mrs Anke Eymer, Mr Relu **Fenechiu**, Mrs Blanca Fernández-Capel, Mrs Maria Emelina Fernández-Soriano, Mr Axel **Fischer**, Mr José Freire **Antunes**, Mr Ian Gibson (Alternate : Lord **Russell-Johnston**), Mr Eamon **Gilmore**, Mr Stefan Glăvan, Mr Luc **Goutry**, Mr Vladimir Grachev (Alternate : Mr Igor **Chernyshenko**), Mr Andreas Gross, Mr Kristinn H. Gunnarson, Mrs Azra Hadžiahmetović, Mr Jean-Pol **Henry**, Mr Rafael Huseynov, Mr Raffaele Iannuzzi, Mrs Halide **İncekara**, Mr Lachezar Ivanov, Mr Igor Ivanovski, Mr József Kozma, Jean-Pierre **Kucheida**, Mr Guy Lengagne (Alternate: Mr Philippe **Nachbar**), Mrs Jagoda Majska-Martinčević, Mr Tomasz **Markowski**, Mr Bernard Marquet, Mr Andrew **McIntosh**, Mr Ivan Melnikov (Alternate: Mr Alexander **Fomenko)**, Mrs Maria Manuela **de Melo**, Mr Paskal Milo, Mrs Fausta Morganti, Mrs Christine Muttonen, Mrs Miroslava Němcová (Alternate: Mrs Alena **Gajdůšková)**, Mr Jakob-Axel Nielsen, Mr Edward **O’Hara**, Mr Andrey **Pantev**, Mrs Ganira Pashayeva, Mrs Antigoni Pericleous Papadopoulos, Mrs Majda Potrata, Mr Lluis Maria **de Puig**, Mr Anatoliy Rakhansky, Mr Johannes **Randegger**, Mr Zbigniew Rau (Mr Zbigniew **Girzynski**), Mr Zoltán Rockenbauer, Mrs Anta Rugāte, Mr Piero Ruzzante, Mr Volodymyr Rybak, Mr Pär-Axel Sahlberg, Mr André **Schneider**, Mr Vitaliy Shybko, Mr Yury Solonin, Mr Ninoslav Stojadinović, Mr Valeriy Sudarenkov, Mr Mehmet **Tekelioğlu**, Mr Ed van Thijn, Mr Piotr **Wach**, Mrs Majléne Westerlund Panke, Mr Emanuelis Zingeris, NN Andorra

N.B. The names of those members present at the meeting are printed in bold

Head of Secretariat:M. Christopher Grayson
Committee secretariat : MM. Ary, Dossow, Chahbazian