

For debate in the Standing Committee — see Rule 15 of the Rules of Procedure

Doc. 11170
5 February 2007

Professional education and training of journalists

Report
Committee on Culture, Science and Education
Rapporteur: Rafael Huseynov, Azerbaijan, ALDE

Summary

Free and independent media are one of the fundamental backbones of democratic society, one of the engines of democratic transition and one of the requirements of democratic stability. For the media to function properly, responsibility and professionalism are necessary on the side of journalists, and this calls in turn for professional education and training of journalists.

The Assembly recommends supporting professional training courses for journalists nationally and through the Council of Europe, possibly in co-operation with media and their professional organisations. It resolves to provide assistance to member parliaments for setting up departments responsible for relations with independent media in order to enhance the transparency of parliamentary work as well as the professionalism of media reporting about this work.

A. Draft recommendation

1. The Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe believes that free and independent media are one of the fundamental backbones of democratic society, one of the engines of democratic transition and one of the requirements of democratic stability. For the media to function properly, responsibility and professionalism are necessary on the side of journalists, and this calls in turn for professional education and training of journalists.

2. The Assembly is aware of the challenges faced by media and journalists in Europe, in particular the transition from totalitarianism to democracy throughout Europe, the technological progress of new digital media as well as the growing globalisation of information flows and markets. The media in Europe work more and more without national borders: journalists move between states and write about subjects from abroad or with relevance to an audience abroad and media products are disseminated across borders. These developments both open up new opportunities for journalists and place new demands on them such as for new skills, greater knowledge and continuing learning.

3. In this context, the Assembly recalls its Resolution 1003 and Recommendation 1215 (1993) on the ethics of journalism, Resolution 1165 (1998) on the right to privacy, Resolution 1438 and Recommendation 1702 (2005) on freedom of the press and the working conditions of journalists in conflict zones, Recommendation 1706 (2005) on media and terrorism as well as Resolution 1510 (2006) on freedom of expression and respect for religious beliefs.

4. The Assembly recalls the successful assistance and co-operation provided by the Council of Europe for more than a decade in most member states in the field of media legislation and media training. Many of those activities have been funded by voluntary contributions of member and observer states as well as by the European Union. The Council of Europe, as the prime standard-setting organisation in Europe concerning freedom of the media, has thus been enabled to make its expertise available to all states in Europe. This experience and expertise must be exploited further.

5. The Assembly welcomes the long-standing co-operation under the joint Council of Europe – European Commission programmes for media training in Europe and expresses the hope that the new MEDIA Programme and the European Neighbourhood and Partnership Initiative under the EU budget for 2007 - 2013 will provide for opportunities of making greater use of the experience and geographic reach of the Council of Europe by continuing joint programmes at an intensified level.

6. The Assembly also recalls that the Council of Europe has set up a network of independent Schools of Political Studies in many cities, which will familiarise journalists, among others, with the European project, based on human rights, democracy, the rule of law and civic values. Further targeted activities for journalists and media are desirable in this framework.

7. In view of the globalisation of media and the differences in cultural and media practices, the Assembly is of the opinion that an intensified co-operation with non-European countries of the Mediterranean Basin is necessary in the field of media education along the lines mentioned in Assembly Resolution 1313 (2003) on cultural co-operation between Europe and the Southern Mediterranean countries.

8. The Assembly also welcomes the training efforts for journalists pursued by many media companies in Europe and by professional organisations such as the International and European Federations of Journalists, the European Broadcasting Union as well as the World Association of Newspapers and its European Newspaper Publishers Association. The professional education and training of their journalists is one of the most valuable assets of media companies in an increasingly competitive media environment. With regard to media content, quality should be promoted and such content should be prepared professionally by well educated and trained journalists.

9. The Assembly notes, however, that not all media companies in Europe have the possibility of providing training to their journalists because of lack of funds and training schemes. While many institutions of higher education offer specialised courses and programmes for students wishing to become journalists, very few address the practical training needs of working journalists. Therefore, the Assembly is of the opinion that specialised courses should be created to provide vocational training and continuing education for journalists.

10. The Assembly refers to the emphasis placed on freedom of expression and the media in the commitments undertaken by the Heads of State and Government in their Action Plan at their 2005 Summit in Warsaw as well as those undertaken at the 7th European Ministerial Conference on Mass Media Policy in Kyiv on 10-11 March 2005.

11. The Assembly recommends that the Committee of Ministers:

11.1. call on all member states to support professional training courses of journalists nationally and through the Council of Europe, possibly in co-operation with media and their professional organisations;

11.2. consider establishing Council of Europe chairs for media training, possibly through voluntary contributions from governments as well as financial support from media companies and in co-operation with universities in Europe;

11.3. establish, together with media companies and in co-operation with institutions of higher education in Europe, a network of training centres for journalists;

11.4. organise pan-European exchanges of journalists with educational institutions and media companies, possibly through joint programmes with the European Union, in order to promote European standards and understanding among journalists;

11.5. organise, possibly with the North-South Centre of the Council of Europe in Lisbon, a conference on professional education and training of journalists in Europe and the Mediterranean Basin.

12. The Assembly resolves to provide assistance to member parliaments for setting up departments responsible for relations with independent media in order to enhance the transparency of parliamentary work as well as the professionalism of media reporting about this work.

B. Explanatory memorandum by Mr Rafael Huseynov

1. The World Association of Newspapers celebrated in 2005 the 400th anniversary of the birth of the first printed newspaper, which had been published by Johann Carolus in Strasbourg in 1605 and written by a network of correspondents or journalists in major central European cities. Journalism may be much older, but the technological development of mass media changed the work of journalists considerably. While the correspondents of Johann Carolus might have expected to be read by a few merchants, wealthy persons and political and religious leaders in a few central European capitals, this outreach has changed over the last 400 years. In today's era of satellite broadcasting and the Internet, journalists may reach readers, listeners or viewers in every part of the world almost instantly. In addition, a new phenomenon has arisen: not only journalists but everybody can disseminate information and opinions to a large number of recipients through the Internet.

2. How can journalists prepare themselves for these challenges? Although the profession of journalist is, for instance, recognised through the attribution of press cards, there are different paths of education and training leading to this profession. In Europe, we can traditionally find universities that offer academic studies and diplomas in journalism as well as media companies offering training on the job for apprentice journalists with different educational backgrounds. As the media played an important role in controlling the masses in totalitarian and communist regimes, the education of journalists was in the past restricted and politically controlled in those states. The education of journalists thus mirrors society.

3. For a democratic society, freedom of expression and information through the media are a necessary condition. The European Court of Human Rights has consistently underlined that free and pluralist media are essential for any democratic society. The Court also stated that the right to freedom of expression carries also responsibilities, in particular to respect other fundamental rights. Due to the importance of media for the creation of a democratic family of European nations, professional education and training of journalists necessitates support by all European states.

4. The right to freedom of expression in the media requires that the profession of journalist and journalistic work are not restricted by the state through a system of accreditation or admission. Prior education and training of journalists should not be requirements imposed by state authorities, but rather be pursued as objectives by journalists and the media themselves.

5. However, it must be of concern to parliamentarians in Europe that media freedom still remains a critical issue in Europe which requires continued efforts by all member governments and parliaments of the Council of Europe. While freedom of expression and information through the media has been introduced in all European constitutions, particular attention must still be paid to both, the implementation of these norms as well as the professional education and training of journalists.

6. This explains the emphasis placed on freedom of expression and the media in the commitments undertaken by the Heads of State and Government in their Action Plan at their 2005 Summit in Warsaw as well as those undertaken at the 7th European Ministerial Conference on Mass Media Policy in Kyiv on 10-11 March 2005.

7. The Council of Europe regularly organises training seminars for journalists in many member states and has adopted several recommendations on issues concerning journalists and the media.

8. The Assembly has also dealt with such issues. In this context, see for instance the Assembly's Resolution 1003 and Recommendation 1215 (1993) on ethics of journalism, Resolution 1165 (1998) on the right to privacy, Resolution 1438 and Recommendation 1702 (2005) on freedom of the press and the working conditions of journalists in conflict zones, Recommendation 1706 (2005) on media and terrorism as well as Resolution 1510 (2006) on freedom of expression and respect for religious beliefs.

9. The Committee of Ministers has also developed a number of relevant instruments such as its Recommendation (96) 4 on the protection of journalists in situations of conflict and tension, Recommendation (97) 19 on the portrayal of violence in the electronic media, Recommendation (97) 20 on "hate speech", Recommendation (97) 21 on the media and the promotion of a culture of tolerance, Recommendation (99) 15 on measures concerning media coverage of election campaigns, Recommendation (2000) 7 on the right of journalists not to disclose their sources of information, Recommendation (2003) 13 on the provision of information through the media in relation to criminal proceedings, and its Declaration of 12 February 2004 on freedom of political debate in the media.

10. In the course of the preparation of this report, the Sub-Committee on the Media of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education organised together with the Media Division of the DG II – Human Rights of the Council of Europe a seminar on media freedom and ethics: a European dimension in the professional education and training of journalists (see Appendix). This seminar was hosted in Baku on 29 and 30 November 2006 by the Azerbaijan University of Languages and the Parliamentary Delegation of Azerbaijan to the Assembly. It was funded partly by a joint programme of the EU and the Council of Europe. The following conclusions can be drawn from this seminar:

a. Professional education and training of journalists needs more attention and support, especially in eastern Europe.

b. Regional seminars should facilitate cross-border co-operation and understanding among journalists and the media based on common European values.

c. The Council of Europe is the appropriate platform for such seminars because it is the prime standard-setting organisation for media freedom, has extensive experience in organising training seminars, and comprises the whole of Europe.

11. The media in Europe work more and more without national borders: journalists move between states and write about subjects from abroad or with relevance to an audience abroad and media products are disseminated across borders. Therefore, the education and training of journalists in Europe should be European. Where universities co-operate Europe-wide and multinational media companies train journalists through an international apprenticeship, such a European dimension will be ensured. This may, however, be the exception. Especially in states with low average income, media companies are less likely to invest a lot in the training of their journalists.

12. Authorities in member states, educational institutions and media companies should be encouraged to develop or, where they exist already, intensify pan-European exchanges of students, apprentices and young journalists, especially from central and eastern Europe. Many people consider the younger generation of aspiring journalists to be the greatest hope for ensuring that media in countries in transition become vigorous, professionally competent, economically viable and genuinely independent.

13. The Council of Europe has established close co-operation with the European Union and intends to intensify this in accordance with the decisions taken at the Third Summit of Heads of State and Government in Warsaw on 16-17 May 2005. It would thus be useful for both organisations to co-operate through joint activities for media training under the new MEDIA 2007 Programme.

14. The European Parliament and the Council of the European Union adopted on 15 November 2006 a new MEDIA Programme to support the European audiovisual sector in 2007 - 2013 with a total budget of 755 million Euros. This new MEDIA Programme will again contain support for the training of audiovisual professionals. In addition, the European Union adopted the European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument (ENPI) with a budget of approximately 12 billion Euros for the years 2007 - 2013, which constitutes an increase of 32% in real terms compared to the prior the TACIS, MEDA and EIDHR programmes. The ENPI may also contain support for media and journalists.

15. The professional education and training of their journalists is one of the most valuable assets of media companies in a growingly competitive media environment. The currently popular slogan "content is king" requires that such media content is prepared professionally by well educated, trained and professionally ethical journalists.

16. Since media and journalists enjoy the right to freedom of expression, legislation restricting this freedom is generally regarded as problematic. Therefore, media and journalists developed in many countries different systems of self-regulation. This can range from independent press complaints bodies and media ombudspersons to professional codes of conduct and media ethics. In most self-regulatory mechanisms, professional organisations of journalists play a central role.

17. As a consequence, training of journalists has to include courses on media ethics as well as the different bodies dealing with complaints against media. This training could be done by universities and media companies, but it could also be offered in co-operation with the professional organisation and media body concerned. In the spirit of a public-private partnership, the Council of Europe could support professional organisations and media in Europe in setting up joint training programmes for European journalists.

18. Ethical standards will only be effective when the management and the owners of media participate in the implementation of these standards. Therefore the management level should participate in training activities.

19. In the course of the preparation of this report, a memorandum on a European dimension in the professional education and training of journalists was sent last year to relevant professional media organisations for their comments. The comments received by the European Federation of Journalists, the World Association of Newspapers and the European Broadcasting Union were very encouraging and supported greater co-operation with the Council of Europe.

20. The European Federation of Journalists (EFJ) in Brussels responded that, in a world of constant change in the media sector and increasingly technology driven work profiles, training and continuing training for journalists was crucial for the maintenance of the quality, independence and integrity of the journalistic profession. The EFJ regretted the trend that young inexperienced persons, often with no prior training or experience, were engaged for journalistic work, especially in central and eastern Europe.

21. The EFJ was working on a survey on quality in journalism and intended to prepare a handbook for journalists' training. As a first step, a questionnaire had been circulated among working journalists. One of the questions was: How important are ethical questions in your daily work? First results showed that 64 % of the working journalists said that ethics played a very important role in their

current job, and another 23 % said it played an important role. But what was their knowledge about the ethical code in their country? Only 32 % said that they knew it very well.

22. The EFJ believed that media owners had a responsibility to offer continuous training as an ongoing requirement to their journalists including on ethical issues and investigative journalism. The right to training should be part of collective agreements and be available to men and women, the young and the older. Freelance journalists should also receive such training, which should be industry wide providing a sound and professional basis for work in all areas of journalism including on-line. Professional training was both an economic and a moral issue.

23. The EFJ also suggested that journalists unions should be involved with media employers and educators of journalists in the development, implementation and evaluation of programmes of training. Training programmes should be developed on the basis of sustainable development involving training schemes, national unions and national employers.

24. The EFJ would find it very useful for the Council of Europe to develop a pan-European network for training standards on quality in journalism and was interested in being a partner in such a project. The EFJ was launching its Ethical Journalism Initiative as a response to the rise of intolerance in Europe. This would include practical actions to improve performance of media by raising awareness among media and journalists on all sides, through dialogue, and actions in the area of training, recruitment and newsroom practice. Part of this would also be a debate on how to reinforce self-regulation in media, and how to make it more effective and credible.

25. The World Association of Newspapers (WAN) in Paris stated that media companies made the primary investment in the training of journalists and that employers were responsible for training programmes. Therefore, the WAN saw itself and its European affiliate, the Brussels-based European Newspaper Publishers Association, as natural partners for pursuing activities concerning the training of media professionals at European level.

26. The European Broadcasting Union (EBU) at Grand-Saconnex near Geneva pointed to a key question: How to encapsulate a European dimension in the training of journalists? Knowledge of Europe and European affairs should be part of the basic curriculum. It broadened journalists' horizons and trained them in fundamental European principles so that they could enrich their reports whether national or international. The making of the news was a complex operation and bringing in a European perspective could significantly improve the quality of the news.

27. The EBU is not involved with basic or university education of journalists but rather concentrates on vocational training as a combination of three elements: (1) knowledge, (2) know-how and practice, and (3) intercultural competences. These three components could be delivered at European level:

- Knowledge of European principles, countries, realities and people, thus avoiding prejudices and reinforcing European values;
- Know-how and exchange of best practises on how to apply principles, deal with information and make the news (storytelling, covering breaking news, decision on ethics);
- Intercultural competencies for allowing journalists to interact with more people from various backgrounds and translate the diversity of reality into news, programmes, etc.

28. For example, the "Week of the News" is a yearly seminar by the EBU which started in 1999 with the help of the Council of Europe. 50 young journalists from 25 different countries (mainly from central, south-eastern and eastern Europe) learn from each others' experiences, learn to discuss difficult issues and exchange ideas on editorial decisions. The "Week of the News" seminars create a fruitful and friendly atmosphere of fellow colleagues who feel part of a European community of journalists.

29. The EBU also organises on-site training workshops on newsroom management, interviewing techniques, the editorial line of the newsroom, covering elections, cross media coverage, etc.

30. The EBU's experience in European training showed that:

- Building networks of ideas, people, topics and references required time, valuable training content, high quality methodology, excellent and open speakers;
- Understanding the reality of Europe (faces of people, countries, problems, successes, sounds, etc.) created sources of information for better news;
- Better use of digital platforms had to be made and cross media work and co-operation be enhanced.

31. The EBU expressed interest in cooperating and developing further training projects with the Council of Europe and was particularly interested in action involving also the southern Mediterranean countries, some of which participate in the EBU.

32. All three organisations are to be thanked for their helpful comments and their interest in co-operating with the Council of Europe on this matter.

Conclusion

33. The Council of Europe has set core standards for Europe on freedom of expression and information in the media, in particular Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights, the European Convention on Transfrontier Television and numerous Resolutions, Recommendations and Declarations on media issues by the Committee of Ministers as well as by the Parliamentary Assembly.

34. Based on these standards, the Council of Europe has assisted member governments as well as journalists and professional organisations in developing a European media environment which aims at free, independent, pluralist, fair and open reporting irrespective of national borders.

35. As the professional education and training of journalists is essentially in the interest of society, states should support such efforts because media play an instrumental role in a democratic society and a democratic European continent.

36. Ethical questions and standards belong to the most crucial subjects of professional education and training of journalists. They guarantee the quality of the media. Quality of the media is in the interest of journalists, publishers and the public alike.

37. National parliaments in Europe are called upon to work with their governments in implementing the recommendations to the Committee of Ministers contained in the Assembly Recommendation attached to this report. Professional media organisations and educational institutions are invited to join forces with the Council of Europe in this respect.

Appendix

Media Freedom and Ethics: a European dimension in the professional education and training of journalists

Summary of the seminar held in Baku on 29-30 November 2006

Opening session

The seminar was opened by the **Chairman Mr Walter**, who recalled that, since media were an essential element of any democratic society, the training of journalists should receive particular attention and support. The quality of the training of journalists would determine the quality of the media they worked for. In a democracy voting mattered, but elections were not a sufficient condition on their own. The rule of law, an independent judiciary, a strong civil society, a range of political parties, combined with a culture of popular participation were all essential. A vital pillar must also be a free and responsible press and electronic media.

Mr Seyidov welcomed all participants at the Azerbaijan University of Languages. He stressed the importance of media in a democracy as well as the value of a good education.

Mr Bribosia recalled that the Council of Europe had assisted member states in drafting media laws. However, the practical implementation of media laws mattered more than the adoption of media laws. He noted that the media landscape in Azerbaijan was less pluralist with the suspension of the ANS television channel. He also referred to the recent eviction of the Azadlig newspaper from its office in Baku. Without passing judgement on these cases, he felt that both were not good news for Azerbaijan.

Mr Hasanov recognised the importance of media freedom. On hearing of the suspension of an Azerbaijani television channel and the physical movement of a newspaper to other premises, one might have the impression something was wrong. This impression was wrong. Media laws existed and were applied in Azerbaijan. However, some people did not want to respect the law. Following the advice of the Council of Europe, Azerbaijan had passed laws concerning media and journalists, broadcasting, public service broadcasting, privacy and access to information. The government also allocated funds for the technical development of media, as for instance tax exemptions and access to special loans. Azerbaijan faced, however, a special problem in that certain media intended to increase political violence. Journalists who competed for political posts could not be considered simple journalists. Since media in Azerbaijan were often not financially sustainable, those media joined political parties or movements or sought funding from foreign forces.

Mr Huseynov informed the participants that he was writing a report on the theme of the seminar which should be submitted to the Assembly for debate. Freedom of expression was a fundamental right. However, the freedom of one person was limited by the freedom of the others. Therefore, media ethics played an important role. Border lines should be respected, whether they were ethical or territorial. He mentioned that he had consulted the European Federation of Journalists, the World Association of Newspapers and the European Broadcasting Union on a number of possible recommendations concerning professional education and training of journalists.

Session 1: Training of journalists: concepts and practice

Mrs Mikashavidze said that, despite a decade of political turbulence, civil strife and economic upheaval, countries of the Caucasus had begun to lay fragile foundations of an independent press. At this juncture in history, many people considered the younger generation of aspiring journalists to be the greatest hope for turning these countries' media into vigorous, professionally competent, economically viable and genuinely independent watchdogs of the government and administration. Many journalists in the Caucasus had no prior academic education in journalism. Many others had gone through an old-style, mostly theoretical journalism education – often rooted in the Soviet tradition – and had learned very few practical skills. Practically every journalist was today looking for new skills to remain competitive on the job market. This reality prompted journalism educators to

expand academic and training programmes in journalism with improved curricula and methodologies. Professional skills needed to be taught in a practical, hands-on manner. The majority of students and practising journalists had only superficial knowledge of the established ethical norms and standards. Ethical norms were thus routinely violated and unethical, reckless, sensational journalism was still a problem. Ethical violations were most often cited by the public as reasons for dissatisfaction and lack of trust vis-à-vis the media. The public therefore was less prepared to stand for and protect the independence of journalism today. The Caucasus School of Journalism and Media Management in Georgia had been created in 2002 to strengthen the role of independent media in the emerging democratic societies of the Caucasus through academic and training programmes. It aimed to produce a cadre of well-trained journalists committed to the principles of fairness, independence, honesty and accuracy in their work for newspapers, television and radio.

Mrs Illés said that journalism ethics should be incorporated in all themes and all levels of training in order to be effective. Ethical standards in the newsroom should be accepted and internalised by staff, the management and the owners of the media outlet. Often, the external environment was hostile or indifferent to ethical standards in the media. For instance, there might be limited freedom of expression or tools of self-regulation might be absent or still in the making. Successful training should include journalism skills, management skills and ethical standards and practices.

Session 2: European co-operation in the training of journalists

Mr Alizada presented journalism education at the Baku State University and stressed that an adequate professional education and knowledge was necessary for high-level journalism. At the Journalism Department of Baku State University, ethics of journalism and media law were taught to the students. According to the government, there were some 2900 media registered in Azerbaijan with some 100 periodicals. Since the independence of Azerbaijan came only 15 years ago, media had less experience with a modern media environment. However, newspapers had existed in Azerbaijan for some 130 years.

Mr Hajili said that media standards needed a corresponding political, legal, social and economic environment in order to survive. It was therefore regrettable that the Azadlig newspaper had been thrown out of its offices in Baku. What ethical standards could the editor of the Azadlig newspaper recommend to his staff? On the basis of the existing media laws, journalists were imprisoned for defamation and incitement to religious hatred, often after complaints by government officials. In order to be independent, media needed to be economically self-sufficient. Except for one or two media in Azerbaijan, all others depended on government support. Unfortunately, there was no demand for professionalism in the media in Azerbaijan, but rather for political journalism.

Mr Mayer said that a recent survey by the European Federation of Journalists showed that ethics played a very important role for 64% of all journalists and an important role for another 23%. However, only 34% knew their ethical codes well. Ethical questions and standards belonged to the most crucial subjects of the professional education and training of journalists, because they guaranteed the quality of the media. Media freedom and the responsible use of this freedom were like two sides of the same coin. Through self-regulation, media could meet this responsibility better. Having just celebrated its 50th anniversary, the German Press Council observed, reprimanded and, where possible, removed any abuse and infringements of the rules of fair and responsible journalistic conduct in Germany. Other similar institutions in Europe were the Ombudspersons in the Scandinavian countries, the Dutch Press Council and the British Press Complaints Commission. In Germany, all new journalists got an in-house training for two years, which was required under a collective labour agreement on training of journalists and included courses on ethics. However, ethical standards were only a fiction as long as journalists had existential problems and fears. A fair salary and sufficient social security was necessary for journalists to fulfil their ethical standards.

Session 3: European co-operation in the training of journalists

Mr Passicousset presented the European Training Association of Journalists which aimed at bringing a European dimension to the professional training of journalists. One of the subjects dealt with by the Association were new media, such as the Internet, and how to work with them and build up professional networks. The recent public debate about a clash of civilisations showed that there were also problems among journalists. Ethics of journalism could help overcome such clashes. The

Bologna Process concerning higher education in Europe also had an impact on the professional education and training of journalists. In some countries, academic education was the rule while others had a mixture of academic education and practical training or apprenticeships. For countries where journalists received practical training as part of their education, the recognition process was more complicated.

Mr McIntosh responded that, while diversity in training was needed, unity in ethics should be maintained.

Mr Rizun said that the fast-growing media industry in Ukraine was suffering from a skills shortage. In addition, society faced socio-political, economic and technological problems. The initial impetus for the development of the media industry in Ukraine had come in the early days of Ukrainian independence. Training programmes introduced in the newly established centres and editorial offices had created the illusion of an alternative to the traditional, academic university education. But they had been no substitute for a professional university education, which comprised three elements: general culture, fundamental knowledge and professional training. Academic education had been regarded as being overly conservative, remote from real life and incapable of responding quickly to the fast-growing media industry and of assimilating western experience in terms of both the style and content of teaching. Finally, there was broad agreement that journalism training was a continuous system of education, in which everyone had their place: the universities provided higher education and prepared future specialists for independent life, while the various types of training programmes sought either to introduce specialists to real-life working conditions – in editorial offices – or to upgrade their skills. Professional training courses, as a key form of journalism education within universities today, required the existence of good technical facilities. The media skills development project of the European Union provided funds for such technical facilities at the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv and its Institute of Journalism as well as two pilot centres – Uzhgorod National University and Tavrichesky National University. Without such support, the introduction of professional training programmes into universities in Ukraine would not have been possible.

Mr Howson presented training activities of the BBC abroad. Mutual understanding was a key factor for quality media. Therefore, one project brought together journalists from Serbia and Kosovo in order to produce documentaries about their common history. With regard to the Bologna Process, Ireland had needed five years to implement it and it was understandable that this implementation would take longer in the Caucasus or Ukraine.

Mrs Illés saw a distance between academic circles and professionals in this region. As a result, graduates of schools of journalism rarely worked as journalists. Where local media had been taken over by foreign media companies, in-house training courses were generally introduced which created an internal loyalty to the media company.

Mr Mayer felt that training for trainers was very important in order to share experiences. Training must not, however, be imposed from outside, it should rather raise self-awareness and understanding while respecting regional particularities.

Mrs Mikashavidze said that more seminars such as this were needed in order to share experiences. The professional work of journalists was very important for society and should therefore be supported. In response to a remark about the often difficult economic situation of professors in the Caucasus, she recalled that better trained teachers would have better opportunities.

Mr Passicousset encouraged journalists and teachers to build up networks, for instance through the Internet. Such networks were helpful in the daily work of journalists and academics alike. Unfortunately, Europe lagged behind North America in this respect.

Closing statements

Mr McIntosh thanked all speakers and participants as well as the hosts of the seminar. He suggested that regional seminars should be more inclusive and regretted the absence of Armenian journalists. He concluded that training in itself was always controversial as to the balance between academic and in-service training. There was no doubt that trainers needed skills and should therefore be included in support activities. More cooperation among journalists and media was in any case essential. Such

training was not cheap, especially for broadcast media, and European support should continue for some time.

Mr Huseynov was grateful for all the contributions to the seminar which would be taken into account in his report on this subject. Globalisation and the rapid technological development of electronic media required new skills and knowledge from journalists. Media and the free flow of information played a vital role for democratic society. Azerbaijan had been a member of the Council of Europe for nearly six years and had made great advances towards European standards. For the successful training of journalists, qualified teachers and motivated students were necessary as well as a common understanding of the subject matter.

Mr Seyidov was glad that this seminar had taken place at the Azerbaijan University of Languages and expressed the hope that it would be followed up by further training events.

List of participants

Members of the Sub-Committee on the Media

Mr Robert WALTER (Chairman), United Kingdom
Mr Igor CHERNYSHENKO, Russia
Mr Rafael HUSEYNOV, Azerbaijan
Mr Andrew McINTOSH, United Kingdom
Mr Aydin MIRZAZADA, Azerbaijan
Lord RUSSELL-JOHNSTON, United Kingdom
Mr Pär Axel SAHLBERG, Sweden
Mr Iñaki TXUEKA, Spain

Other parliamentarians

Mrs Elmira AKHUNDOVA, Azerbaijan
Mrs Gultakin HAJIYEVA, Azerbaijan
Mr Fazail IBRAHIMLI, Azerbaijan
Mr Oleg PANTELEEV, Russia
Mrs Ganira PASHAYEVA, Azerbaijan
Mr Samad SEYIDOV, Azerbaijan

Speakers

Mr Yalchin ALIZADA, Dean of the Faculty of Journalism of Baku State University
Mr Denis BRIBOSIA, Special Representative of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe in Baku
Mr Rashid HAJILI, Director, Media Law Institute, Azerbaijan
M. Ali HASANOV, Head, Public-Political Affairs Department, Office of the President of Azerbaijan
Mr Tony HOWSON, Project Team Manager, BBC World Service Trust
Mrs Vera ILLES, Programme Manager, Free Voice/The Management & Media Academy, Netherlands
Mr Wolfgang MAYER, Member, European Federation of Journalists and German Press Council
Mrs Maia MIKASHVIDZE, Dean, Caucasus School of Journalism and Media Management, Georgia
Mr Laurent PASSICOUSSET, CFPJ, France and European Journalism Training Association
Mr Vlodmyr RIZUN, Director of the Institute of Journalism, Taras Shevchenko National University, Kyiv

Other participants

Mr Aynur BASHIROVA, Instructor, Baku State University
Mr Yadigan MAMMADLI, Democratic Journalists League
Mr Veshapidre PAATA, Publisher, "24 Saati" (24 hours)
MrDavid PAITCHADZE, Director, The department of Journalism, Tbilisi State University, Deputy Dean, Tbilisi State University, Correspondent, Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty
Mr Ihor SLISSARENKO, News and Current Affairs Presenter, University lecturer, "Ukraina", Ukraine
Mrs Viktoriya SYAMAR, IMI, Ukraine

Journalists from Azerbaijan, Georgia and Ukraine
Teachers from Baku State University
Students from the Azerbaijan University of Languages in Baku

Azerbaijan Delegation Secretaries

Mr Ruslan ISMAYILOV
Mr Ilgar MAJIDLI

Secretariat of the Parliamentary Assembly

Mr Rüdiger DOSSOW, Co-Secretary to the Committee on Culture, Science and Education
Mrs Sandra KSSIS, Assistant, Committee on Culture, Science and Education

Reporting Committee: Committee on Culture, Science and Education

Reference to Committee: Doc. 10324, Reference No. 3014 of 23 November 2004

Draft Recommendation unanimously adopted by the Committee on 23 January 2007

Members of the Committee: Mr Jacques **Legendre** (Chairman) (Alternate: Mr. Philippe **Nachbar**), Baroness **Hooper**, Mr Wolfgang **Wodarg**, Mrs Anne **Brasseur**, (Vice-Chairpersons), Mr Hans Ager, Mr Toomas **Alatalu**, Mr. Kornél **Almássy**, Mr Lars Barfoed, Mr Rony **Bargetze**, Mrs Marie-Louise Bemelmans-Videc, Mr Levan Berdzenishvili, Mrs Oksana Bilozir, Mrs Maria Luisia Boccia (Alternate: Mr Stefano **Morselli**), Mrs Margherita **Boniver**, Mr Ioannis **Bougas** (Alternate: Mr Miltiadis **Varvitsiotis**), Mrs Cornelia Cazacu, Mr Osman **Coşkunoğlu**, Mr Vlad Cubreacov, Mr Ivica Dačić, Mrs Maria **Damanaki**, Mr Joseph Debono Grech (Alternate: Mr Joseph **Falzon**), Mr Stepan **Demirchyan**, Mr Ferdinand Devinski, Mrs Kaarina **Dromberg**, Mrs Åse Gunhild Woie **Duesund**, Mr Detlef **Dzembitzki**, Mrs Anke Eymer, Mr Relu Fenechiu, Mrs Blanca Fernández-Capel, Mrs Maria Emelina Fernández-Soriano, Mr Axel Fischer, Mr José Freire Antunes (Alternate: Mr José Luís **Arnaut**), Mrs Alena Gajdůšková, Mr Eamon Gilmore, Mr Stefan **Glävan**, Mr Luc Goutry, Mr Vladimir Grachev, Mr Andreas Gross, Mr Kristinn H. Gunnarsson, Mr Jean-Pol Henry, Mr Rafael **Huseynov**, Mr Fazail **Ibrahimli**, Mrs Halide **İncekara**, Mrs Evguenia Jivkova, Mr Morgan Johansson (Alternate: Mrs Lena **Hallengren**), Mr Ali Rashid **Khalil**, Mr Serhiy Klyuev, Mr József **Kozma**, Mr Jean-Pierre Kucheida, Mr Guy **Lengagne**, Mrs Jagoda Majska-Martinčević, Mr Tomasz **Markowski** (Alternate: Mr Zbigniew **Girzynski**), Mr Andrew McIntosh, Mr Ivan Melnikov, Mrs Maria Manuela **de Melo**, Mrs Assunta **Meloni**, Mr Paskal Milo, Mrs Christine Muttonen, Mrs Miroslava Němcová, Mr Edward **O'Hara** (Alternate: Mr Robert **Walter**), Mr Kent **Olsson**, Mr Andrey Pantev, Mrs Antigoni **Pericleous Papadopoulos**, Mr Azis **Pollozhani**, Mrs Majda **Potrata**, Mr Dušan Proroković, Mr Lluís Maria de Puig, Mr Johannes **Randegger**, Mr Zbigniew **Rau**, Mrs Anta Rugāte, Mr André **Schneider** (Alternate: Mr Jean Marie **Geveaux**), Mr Vitaliy Shybko (Alternate: Mrs Olha **Herasym'yuk**), Mrs Geraldine Smith (Alternate: Baroness **Knight of Collingtree**), Mrs Albertina Soliani (Alternate: Mr Massimo **Livi Bacci**), Mr Yury Solonin, Mr Christophe Spiliotis-Saquet, Mr Valeriy **Sudarenikov**, Mr Mehmet **Tekelioğlu**, Mr Ed van Thijn, Mr Piotr **Wach**, Mr Emanuelis Zingeris

N.B : The names of the members who took part in the meeting are printed in **bold**

Head of the Secretariat: Mr Grayson

Secretaries to the Committee: Mr Ary, Mr Dossow